WestminsterResearch

http://www.westminster.ac.uk/westminsterresearch

Public narratives and the construction of memory among European Muslims

Tsagarousianou, R.

Public narratives and the construction of memory among European Muslims

Roza Tsagarousianou

University of Westminster

Saima, a twenty-year-old Londoner of Pakistani origin, reflecting in the course of a group discussion on whether there is a place for her and other young fellow Muslims in contemporary European societies, expressed her dismay at the reluctance of public opinion to acknowledge European Muslims as equal stakeholders.

> I do not understand why[,] when people think of Islam, of Muslims, they only think of terrorism and misogynism. Muslims built Córdoba, Granada and so many other fabulous cities wherever they went. They made so many scientific discoveries, they lived peacefully with the Christian and Jewish inhabitants of the Caliphate. Why [do] Europeans forget this?

Interestingly, she articulated this reluctance in terms of forgetting. The presence of Muslim communities and of Islam in Europe is not new. Indeed, shortly after the establishment of the Muslim Caliphate, and the Muslim expansion of the eighth century, much of Europe lay under Muslim rule. Islam and the religious, philosophical, scientific and political innovations it fostered not only influenced but also became part of Europe, and the collective memory and consciousness of European societies. Vibrant Muslim communities and polities have known European territories as their homes for numerous generations, and have left their indelible mark in the landscape, culture and memory of European societies. More recently, migrant communities, part of a global and transnational Muslim diaspora, have settled in wWestern Europe and given the mantle to subsequent generations of European Muslims, including ~~not negligible~~ a far from insignificant numbers of converts.

Despite this undeniable presence of Islam and Muslims in Europe, the Muslim communities that live there, and the presence of Islam in this continent~~there~~ as a religious, cultural and, possibly, political force, have become the focus of attention only relatively recently. As Esposito points out, it is only 'in recent decades~~,~~ [that] Islam has gone from being invisible in America and Europe to being a prominent feature in the religious landscape' (2002: 2) and, I would add, in the continent's social topography. This visibility has been qualified in the sense that it has been partial and focused on particular representations of Islam. What is more, as Ballard

argues, Europe [has been is/constitutes? the product of a long process of suppressing the differences that separated the continent's quite diverse peoples, and accentuating, even institutionalizing, its [juxtaposition] contrast? to the Muslim populations and states that had emerged ~~in~~at its southern and eastern boundaries ~~in the South and East~~ (Ballard 1996: 20; also Sofos ~~&~~and Tsagarousianou 2013, especially chapter 1; Delanty 1995, 23-24; Neumann 1999). Europe, as a geopolitical concept, has been premised on the assumption that Muslims have always been "external" to it~~;~~: perpetual outsiders belonging to different civilizations, and symbolically "banished" to the continents of Africa and Asia. Ballard locates the start of this process at the time~~outset~~ of the Crusades~~;~~, an era~~time~~ when the then "unsuspecting" Europeans started defining themselves in [juxtaposition] to the non-Christian Muslim enemy, on the basis of their common Christianity and ~~the~~ sense of collective trauma that the relinquishing of the Holy Lands, as well as of territories that were traditionally seen as heartlands of Christendom in the emerging continent's ~~E~~East and ~~W~~West, [entailed. This set of narratives ~~of a clear~~ juxtaposition ~~between a Christian and a Muslim world~~, of Muslims being perpetual outsiders to an ahistorical and culturally unified Europe, [ignores~~/ds?~~ the historical presence for centuries of Muslim populations whose lives have contributed to shaping territories that today are considered to be "indisputably" European. It also [ignore~~ds/s?~~ the fact that medieval and early modern Muslims in Al-Andalus were not immigrants or invaders but indigenous willing converts, just as their Sicilian co-religionists who had invited the Muslim Aghlabid armies to put an end to the chronic corruption and maladministration of the Christian ~~é~~elites. In some way, then, the very substance of Europe is premised not only on a common religion, as Ballard very [~~aptly~~ reasonably /properly? suggests, but also on the cultivation of a widespread "forgetting" of the complexity of the relationship between Europe, Christianity and Islam, and of a corresponding memory of a strict, mutually exclusive relationship between Europe and the Islamic world.

Several centuries later, European societies, [~~again/still?~~ home to several million Muslims, migrants and converts alike, face questions and choices that have largely been shaped by the earlier encounter of Europe with Islam. [~~They~~ These societies ? [~~have/~~experience /feel a? need to define a Europe that clearly does not fit the conventional definitions premised on the notion of cultural homogeneity, and to determine the place Muslims have in it, given the historical cultural baggage inherent in the very definition of the continent as a geo-cultural entity. And, at the same time, Muslims building their lives in Europe have~~d~~ to engage, consciously or subconsciously, with the persistent narratives that posit them at the [antipodes ~~periphery?~~ of European identity [and or? banish them, just as [they] had their medieval predecessors, from the social [imaginary? of Europe. Being excluded from visualizations of modern European societies, [~~they~~ Muslims~~s?~~ try to find ways of (re)establishing themselves in this [imaginary~~,?~~; or rather, of constructing a sense of belonging that counters the organized amnesia which~~that~~ often renders them incompatible and undesirable and makes them feel rootless and dejected. Their sense of exclusion and inability to identify with the dominant symbols and ideology in the societies they call home has contributed to the development of alternative strategies of memory and commemoration.

~~This~~The purpose of this chapter is ~~intended~~ to explore some key aspects of the politics of memory that form an inextricable component of European Muslim self-definitions, discourses and narratives deployed in ~~their~~the attempt to negotiate their

Comment [M1]: See this word's definition

Comment [M2]: See above comment

Comment [M3]: Overlong sentences best avoided

Comment [M4]: The narratives?

inclusion in European societies. To this end, I draw on group and individual interviews with 735 European Muslims.[1] Although my~~our?~~ sample is not statistically representative of Europe's Muslim population, I think that the broad spectrum of opinion can allow us to identify trends that are ~~[developing~~ evolving~~].?~~ ~~Out of~~ From a total of 735 informants, 149 articulated definitions of being Muslim that emphasized 'culture', values, 'ways of doing things' in a way that echoes Dasetto's designation of part of Europe's population as 'cultural Muslims'. A further 82 ~~have~~ ~~[opted for~~ chose~~?~~ what I ~~could~~would describe as a secular, 'political' definition~~;~~, that is, ~~have~~ described themselves and other Muslims as a primarily or exclusively racialized category, as victims of racism and ~~i~~Islamophobia, but also as subjected to socioeconomic and political. Nevertheless, a not insignificant proportion of these ~~would~~ value~~d~~ Islam as a religion and, indeed, ~~they would~~ consider~~ed~~ themselves religious, albeit in ways that do not always meet the criteria set by Sander and others that are premised on mosque membership and religious attendance. The fact remains that such definitions of religiosity are rather prescriptive and rigid, and thus are ~~incapable~~unhelpful~~?~~ to ~~grasping/~~understanding~~?~~ the changing nature of Islam in general, and European Islam and Muslims in particular.

Comment [M5]: Or "evolving/developing tendencies."?

Comment [M6]: "political" what?

Drawing upon Sander's distinction between *ethnic*, *cultural*, *religious* and *political* definitions of being Muslim, this research therefore resorted to the use of multiple sampling frames relevant to these dimensions of experience. It did so by identifying a number of 'starting points' that could provide access to diverse fields of practice and interaction and enable the compilation of a broad and diverse sample that would reflect the polyphonic universe of European Islam. Th~~is~~ese included mosques, prayer halls, religious associations, community centres with links or affiliations to countries or ethnic groups where Islam is practis~~e~~ed (including many that exclude Islam from their names or self-definitions), youth centres and projects in areas of high Muslim population concentration or in culturally diverse areas with substantial Muslim minorities, and~~or~~ organizations and initiatives against ~~i~~Islamophobia or racism. Potential informants were also located among students enrolled at universit~~ie~~sy and college~~s~~, ~~Students~~ with the help of student organizations that put us in touch with members whose~~with~~ surnames ~~that~~ are commonly found in countries where Islam is ~~practiced~~practised, or through visits to student societies

Comment [M7]: Again: Avoid overlong sentences

---

[1] In total, 390 men and 345 women between the ages of 16 and 45 ~~years,~~ who described themselves as Muslim or of Muslim background were interviewed. Of these interviewees, the majority (595) were residents or citizens of Belgium (90), France (130), Germany (115), the Netherlands (90), and the UK (170). A further 145 interviews were conducted online with interviewees from other European countries~~;~~, notably, Italy (20), Spain (15), Denmark (22), Norway (16), Sweden (22), Switzerland (20) and Austria (25). The data collection was conducted in the context of a research project on European Muslim Identities, some of the findings of which were eventually published in Sofos &~~and~~ Tsagarousianou (2013)~~;~~,however, ~~but~~ the analysis that follows is my own.

The discussions mainly took ~~mainly~~ the form of group interviews (or focus groups) and a small number of individual interviews. The sampling design was intended to avoid replicating preset definitions of what it means to be a 'European Muslim', and to reflect and 'capture' instead the polysemy of the terms Islam and Muslim and the diverse experiences and practices that comprise Islam in Europe, using a combination of non-probability sampling techniques that had the potential of better capturing the internal diversity of experience and opinion this paper has intended to chart and analy~~ze~~se.~~ze.~~

with interests in Islam or in the regions where Islam is widely practicedpractised. widely. The population sample that [ensued/resulted?, although not necessarily statistically representative of the Muslim population in the areas covered, was considerably diverse in terms of ethnicity, provenance geographical origins?, and socioeconomic backgrounds, but also in terms of the intensity of religious belief and practice. What is more, [it made it this method made it? possible to access individuals that more traditional sample framing methods were likely to overlook, as they did not necessarily 'fit' into established or widely-held research preconceptions as to who is a Muslim and who is not.

The interviews covered a variety of themes, includingsuch as definitions of terms such as "home", "Islam", "Muslim";,as well as the exploration of respondents'their religious feeling and attendance (or lack thereof) at mosques?, the importance of religion, experiences of discrimination, political engagement, media and cultural practices, extending further toas well as family, relationships, concerns and aspirations. Although "memory" did not feature explicitly in the discussions, it clearly constituted a significant element in the discourses of interviewees about themselves and others. Memory, in these instances, took various different forms in connection toof engaging with and relating to the past.

Historical memory

Interviewees, for [example], drew upon, and reproduced historical "memory", premised on historical narratives reconstructing, for instance, the times of the Caliphate ,and its cultural and scientific achievements, just as exemplified by the (Salma) did inquotation at the beginning of this chapter.

Similarly, Hussein, a twenty-five- year-old shopkeeper from Amsterdam, talked about the openness of Islamic societies at the time of the Reconquista in Spain.

> When Spain kicked out all these thousands of Muslims and Jews, who accepted them with open arms? Who gave them land to build new lives? Not Christian Europe!

Or Maryam, a thirty-year-old teacher from Belgium, emphasizedstressed the splendour of Islamic civilization in Spain.

> When you visit the Muslim cities of Spain, you can hardly ignore the fact that there flourished a civilization with a sense of beauty and advanced technological knowledge.

This historical "memory" is clearly constructed, maintained and mediated through a number of institutions and practices. Some of these are focused onto the production of history/histories of Islam, while others are much more diffuse in terms of focus. So, mMosques and various other Islamic institutions provide lectures and seminars for younger and older audiences alike that directly focus on the construction and propagation of a [history? of Islam, from the early years of the Prophet Muhammad to more recent times. In addition, there is now a whole array of Muslim media (especially multimedia packages [or? recorded sound and imageaudio-visual material available on CDs and DVDs as well as games) that contain narratives or, in

the case of games, ~~game [plots~~ activities designed to? ~~that~~virtually reconstruct the time of the Prophet Muhammad, or daily life in the Caliphate or life in Muslim Spain.[2]

Historical memory is also reproduced via the medium of material culture, through the construction and circulation of particular artefacts and commodities. The latter type of dissemination of this memory is evident in the various products (~~t~~T-shirts, caps and bags) ~~that~~ featur~~ing~~e slogans about the reinstitution of the Caliphate that are popular among some young Muslims. ~~In addition,~~To this can be added the increasing ~~in~~ popularity of "historical" tourism packages to "Muslim Spain", "Ottoman Istanbul" and the Middle East, specifically tailored for European Muslims, which are part and parcel of this propagation of "memory" of an Islamic past to which Europe's Muslims can look for inspiration or self-validation.

~~[Such~~ So great? seems to be the need for "remembering" the distant past that one can encounter instances of appropriation and domestication of resources and commodities that may have proved controversial in the past. Such is the case of ~~DVDs featuring~~ Moustapha Akkad's feature film *The Message*, a quite unusual biopic of the Prophet Muhammad.[3] A Hollywood production, eventually funded by Muammar Gaddafi, as other Middle Eastern financiers ~~backers~~ disavowed it, with leading roles played by Anthony Quinn, John Gielgud and Irene Pappas, the film~~movie~~ was one of the most controversial ~~films~~ of the '70s.~~;~~ ~~a~~Ahead of its US premiere, unfounded rumours that Quinn was starring as Muhammad were enough to prompt, in March 1977, 12 members of the *Black Muslims* organi~~z~~sation to storm three buildings in Washington DC, taking 149 people hostage and demanding that the film be destroyed. The siege resulted in the deaths of a police officer and a radio reporter. Future Washington~~DC~~ mayor Marion Barry was also wounded by a shotgun ~~bullet~~pellet. The hostages were eventually released after a 39-hour stand-off. The film's world premiere in London in July~~,~~ 1976 was preceded by intense debate, with various groups calling the film "sacrilegious" and "an insult to Islam", while the film had a mixed ~~fate~~reception in the Muslim world. ~~as i~~It was banned in many Arab countries.

However, three decades later, the very same film (now in DVD format) was available – indeed, prominently displayed~~featured~~ in the windows ~~–~~ at~~in~~ Muslim bookshops in London's Whitechapel area, just a few hundred yards from the East London mosque;~~,~~ and moreover at~~as well as in~~ Islamic bookshops in Amsterdam,

---

[2] Some of this material is very carefully and sensitively designed and, therefore, very effective in the transmission of historical information;. ~~F~~for example,~~—~~real-time, strategy games such as *Quraish* (released in 2005 by Syrian *Akar Media*), which takes place in pre-Islamic and early Islamic periods and deals with the origin and spread of Islam. Players are situated in virtual simulations of the time and, in the process, learn about pre-Islamic, Arab culture and early Islamic history, and the broader geographical, social, and economic processes determining the historical spread of Islam. *Arabian Lords* (*Sadat al-sahra'*), a real-time strategy game developed in 2007 by U~~S.S.~~ *BreakAway Games* and the Jordanian studio *Quirkat,* similarly immerses the players into a carefully reconstructed medieval Arab world and provides information on the period.

[3] Directed in 1976 by the late Moustapha Akkad, *The Message*, in accordance with Muslim conventions forbidding any visual depiction of the ~~p~~Prophet, ~~stayed clear of depicting him~~ omitted this. Instead, Akkad decided ~~[H/~~his? presence was to be signified by~~with~~ light organ music. The director~~; he~~ also occasionally framed the film from the ~~p~~Prophet's point of view as ~~[H/~~he? observed the actions of his followers.

Copenhagen and Malmö. The response of the shop owners to the obvious question of how this film's turbulent and controversial history had a non-detrimental effect on its reception by themselves and their customers' evaluation of the film was very simple: Muslim parents desperately needed positive role models and ways of narrating the early Islamic era that would be captivating and interesting to their children. In this context — of a need to provide important stimuli for Muslim children "to learn about the past" — Hollywood's only film that dealt with the early Islamic era was "rehabilitated" and acquired a new social life through its relocalization and consumption.

As Arjun Appadurai points out in his introduction to the edited volume *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (1986), the status of an object, or the value of a commodity, can change over time depending on combinations of politics, and ecologies of social interaction and desire. It could be argued in this case that the combination of the political situation and imperative of the local Muslim community's cultural reproduction prompted a reinterpretation of the film, and invested it with new value and status. The need of European Muslim parents to find ways to preserve a vivid "memory" of the history of the time and life of the Prophet Muhammad in this instance should be situated in the context of the current Islamophobic European discourses, in the context of which it becomes intelligible. Such processes of domestication are clearly instrumental, not only in creating a space for the reproduction of historical "memory", but also in overcoming under-representation, exclusion, alienation, and investing everyday spaces with meaning.

More generally, although this historical "memory" — (re)produced through classes, lectures, the media, historical tourism and aspects of material culture — is temporally remote and, for many of the project respondents, constitutes just an abstract and imprecise body of "recollections", it is, nevertheless, embraced passionately and used in attempts either to validate the settlement of Muslim communities in Europe, or to refute discourses that posit Islam as a backward and primitive religion and Muslim cultures as archaic and partial.

Comment [M10]: And, again, overlong…

Collective memory

Another type of memory that emerges from the data collected and analysed takes the form of "individual" or collective reminiscences of the not-so-remote past. Although the majority of narratives in this case appear to be "individual" properties of respondents, it should be pointed out that these are the product of intersubjective exchange, discussion and negotiation. This is by no means a unique feature of the data collected; as one of the founding fathers of the study of collective memory, Maurice Halbwachs, suggests: "the framework of collective memory confines and binds our most intimate remembrances to each other. It is not necessary that the group be familiar with them" (1992: 53). In other words, individual memories do not exist in isolation but take shape and acquire meaning within broader social contexts. Individual recollection consists effectively of what Charles Taylor calls ontological narratives (Taylor 1989); that is, the stories that social actors use to make sense of their lives and develop strategies of action. Ontological narratives are, above all, social and interpersonal; they draw upon what Taylor calls "webs of interlocution", or what others call "traditions" (Somers 1994: 618), in terms of the raw material and the cultural codes they incorporate.

Page | 6

[On the other hand, collective memory relates to what Taylor calls "public narratives";, that is, narratives attached to cultural and institutional formations larger than the single individual;, to intersubjective networks or institutions – ,from families, to workplaces, communities or nations. According to Taylor (1989), it is not only ontological narratives that depend on public ones; public narratives, too, draw upon the former in order to generate raw material for the construction of a sense of "we"." [It is in this intersection /juncture? of the personal and the public, of ontological and public narratives, that I would situate the memories that respondents, and, by extension, all/European? Muslims, generate in order to root themselves in their local environment and produce claims to local space, and to positioning themselves vis-à-vis a vis Europe and the societies in the midst of which they live.?]

The first set of narratives I will be focusing on have a strong local dimension, and constitute means of "making space" (Metcalfe 1992) and investing that space with what I would call "temporal depth". When asked what place they would call home, about two- thirds of the respondents opted for their locality, although the extent of this varied considerably, ranging from their neighbourhood, to their city and, occasionally, their region. Indeed, the boundaries of home were often intermixed in their responses in a variety of ways. In larger, more impersonal, cities, or in areas where the urban space is fragmented or city life segregated, such as Paris and East London, the neighbourhood was more often than not seen as a place of safety, solidarity and intimacy.

Many younger, mainly male, informants, saw their neighbourhoods in terms of a safe "territory", where friends – brothers (and in the case of women, sisters) was often the word used – couldcan "hang out" together, away from the rest of the urban space which they often describe as inimical and unsafe. This construction of geographies of safety and danger was often supported by recollections of events that reinforced such boundaries in the urban space.

Speaking of how he felt whenever he venturinged outside his neighbourhood in the north-east of Paris, nineteen-year-old Hassan, says [characteristically: typically?:

> [In other parts of Paris] you feel out of place. I think everyone is looking at me, telling me with their eyes I do not belong. … I have been stopped so many times by the police … routine they always say but I know too well they are telling me and people like me that we do not belong.

Hassan's recollections of being stopped by the police in his account are transformed into reminders that he is out of place, indicators of exclusion and marginalization. Throughout his reflections, Hassan, clearly identifies himself and his friends as "Muslims"; as does Ali, a seventeen-year-old eEast Londoner from Whitechapel, who distinguishes his neighbourhood from other parts of London which he considers dangerous.

> You hear about people being knifed all the time. … I grew up hearing about this … countless stories; I even knew a couple of people who managed to run away to safety. Racists are always trying to find you where you are alone, away from home. You know, here you can count on your brothers. They will stand next to you if they [racist attackers] come. They will think twice because they know us … they know that we look out for our Muslim brothers.

Ali draws on his and others' recollections of racist violence – or, more precisely, the recollections of others as he grew up hearing about these -- in order to build this

topography of fear and danger as well as of solidarity. Interestingly, his account intermixes Islamophobia with racism, and implicitly forwards not a religious, but an 'ethnicized' understanding of Islam. Anwar, [also sixteen years old and from East London, makes a point about the violent and dangerous character of places where the help of Muslim friends cannot be relied on.

> So many people I know have been attacked and stabbed. It is dangerous in the street, and it is good to know your mates are there for you; and you do not go beyond that … You simply don't.

Samira, a nineteen-year-old Belgian woman, recounts living in her Antwerp, predominantly Muslim neighbourhood and her venturing outside it somewhat differently, as her experience is [inflected? by the way she sees herself as a young Muslim woman.

> I remember when my mother and I had to travel to see my aunt and cousins in Ghent. It was strange as I could immediately see that people would stare at us as if we were a curiosity. Many times women would whisper while staring, sometimes people would cast angry looks. This made me feel strange, uncomfortable … Only when I became older and got more directly engaged with racism did I understand why people could not resist showing their disapproval of the fact that we were dressed differently, that we were covering our heads, that we were there … You did not feel that at all in the old neighbourhood, where we lived a happy and carefree childhood ….

Samira, aA college student whothat covers her head and dresses in ways consistent with her sense of modesty derived from being a Muslim, Samira recounts her childhood memories of safety and comfort in her Antwerp neighbourhood, and [juxtaposes contrasts? these withto her recollections of venturing to inimical places outside it, where she remembers being exposed to what she perceived experienced as unkind and often aggressive scrutiny because she was perceived as different.

Sa'ida and Nadia, both twenty- five years old,and from Amsterdam, recount a story from their childhood years, when three young people who were attacked – and one of them injured – after venturing into the "wrong" neighbourhood. They remember the public outcry and the concern that prevailed in the discussions that adults had. And, interestingly, each one of them fills the gaps in the other's story, demonstrating the intersubjective character of the construction of these memories.

> Sa'ida: I was fifteen, I think, when this happened.
>
> Nadia: Maybe younger.
>
> Sa'ida: Yes, you are right.
>
> Nadia: I remember, because my brother was the same age as they.
>
> Sa'ida: Our parents were clearly concerned and everybody was talking about this. They tried not to talk in front of us but we all knew.
>
> Nadia: Yes. We heard all about it [by from? older kids at school.
>
> Sa'ida: What a horrible thing. Mehmet, the Turkish boy who lived just round the corner from us, was badly hurt.
>
> Nadia: I saw his face days after I had heard about it and it was unrecognizsable.

Such accounts are not uncommon. Many respondents seemed to have similar recollections and experiences of their own neighbourhoods being places of comfort and safety. These memories may have arisen from their own direct experience (as in the cases of Hassan and Samira, above) but may also have been the product of recollections of friends, neighbours or, sometimes, rumours (as some of the recollections of Ali indicate).

Such memories are instrumental in building a sense of community, as they provide crucial elements of a narrative web that posits the local Muslim community as a welcoming place where they do not have to endure unwelcome visibility, public scrutiny and, on occasion, aggression. Younger (primarily male) informants rely on theirs and others' recollections to set boundaries and to define their locality as their "home turf"; a place where they can, collectively and individually, assess, control and manage risk. Indeed, fieldwork material reveals aspects of particular geographies of locality that make sense to, and are evoked by, many Muslims, whose topographies contain objects or places that are familiar and relevant to 'being Muslim'. These comprise, inter alia, mosques, community centres, shops, schools, other loci of collective action and sharing, local media, and the 'soundscapes' all of these generate and sustain, to use a term that Hirschkind developed in his study of Muslim [counterpublics Sic? in Cairo (2006). These geographies are not necessarily ones of concrete landmarks, but incorporate personal, family and community narratives bonded to the locality in question, as the above interview excerpts indicate. This is not novel, as a number of studies on youth (including ? Shildrick 2006; Peterson 2011) that have focused on structural factors of youth cultures, including neighbourhood residence, suggest that locality can be very influential in shaping the cultural identities and experiences of young people. But, beyond youth solidarities and subcultures, such recollections create a common stock of experience; what, following Ryan and Gamson (2006), I term common experiential and, even more so, injustice frames. The notion of frames derives from symbolic interactionism. In that theoretical context, frames evolve from collective efforts to make sense of problems; they help people "locate, perceive, identify, and label" their experience (Goffman 1974: 21). In social action research, frames are the outcome [product of symbolic and cultural production ? of political actors. According to Gamson (1995), a major proponent of the constructionist approach to framing, political actors actively construct their self-presentations so as to draw support from others. The concept of "frame", therefore, refers to cognitive processes through which people utilize background knowledge to interpret an event or circumstance and to locate it in a larger system of meaning. Framing processes are therefore means through which actors invoke one frame or set of meanings rather than another when they communicate a message, thereby indicating how the message is to be understood. In the case of the Muslim communities in question, remembering such events or situations is essential in the development and reproduction of community cultures and identities, [it ensuring that the various ontological narratives that emanate from daily life are integrated into the public narratives generated by community institutions.?

What is pertinent in the case of the young informants discussed above, is the association of their memories of safety and comfort with 'being amongst other Muslims'. To return to Ali's response regarding his neighbourhood, he continuously reminds us that his "brothers" are Muslim and that this "Muslimness" is the crucial element upon which trust is built. To be [fair, Ali does recognize that his locality is

Comment [M14]: Value-laden

mixed in terms of ethnicities and religions, and does suggest that many people he likes and trusts in his everyday encounters are non-Muslim; but still, he stresses that he trusts his friends because "they are Muslim". The neighbourhood is, therefore, partly constructed through remembering it as a terrain that is known, welcoming, and representing a set of relationships of mutuality and support, of feeling safe — associated with "being Muslim" — and, if necessary, of coming together in a moment of need or of danger.

Until the early 1970s, Europe's urban spaces were culturally alien to their Muslim residents, as the majority of Muslim migrants did not see Europe as a new permanent home. The collective dimension of Islam, therefore, was initially confined to personal spaces of private homes, collective immigrant residences, furnished hotel rooms, and shop storerooms. rooms. [In view of this lack of a "proper" Muslim space, for many informants, the recognition of their neighbourhood or of their city as "home", is the product of what Barbara Daly Metcalfe has described as mMaking Muslim sSpace (1996) — of "populating" the localities concerned with familiar markers of their presence, of "spatializing" with their "footsteps", as De Certeau suggests when discussing the process of kinesthetic appropriation of space (1986: 97). [Indeed, the respondents' discourses reveal aspects of particular geographies of locality that make sense to, and are evoked by many Muslims, whose topographies contain objects or places that are memorable, familiar and relevant to "being Muslim", such as mosques, community centres, shops, schools, other loci of collective action and sharing, local media, and the "soundscapes" all of these generate and sustain, to use a term that Hirschkind developed in his study of Muslim counterpublics in Cairo (2006).] [These geographies are not necessarily ones/geographies of concrete landmarks, but incorporate personal, family and community narratives and memories bonded to the locality in question.

[Characteristically In common with others?, Mehmet, a thirty-nine-year- old Hackney resident of nine years, born in Turkey, [recalled/recounted? with athe sense of accomplishment the time whentimes that the Turkish community was less established in thishis part of London, contrastingand compared that earlier topography of Hackney with what we could call a Muslim topography of the borough today. His account relied on his and others' memories of Hackney at the time when the first Turkish migrants arrived and settled. He used vividly describedptions of a place that seemed devoid of any relevance and meaning to most of the first Turkish residents, and he recalleddescribed the difficulties they had in communicating in English and representing their interests and aspirations; the arduous process of establishing small basement prayer- cum- community rooms, and — eventually graduating to grander designs — of establishing community centres, and then, eventually, mosques. Mehmet's reminiscences were complemented with a list of the mosques that have been built over the years — embellished with stories about the materials used, the way decisions were made about these, the importance of their visibility in the urban landscape, their openness to all Muslims — the religious classes and schools, the community advocacy centres, the new halal shops and restaurants, and the various Islamic bookshops that can be found in the area nowadays. What was of particular importance in his discourse was a story about the debates onof whether the designplans for a local mosque should incorporate a minaret or not:;

> Those who were against [the minaret] did not understand that the community wanted their mosque not to be hidden away but to let people know that we are here too. This is very important … to drive by and see a mosque that people built as a mark of their faith …

But, perhaps more importantly, his narrative contains a story that links a past of marginalization, of aporia and invisibility, with a present of accomplishment and increased visibility. Others, too, emphasize similar tortuous, yet rewarding, routes from invisibility to finally being able to recognize their Muslim identity in the local urban landscape. Azedinne, a thirty-three-year old from Belgium, expresses his dismay and anger at the various political, bureaucratic and societal obstacles he and other Muslims in his own town have had to confront and negotiate in order to get permission to build a "proper" mosque that, in his opinion, [constitutes?] a need of the Muslim community and a recognition of its presence there.

> It is unbelievable that we had to struggle so much … to argue for our right to have a "proper" mosque in a town where Muslims are so many. We will in the end overcome their objections and even build a minaret! We live here too.

The majority of our informants had stories of progressively gaining "ownership" or becoming "stakeholders" in a number of local institutions which eventually became part of the narrative fabric that makes up local European Muslim geographies. Naaz, twenty- nine years old and from Belgium, reflects on the local struggle, some fifteen years ago, to ensure that her local secondary school became more flexible, as far as allowing Muslim girls to have an input in the school dress code was concerned:

> It was a long struggle. I felt at times that this was not my school, it couldn't be because it did not accept me as I was. And when our voice was finally heard[,] we felt that this was our school too, that this was our town as well.

Similar memories of localized mobilizations, narratives of a collective achievement, from supporting friends in the face of racist violence, to campaigning for a mosque or for greater tolerance in a local school, or for achieving over time appropriate care for Muslim elderly people, are prevalent in the discourses of our informants. These can, [among others,?] be seen as memories of collective endeavours and of community accomplishment. Such talk sometimes takes the form of a rhetoric of "local patriotism", emphasizing or recounting community achievements, investing local space with emotion and agency, but also *situating the community in memory*.

Locality, in this context of the construction of collective memories, is not merely a physical space but also a highly symbolic and often mediated domain of social action that, at least at first sight, is characterised by face- to- face interaction, and a degree of familiarity that comes with it. What is more, it is a space that has an important, inherent temporal dimension; [one it; it is] largely constructed from [?] these memories of "making place", of overcoming adversity, of coming together in times of danger. In the context of European cities[,?] where secularism has not eradicated the visual elements of a long Christian tradition but tends to look with suspicion on any further markers of religious identification, this dimension of locality is becoming more important. An eloquent example of this non-physical, mediated character of local Muslim geographies, and of the role of collective memory in their building, is the case of London's Ramadan Radio; a local, [short-range?] broadcasting station, which

used to operate every year during the month of Ramadan in the borough of Tower Hamlets, and which was much appreciated by many of our local Muslim interviewees. Ramadan Radio represented a long-gone component in the life of the local Muslim community, but memories of its impact have outlived its brief presence.

Shabina, a twenty-three-year-old woman of mixed Pakistani and Bangladeshi origin, reflects on how this station, in many ways, provided a narrative thread, a sense of intimacy, in the construction of a cohesive locality and community.

> Ramadan Radio was much nicer [than other radio stations] to listen to. It offered you the opportunity to feel you are a member of a community. For one, you listened to people you knew personally. You heard their voice on the radio[,] and then when you rang them at home[,] you used to say[:] "I heard you on the radio[,] you know"...

Zaynab, a devout forty-three-year-old housewife attending a women's group meeting at the East London mosque, adds rather nostalgically to the overall [perception] of the decisive contribution the station made in creating a soundscape that "populated" the urban landscape.

> Yes[,] and you could listen to programmes from the local hospital, and you know the people who work there too ... . And then it was the prayers ... there was something for everyone.

Generally, the memories associated with Ramadan Radio among its listeners were imbued with a sense of intimacy. As I have suggested elsewhere (2008), Ramadan Radio operated at what we could call the 'intimate' level, as it was a very local medium [aware of] the needs related to the intimate realm of religion, and rooted in the everyday life of a relatively small local community. In other words, Ramadan Radio has become ingrained in the collective memory of the local Muslim community and become part of the symbolic landscape of the locality —, a virtual presence, despite its absence, with a very tangible impact on community life. What is more, during its operation, the station was part of the local urban soundscape; in fact, a welcome addition to what many local Muslims – primarily the more devout ones -- considered to be an alien soundscape devoid of the sounds that could have made it relevant to their daily lives. The idealised way of remembering Ramadan Radio's contribution to community life, just as remembering the warmth of community in all the previous cases we encountered, might conceivably not constitute a memory of a bygone past but a vision of a desired future; it might be a projection of a utopia, of what the Muslim communities in question might want to achieve; a place of equality, solidarity and safety.

Postmemory: "Remembering" the experiences of other Muslims

Most of our informants recounted stories of other Muslims from remote localities and, more importantly, with very few exceptions, not located in their own [countries of origin. This latter set of narratives are, as I will show, primarily translocal, and establish affinities with the histories/stories of significant, remote others. Although these narratives are not the product of the [experience/s?] of those who "remember" them, they nevertheless occupy a significant place in the shared stock of memory of Muslims in Europe, and are frequently evoked and mobilized in tandem with other

Comment [M17]: Or do you mean adopted countries?

narratives generated from the context of their everyday life. They, in some way, constitute a type of "postmemory"; that is, a memory that consists of the adoption of the traumatic experiences – and thus also the memories – of others as one's own, or more precisely, as experiences one might oneself have had, and of inscribing them into one's own life story. (Hirsch 1999: 8-9; also Hirsch and Smith 2002)

One such example of "postmemory" relates to "adoption" of the sense of injustice experienced by French youth residing in the *banlieues* of major French cities by other European Muslims. A Pew Global Attitudes Survey (2006) found that awareness of the 2005 riots in the *banlieues* was relatively high among other European Muslims. The findings from discussions with our interviewees corroborated this. However, they went a step further, by providing insights into how this sympathy has been translated into vivid and durable memories. Over half of our non-French interviewees, when prompted to discuss issues of societal fairness and injustice affecting them, added to their lists of injustices directly experienced by them the inequalities and prejudice that had prompted their French counterparts to riot. Even more respondents mentioned in the same context the Mohammed cartoons published in the Danish newspaper *Jyllands-Posten* on 30 September 2005, as well as earlier debates about *hijab* bans in schools and workplaces. Similarly, discussions about local acceptance or rejection of plans to build mosques or community centres almost invariably revealed that our interviewees were quite aware of similar debates and conflicts in other parts of Europe. It soon became obvious that although our interviewees' nationalities and countries of residence, their ethnic or cultural differences, diverse occupational patterns, educational attainment and age may have given rise to markedly different experiences and diverse perceptions of discrimination and exclusion among this minority, the spatial and social segregation and unemployment experienced by French Muslims, the intense racism felt by many of our Belgian and Dutch informants, are subsumed to an overarching perception of injustice. They considered these different experiences as part and parcel of their own history and recollection of instances of injustice. In other words, through a translocal lens (and here the media they accessed played an important role), they perceived their distinct local experiences as part of a broader stock of collective (European Muslim) memory.

The raw material for the construction of this memory of injustice is, however, by no means derived from Europe alone. Discussions and interviews revealed a quite widespread sensitivity to suffering in countries where Islam is practised by the majority or large minorities of the population. Some of the most notable cases in this respect are Palestine, which was mentioned in highly emotional terms by an overwhelming majority of the people we talked to, closely followed by Iraq and Afghanistan, where Western countries have intervened militarily. To these can be added Chechnya, which has been subjected to several Russian military campaigns, Kashmir, whose territory is bitterly disputed by both Pakistan and India, and Bosnia, the site of a bitter military confrontation between Serbs, Croats and Muslims as Yugoslavia disintegrated in the 1990s, and whose Muslim population was subjected to ruthless ethnic cleansing. Indeed, the plight of Bosnian Muslims has been a seminal moment, a key traumatic memory that intensified feelings of Muslim solidarity for many of the older people who talked to me. Magdi, a thirty-seven-year-old

paramedic from Belgium, has vivid memories of the news coming from Bosnia through his television screen.

> It is hard to forget the suffering of those people. I remember not bearing to watch the news. And I will never forgive the inaction of the world as a [whole. ~~p~~People [were]?~~was~~ being subjected to genocide just because they were Muslim. Just because they [their Christian neighbours] decided they did not have the right to be there. I was not, until then, particularly concerned about religion –- my father was not that religious anyway –- but I thought that this was the moment. That this is some sort of revelation, telling me that others are ready to die and they pay the price for being Muslim.

Asad, a forty-eight- year-old West Londoner, an~~d~~ Islamic charity campaigner who had ~~previously~~ been a left-wing activist prior to the Bosnian conflict, also discussed~~recounts~~ the war and how he abandoned his engagement with ~~l~~Left politics:

> How could they [~~w~~Western governments] turn a blind eye to what was happening?~~.~~ And how could the media present their [Muslims] slaughter day in and day out?~~.~~ We would wait for the news, we would try to find a channel that would say it –- that this was a genocide. As we could not stand the apathy around us, we decided to link up with others and start collections for our brothers and sisters. Cash, blankets, medicines, food ... A friend volunteered to drive the stuff[,] but at the end the mosque was better networked and arranged its transportation. Bosnia had a profound effect on me, my priorities ...

Empathy with ~~other~~ fellow Muslims in such cases has a transformative effect, sometimes as dramatic as that described in Magdi's and Asad's accounts, sometimes subtler and more incremental.

This remembering of injustice makes possible the imagination of a "we";~~,~~ of all those who, as we have seen earlier, adopt and build this body of postmemory. ==This mobilization of what is remembered is crucial to setting in motion processes of "reinterpreting the past, narrating new foundations" (Hale 1998: 6), effectively instituting, reconstituting or reconfiguring a collective identity through collective representation, as a way of repairing the tear in the social fabric.==

The~~This~~ collective sense of injustice, and the "cultural trauma" that it entails, draw~~s~~ together the "multiplex strands of violence, risk and threat afflicting people's everyday lives" (Bowman 2003: 319-20), to mobili~~z~~se those who perceive themselves as affected. ==~~This mobilization is crucial to setting in motion processes of "reinterpreting the past, narrating new foundations" (Hale 1998: 6), effectively instituting, reconstituting or reconfiguring a collective identity through collective representation, as a way of repairing the tear in the social fabric caused by "injustice" and "inequity".~~== This construction of what Alexander, in his discussion of the notion of cultural trauma, calls the "trauma process" –, that is, a crisis of meaning and identity that prompts the (re)articulation of a group's self-definition (Alexander et al. 2001) – always engages a "meaning struggle", a grappling with events that [involve~~s?~~ identifying the "nature of the pain, the nature of the victim and the attribution of responsibility" (ibid.). European Muslims identify~~associate themselves~~ with the traumatic memory of the experience of others; primarily through various media, but also through the way in which these experiences and memories are constructed by

actors such as the various Muslim associations, mosques, and the Muslim and non-Muslim charity sectors.[4] Needless to say, ~~that~~ this mass-mediated experience and memory always [~~involves~~ entails? selective construction. Eyerman (1994) argues that, in such situations, the interests and desires of the affected are articulated and represented by intellectuals, in the term's widest sense. Indeed, there is no doubt that in the case of the construction of cultural trauma among European Muslims, ~~that~~ this memory of a profound injustice is often propagated by institutions and individuals who, either drawing their authority from institutional association or public following, have the symbolic power to articulate it. On the other hand, it is also clear that "ordinary" Muslims are increasingly playing a more active role in such processes. This is largely due to the "democrati~~zing"sing"~~ impact of the technologies they utili~~zse~~ in their search for~~of~~ news, or [information about "others like them" as the use of the internet but of other media of time-space distantiation ~~are~~ is seamlessly integrated into the lives of most ~~of our~~ informants?; ~~t~~They have for the most part demonstrated not only familiarity with media technologies, but also the ability to skilfully navigate the rich mediascape available to them (Sofos &~~and~~ Tsagarousianou 2013).

There are ample indications that the construction of a Muslim identity drawing on a sense of trauma is well underway and is proving to be enduring. Clues to its durability are provided by Neal's analysis of "national trauma" (1998) – a concept closely related to that of "cultural trauma". Neal refers to its "enduring effects", as it relates to events "which cannot be easily dismissed, which will be played over again and again in individual consciousness," and which, with the passage of time, become "ingrained in collective memory." In the case of our informants, the mediated postmemory of suffering and discrimination becomes the subject of reflection, discussion and emotional investment. They~~Our informants~~ described how such news become~~s~~ the [focus of collective endeavours of search,] of discovery, of anxiety and, eventually, of exchange and discussion. Peer groups, in the context of face- to- face daily interaction, but also in virtual space, often constitute a [space ~~forum?~~ for such exchanges, as do more formal settings, such as the mosque, the community associations, the university or college. It is in these spaces that the notion of injustice but also those of agency and identity (Gamson 1995) are understood, explained, and made coherent through the means of public reflection and discourse. As Smelser (in Alexander et al. 2001) suggests, "cultural trauma" constitutes "a memory accepted and publicly given credence by a relevant membership group and evoking an event or situation which is (a) laden with negative affect, (b) represented as indelible, and (c) regarded as threatening a society's existence or violating one or more of its fundamental cultural presuppositions.[~~.".?~~ It is also clear that the impact of the experience of trauma is not exhausted in the articulation of notions of injustice and harm, or the (re)articulation of identity, ~~as~~ Alexander further? suggests. Agency springs from~~out of~~ the realization that something needs to be done, that "brothers and sisters" need to be supported, or that a voice needs to be heard. ~~gained.~~

Conclusion

Sandercock suggests that memory "locates us, as part of a family history, as part of a tribe or community, as a part of [city_building ~~Sic?~~ and nation-making. Loss of memory is, basically, loss of identity" (1998: 207–208). [Conversely,? I would argue

[4] For more on the role of the media and the charity sector in these processes, see Sofos &~~and~~ Tsagarousianou 2013.

that, memory is crucial for identity [formation, a highly contested terrain, the object of cultural politics seeking to shape it and appropriate it.? In the preceding pages, I have tried to explore some key aspects of the politics of memory in which European Muslims are engaged and through which they articulate discourses and narratives that inform their self-definitions. I have examined aspects of the construction of historical memory that link European Muslims with a remote Islamic past in a number of ways. Despite the temporal and experiential distance that separates the present from the early Islamic era, European Muslims develop strong connections with that past, partlyto an extent as part of their efforts to validate their cultures and their settlement in Europe. In addition to this way of projecting their own aspirations to the past, European Muslims produce narratives of a history of settlement and achievement in Europe. In this context, their narratives of inhabiting the localities where they are concentrated constitute attempts to use memory as a resource forin becoming stakeholders, and countering narratives of exclusion that they face in everyday contexts. Another important aspect of the politics of memory that I have examined relates to the construction of a sense of "cultural trauma". This is a complex and [creative? process of articulation of distinct memories and experiences of "other Muslims" from Europe and beyond;, of "postmemory" crucial for the construction of injustice frames that facilitate the [construction building? and reproduction of identity and agency among European Muslims.

In many ways, these processes are not so much about the past as they are about the present and the future. As various individuals and groups challenge or modify hegemonic versions of the past and advance their own memory/memories and history/histories, they lay claims to the present and the future; and the attempts of European Muslims to locate themselves in the past onin their own terms is in no way different, insofar as they are orientatedgeared towards endowing themselves with identities and agency.

References - Tsagarousianou

Alexander, J. et al. (2004) *Cultural Trauma and Collective Identity*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Appadurai, A. (1986) 'Introduction: Commodities and the Politics of Value.' In A. Appadurai (ed.) *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 3-63.

Ballard, R. (1996) 'Islam and the Construction of Europe.' In W.A.R Shadid and P. S. van Koningsveld (eds.) *Muslims in the Margin: Political Responses to the Presence of Islam in Western Europe*. Kampen: Kok Pharos.

Bowman, G. (2003) 'Constitutive Violence and the Nationalist Imaginary: Antagonism and Defensive Solidarity in Palestine and Former Yugoslavia.' *Social Anthropology,* 2(3), pp. 319-340.

De Certeau, M. (1984) *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Berkeley: The University of California Press.

Delanty, G. (1995) *Inventing Europe*. Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Esposito, J. (2002) *What Everyone Needs to Know About Islam*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Eyerman, R. 1994. *Between Culture and Politics: Intellectuals in Modern Society.* Cambridge: Polity.

Gamson, W. A. (1995) 'Constructing Social Protest.' In H. Johnston and B. Klandermans (eds.) *Social Movements and Culture*. London: UCL Press.

Goffman, E. (1974) *Frame analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Halbwachs, M. (1980) *The Collective Memory*. New York: Harper Colophon Books.

Halbwachs, M. (1992) *On Collective Memory*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Hale, G. (1998) *Making Whiteness.* New York: Vintage.

Hirsch, M. (1999) 'Projected Memory: Holocaust Photographs in Personal and Public Fantasy.' In M. Bal, J. Crewe, and L. Spitzer (eds.) *Acts of Memory: Cultural Recall in the Present*. Hanover: University Press of New England. pp. 3-23.

Hirsch, M. and V. Smith (eds.) (2002) 'Gender and Cultural Memory.' *Signs,* 28(1), pp. 1-498.

Hirschkind, C. (2006) *The Ethical Soundscape: Cassette Sermons and Islamic Counterpublics*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Metcalfe, B. D. (ed.) (1996) *Making Muslim Space in North America and Europe.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Neumann, I. (1999) *Uses of the Other: The 'East' in European Identity Formation*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Open Society Institute (2010) *Muslims in Europe: A Report on 11 EU Cities*. New York, London and Budapest: Open Society Institute.

Peterson, A. (2011) 'The 'Long Winding Road' to Adulthood: A Risk-filled Journey for Young People in Stockholm's Marginalized Periphery.' *Young,* 19(3), pp. 271-289.

Pew Social Attitudes Survey. (2006) *Muslims in Europe*. Washington DC: Pew Global.

Ryan, C. and W. A. Gamson (2006) 'The Art of Reframing Political Debates.' *Contexts*, 5(1), pp. 13-18.

Sandercock, L. (1998) *Towards Cosmopolis*. London: Wiley.

Shildrick, T. (2006) 'Youth Culture, Subculture and the Importance of Neighbourhood'. *Young,* 14(1), pp. 61–74.

Šisler, V. (2009) 'Video Games, Video Clips, and Islam: New Media and the Communication of Values.' In: J. Pink (ed.) *Muslim Societies in the Age of Mass Consumption*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. pp. 231–258.

Sofos, S. and R. Tsagarousianou (2013) *Islam in Europe: Public Spaces and Civic Networks.* Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.

Sommers, M. R. (1994) 'The Narrative Constitution of Identity: A Relational and Network Approach.' *Theory and Society,* 23, pp. 605-649.

Taylor, C. (1989) *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tolan, J. V. (2002) *Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination*. New York: Columbia University Press.

References

Alexander, J. et al. 2004. *Cultural Trauma and Collective Identity*. Berkeley : University of California Press.

Appadurai, A. 1986. "Introduction: commodities and the politics of value". In A. Appadurai. (ed.) *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. pp. 3-63.

Ballard, R. 1996. "Islam and the Construction of Europe". in W.A.R Shadid and P. S. van Koningsveld (eds.). *Muslims in the Margin: Political Responses to the Presence of Islam in Western Europe*. Kampen: Kok Pharos.

Bowman, G. 2003. "Constitutive violence and the nationalist imaginary. Antagonism and defensive solidarity in Palestine and former Yugoslavia". *Social Anthropology* II(3). pp 319-340

De Certeau, M. 1984. *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Berkeley: The University of California Press.

Delanty, G. (1995) Inventing Europe. Basingstoke: Macmillan

Esposito, J. 2002. *What Everyone Needs to Know About Islam*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Eyerman, R. 1994. *Between Culture and Politics: Intellectuals in Modern Society*. Cambridge: Polity

Gamson, W. A. 1995. "Constructing social protest". in H. Johnston and B. Klandermans (eds) *Social movements and culture*. London: UCL Press

Goffman, E. 1974. *Frame analysis: An easy on the organization of experience*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press

Halbwachs, M. 1980. *The collective memory*. New York: Harper Colophon Books.

Halbwachs, M. 1992. *On collective memory*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Hale, G. 1998. *Making Whiteness*. New York: Vintage.

Hirsch, M. 1999. Projected memory: Holocaust photographs in personal and public fantasy. In M. Bal, J. Crewe, and L. Spitzer (eds.) *Acts of memory: Cultural recall in the present.* Hanover: University Press of New England. pp. 3-23

Hirsch, M., and V. Smith, eds. 2002. "Gender and cultural memory". *Signs* 28(1). pp. 1-498.

Hirschkind, C. 2006. *The Ethical Soundscape: Cassette Sermons and Islamic Counterpublics.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Metcalfe, B. D. (ed). 1996. *Making Muslim Space in North America and Europe.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Neumann, I. (1999) Uses of the Other: The 'East' in European Identity Formation. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Open Society Institute. (2010) Muslims in Europe: A Report on 11 EU Cities. New York, London and Budapest: Open Society Institute

Peterson, A. 2011. "The 'Long Winding Road' to Adulthood : A Risk-filled Journey for Young People in Stockholm's Marginalized Periphery". *Young* 19(3): 271-289.

Pew Social Attitudes Survey. (2006) Muslims in Europe. Washington DC: Pew Global.

Ryan, C. and W. A. Gamson. 2006. "The Art of Reframing Political Debates". *Contexts.* 5(1). pp. 13-18

Sandercock, L. (1998) *Towards Cosmopolis.* London: Wiley.

Shildrick, T. 2006. "Youth culture, subculture and the importance of neighbourhood". *Young.* 14(1): 61–74

Šisler, V. 2009. "Video Games, Video Clips, and Islam: New Media and the Communication of Values". In: J. Pink (ed.) *Muslim Societies in the Age of Mass Consumption.* Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. pp. 231–258.

Sofos, S. and R. Tsagarousianou. 2013. *Islam in Europe: Public Spaces and Civic Networks.* Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan

Sommers, M. R. 1994. "The narrative constitution of identity: A relational and network approach". *Theory and Society.* 23. pp. 605-649

Taylor, C. 1989. *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tolan, J. V. (2002) Saracens: Islam in the Medieval European Imagination. New York: Columbia University Press.