MUSIC AS IMAGE:
AN ANALYTICAL-PSYCHOLOGY
APPROACH TO MUSIC IN FILM

BENJAMIN NAGARI

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements of the University of Westminster
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

December 2013
I hereby declare that this thesis is my own work and has not been submitted for any other award. It is presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. As required by these rules and conduct, all materials that are not original to this thesis have been fully and properly cited and referenced. The content of the paper submission is identical to the content of the electronic submission.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Had I wanted to thank every single individual involved in this way or another in the evolvement of this thesis I would have to contemplate a second volume. Hence I would better humbly and respectfully try to condense the list of those individuals, allowing the spirit of gratefulness to reach each of them while mentioning central individuals.

Sowing the seeds of this thesis started in walking together along a corridor in Goldsmith University with Prof. Roderick Main, then a lecturer at the Centre for Psychoanalytic Studies (Jungian and Post-Jungian Studies) at the University of Essex in Colchester. In that conversation I asked him whether he believed that Music was an Image. After a short pause he said he thought it was. I am very grateful to Prof. Main, due to whose positive comment this thesis started and developed. I also owe great respect to the then heads of the Jungian School at Essex University, Prof. Andrew Samuels and Prof. Renos Papandopulous, who broadened the roads into a recent understanding of Jung’s original work.

Working on this thesis I was lucky to have two supervisors, coming from different universities and different academic disciplines, to whom I am totally grateful, both for their knowledge and their patience. Dr. Christian Kennett, a senior lecturer in Music Sociology from the University of Westminster and Prof. Luke Hockley, professor of Media Analysis at the University of Bedfordshire; both took great care of their specialties in the different aspects of my studies, thus helping combine allegedly opposing disciplines such as music, film, media studies and analytical psychology.

Mr. Mike Fisher, the Research Degrees Manager at Westminster University and Miss Fauzia Ahmed, the administrator at CAMRI (Communication and Media Research Institute), have been of great assistance in walking through the day-to-day academic life throughout my long study period.

Special thanks to my good friend Prof. Nitzan Ben-Shaul of Tel Aviv University’s school of Film and Television in the Faculty of Arts, for helping me by
raising questions that had to be addressed thoroughly in order to cover the full scope of this multi-disciplinary thesis. Last but not least are my big thanks to a best friend, Mr. Thomas Aron, for standing by me during the whole period of my studying and especially throughout some bad times of illness, by supporting and encouraging me not to give up.

And finally, a great many thanks to Joanna Baron for her meticulous and devoted proofreading of this thesis and to Dr. Peter Goodwin for his great moral support.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ................................................................. i  
Table of Contents ................................................................. iii  
Abstract ................................................................................. 1  
Introduction ........................................................................... 2  

## PART I: ............................................................................. 12

THE PSYCHOLOGICAL IMAGE: IMAGING & IMAGINATION - A JUNGIAN PERSPECTIVE ................................................. 12

1. Jung, Image, Archetype and Complex ......................... 14  
2. Jung, Opposites and Psychic Energy ......................... 24  
3. Jung’s Psychological Types ........................................... 27  
4. Jung, Sign and Symbol .................................................... 32  
5. Image, Imagery, Imagination: A Perspective of Placement ............................................................... 37  
6. The Autonomous Ways of Images: Dreams and Synaesthesia ................................................................. 41  
   6.1 Dreams .......................................................................... 41  
   6.2 Synaesthetic Imaging ................................................... 43  
7. The Non-Visual Image ....................................................... 46  

## PART II: ............................................................................. 48

MUSIC AS IMAGE: THE ENCOUNTER OF VISUAL AND NON VISUAL IN FILM ................................................................. 48

1. Music as Image: An Emotive Introduction ................. 48  
2. Music as Image: Its Placement in Film ..................... 55  
   2.1 Music and Emotional Sub-Placement .................... 60  
   2.2 Volume: Relative, Internal and External ............. 62  
3. Music as Image: Its Realities and Functions ............. 65
3.1 Music as Image: Some Functional Observations … 73

4. Psychological Dimensions of the Film-Music Functions …………………………………………………… 76

4.1 The Uses of the Overlapping Music Functions …… 79

4.2 Local Conditioning Through Music ……………… 82

4.3 Time, Space and Transition ……………………… 89

4.4 Music as Effect: Encountering ‘Real’ Sound …… 94

5. Film Music: Type, Style, Original and Non-Original Music …………………………………………………… 96

5.1 Time, Jazz, Pop and Independent Songs ………… 100

6. Film, Music, Archetype ……………………………… 106

7. When Image Turns Hero …………………………… 110

8. Conclusion: The Music-Image – Inside and Outside Film ………………………………………………………… 115

PART III: ……………………………………………………………………………………………………… 118

CLOSE ENCOUNTERS OF THE MUSICAL KIND: AN ANALYSIS OF THE MUSIC-IMAGE IN THREE FILMS … 118

Introduction ……………………………………………………… 118

1. Taxi Driver …………………………………………………………… 124

Plot Synopsis ………………………………………………………… 124

Music ………………………………………………………………… 126

Conclusion …………………………………………………………… 143

2. Nuit et Brouillard (Night and Fog) …………………… 147

About the Film ……………………………………………………… 147

Documentary, Facts and Visuals …………………………… 147

Fog, Darkness and Music ……………………………………… 158

3. Eyes Wide Shut ……………………………………………………… 171
Abstract

Sound and music, both independently and inside film are sometimes considered to be secondary to the visual. Some disciplines wish to classify them as triggers to neurological systems while some others will emphasise their affect-inflicting capacity; in both cases these remain as secondary functions and in the case of film as nothing but accompanying elements. Yet, observed psychologically sound and music have a unique and wholesome function in the human psyche. Carl Gustav Jung’s analytical psychology opens the door for the understanding of both as images, far beyond the consensual acceptance of image being of a visual faculty only.

Understanding music as image puts music in a different position inside a film as well as a stand-alone phenomenon in the every-day life. Analytical psychology, in both original Jungian and contemporary Post-Jungian versions, using the core ideas of archetype, opposites, functions of the psyche and image - supports the very concept of music/sound as image. This thesis will approach the consequent understanding of the role of music in film beyond the decorative-accompaniment task attributed to it and as an image on its own right.

The work is divided into three main parts: Part I will introduce general Jungian aspects to build the case of a Jungian psychological account of the music-image. Part II will attempt to combine theory with practice in analysing how the auditory image (mainly music) works (or sometimes clashes) with the visual (picture) to create the ‘film as a whole’ experience. Part III will implement a specific understanding of three individual film cases of different genres, eras and styles as psychologically scrutinised ‘case histories’.
Introduction

Even though we usually refer to image and the concept of it as relating to the visual only, other non-visual phenomena can carry a similar weight if we approach them psychologically. Thus sound and especially its ‘organised’ form of music can bear the scrutiny of the concept. This thesis will focus on music in film, when the visual and the non-visual images stand together, whether in complementary or contradictory manners. Although it will strive to show that music in general possesses an image quality by itself, the case of music in film shines through as such due to its inseparable connection, collaboration and comparability with the visual image.¹

Modern psychologies point to different directions and paths in their endeavour to understand and apprehend behaviour, responses, emotions and structures of the psyche, and therefore can offer different routes to our response to sound and music. Yet, the effect of music on the human mind has intrigued humanity long before the establishment of the 19th and 20th Century scientific/empirical discipline known as modern psychology. Early speculations regarding sound, music and mind were a mixture of scientific (mainly mathematical) and philosophical endeavours (attempting to understand both psyche and the divine); early ‘singing birds’ can be found in Pythagoras in the sixth century B.C.:

“He is said to have demonstrated that the perceived pitch of a vibrating string varies inversely with its length, and is also credited with establishing that the musical consonances of the octave, 5th and 4th correspond to simple ratios

¹ The term ‘music in film’ denotes any music used inside the film, whether specifically composed or otherwise, diegetic or non-diegetic, as the common usage of ‘film-music’ mainly (and maybe wrongly so) refers to film-score especially prepared for a specific film.
formed by different lengths of string. His followers, however, lost faith in the experimental method and instead attempted to explain musical phenomena purely in terms of mathematical relationships. For example, Anaxagoras (c499–428 B.C.) held that the sense perceptions were too weak to permit the establishment of scientific truth. Later, the music theorist Boethius (480–524 C.E.), a dedicated Pythagorean, wrote in *De institutione musica* (Eng. trans. in Bower, 1967, p.58): ‘What need is there to speak further concerning the error of the senses, when this same faculty of sensing is neither equal in all men, nor at all times equal within the same man? Therefore anyone vainly puts his trust in a changing judgment since he aspires to seek the truth’.2

Boethius had opened the gates – knowingly or otherwise – to accepting both the rational and irrational qualities built in music and the same ambiguity in regard of its interaction with the human mind.

A dissension from pure mathematical perception of music could then be found in Aristoxenus (c320 B.C), arguing that “music could not be understood solely by considering mathematical relationships”. He foreshadowed modern study of the psychology of music by arguing that musical phenomena were perceptual and cognitive in nature and should be studied as an experimental science. In his treatise *On Harmonics* he wrote (Eng. trans. in Macran, 1902, pp.102–4):

“It is plain that the apprehension of a melody consists in noting with both the ear and intellect every distinction as it arises in the successive sounds – successive, since melody, like all branches of music, consists in a successive production. For the apprehension of music depends on these two faculties, sense perception and memory; for we must perceive the sound that is present and

---

2 Deutsch, D. et al. (2009)
remember that which is past. In no other way can we follow the phenomenon of music.”

To transfer Aristoxenus’ musical intuition into a contemporary reading of musical qualities we may compare *sense perception* to elements such as tone pitch and frequency, tone quality and colouration and their ‘vertical’ relation within a harmonic setup they appear in; *memory* will relate to the psyche’s engagement with *time* and its psychological expression in music.

The relationship between the stability of the mathematical and scientific ground of music on one hand, and the ever-changing, ‘unstable’, in-need-of-experiment factor of its human end on the other, kept intriguing philosophers and researchers throughout later centuries into mixing the opposing factors. Distinguishing between *sensory consonance* and *musical consonance* Descartes, a major figure in 17th-century rationalism postulated that:

“...in order to determine what is most agreeable, one should consider the capacity of the listener, which changes like taste, according to the person in question... But one can say absolutely which consonances are the most simple and the most accordant ones; for that depends only on how often their sounds unite, and how closely they approach the nature of the unison.”

From the above few examples, stretching from the 5th century B.C. to the 17th century A.D. we can trace the dichotomy of the ‘natural’ and the personal for which we are still trying to find a meaning (and maybe a system). All elements of music

---

3 Ibid.
4 Cohen, H.F. (1984), p. 169. We may want to hold this thought in mind, as it opens the way for “one’s dissonance is another’s consonance” way in music apprehension.
have been scrutinised – tonality, harmony, rhythm, melody and tone colouration – in order to find a common ground for how music and psyche interact. Such was the subject of Structural (or Associational) empirical psychology testing led by Wilhelm Wundt in the mid 19th and early 20th century. Wundt, who founded the first experimental psychological laboratory in Leipzig in 1879, tested the phenomenon of rhythm and as a result indicated that “experience of rhythm included recurring auditory and kinaesthetic sensations and feelings of tension and relaxation.”

Claiming that “perception aims at finding good ‘figures’ (patterns, Gestalts), and that “the whole is more than the sum of its parts”, Gestalt and behavioural psychology then abandoned structuralism and analytical introspection. Géza Révész (1878–1955), a music psychologist, contributed a ‘two-component theory of musical pitch’ (1913), pointing to “a distinction between tone height, continuously rising from low to high pitch, and tone quality (‘chroma’), recurring anew in each octave.” Later on, in 1939, German music psychologist Albert Wellek further elaborated this distinction, “going as far as indicating the existence of two types of listeners, the ‘linear’ type who mainly attends to tone height and the ‘cyclic’ type who focuses on tone chroma.”

Diverting from Behaviourism, American psychologist C. E. Seashore described the musical mind as being made of:

- musical sensitivity

---

5 Deutsch, D. et al. (2009)
6 Ibid. See also Révézé, G. (2001 [1954]).
7 The idea of different types of listeners and listening will be discussed later as an important element in the expectation of and from music in film.
8 Ibid.
These six divisions of the musical mind suggest an increase (by definition and activity) of the involvement of the musically-participating-mind in forming musical meaning, thus allowing more individual input rather than fixed, pre-conceived meanings. Moreover, the idea of such vast divisions in the ‘music mind’ may suggest the existence of a ‘music function’ in the psyche. ¹⁰

Psychoacoustic research has always attempted to find direct and/or indirect relations between music phenomena - such as pitch, intensity, volume etc. - and the mind. Some of the findings in this field may serve as a part of considered elements in composing music-as-an-accompanying-factor, e.g. for film, theatre, ballet etc’. Yet, in individual psychology terms these found formulae of frequencies, pitches and so on may not bear the same expected effect on every individual. For the psychologically enquiring mind some of the psychoacoustically researched components, such as sound spectra and level, the limits of hearing, the perception of loudness and localization of sound¹¹ could better serve as potential blueprints for understanding brain-sound-music interaction rather than solid, fixed patterns of cause-and-effect. What we may want to do is to adopt psychoacoustic findings as start-points for investigating the

---

¹⁰ It might be very fruitful to compare this function with Jung’s ideas of the psyche’s functions, even though in this case some functions seem to stem from one another and they do not necessarily stand in opposition. See PART II chapter 4.

¹¹ See Moore, C. J., “Hearing and psychoacoustics” for psychoacoustic main research points.
response, behaviour and adaptation of the ‘sound psyche’ and ‘music psyche’. Two particular points elaborated by Chion\textsuperscript{12} and Gorbman\textsuperscript{13} are the ideas of diegetic and non-diegetic sound/music in film, concepts that may expand the scope of psychoacoustics when dealing with case of “when the ear met the eye”.

Extraneous to acoustics, mathematics and psychoacoustics the concept of affect\textsuperscript{14} can not be dismissed when attempting to understand the powerful effect of music on the listener (or the interchanging listening-viewer/viewing-listener in the case of film). Incapable of being measured in decibels, frequencies and pitch, affect has to undergo the scrutiny of psychology, at least not before a stable, solid correlation between those could be established and tested. We must be aware that the source, origin and dependency of affect may be understood differently in different schools of psychology while the observed results may be similar in all. (The theoretical preference of this thesis, as will unfold in the following chapters, is for that of Carl Gustav Jung’s Analytical Psychology).

“Music seems to elicit strong emotion more reliably and frequently than other art forms” claims W. H. Frey.\textsuperscript{15} John Sloboda finds three characteristics seeming to be key determinants:

“(i) Music unfolds over time and so is capable of engaging the emotions of expectation and expectations realized or dashed more effectively than static forms such as painting; drama, dance, film and literature share this feature with

\begin{itemize}
\item See fn. 34 for this thesis’ stand on the confusion in terms between ‘affect’ and ‘emotion’. The same confusion arises in Jung’s terminology usage as do many other writers.
\item W.H. Frey: Crying: the Mystery of Tears (Minneapolis, 1985)
\end{itemize}
music;\textsuperscript{16} (ii) music uses directly, and often mimics, the most emotionally important signal of the human species: the voice (only drama shares this feature); (iii) music engages the auditory sense, which gives it a general arousing capacity due to the fact that we cannot escape the source of stimulation (as we can, for instance, for a painting by looking away or closing our eyes), as well as providing a link to the most primitive and fundamental feelings and experiences of human life”.\textsuperscript{17}

Yet, while apparently being a ‘not very scientific’ concept, affect and emotion may be seen differently and in contradictory ways by different people. In his \textit{Chronicle of My Life} composer Igor Stravinsky (1936) confesses his belief that affect has no necessity or relevance to the creation, understanding or interpretation of music, and that it is an unhelpful by-product. On the other hand, composer and theorist Leonard B. Meyer suggests that ‘affect is a natural component of the perception of the formal properties of a piece of music. Instead of distracting a listener from a proper understanding of the music, certain types of affect are proof that a listener has indeed understood it’.\textsuperscript{18} This thesis follows Meyer in arguing that affect can adapt or block involvement with response to music (in film or otherwise) as the human psyche has the capacity to bypass it and/or divert it to a different type of \textit{expression}.


\textsuperscript{16} Emphasis mine
\textsuperscript{17} Sloboda, J.: \textit{Affect}. In Deutsch, D. et al
\textsuperscript{18} Meyer, L. B. (1956) in Deutsch, D. et al.
\textsuperscript{19} Dutta, S. and Kanungo, R.N.: \textit{Affect and Memory: a Reformulation} (New York, 1975)
Sloboda, dealing with extrinsic and intrinsic types of affect claims in a paragraph worth quoting at length that:

“Certain types of stimulus (including music, smells and tastes) seem to become associated in human memory with particular contexts or events in earlier life, and provide a trigger to the recall of these events. This seems particularly so when the earlier events were, in themselves, occasions of strong emotion. A number of investigators …have found examples of specific pieces of music that trigger strong emotion in this way. Such emotions generally lead attention away from the present music on to the remembered past event. Waterman (1996) has shown that even when music does not directly trigger past experiences, many of the affective mental processes are self-referring in some way (‘I should have recognized that’, ‘this is not my type of music’). Because these feelings are linked to the life histories of individuals, they are often highly idiosyncratic. However, common cultural experiences can sometimes lead to shared affect which is still fundamentally extrinsic – for example, the extreme negative emotions felt by many Jews after World War II on hearing the music of Wagner; the strong emotional identification of generational cohorts with the popular music prevalent in their teenage years …and the cultural associations formed by film-music pairings, such as Johann Strauss's Blue Danube waltz with the spaceship docking sequence in Stanley Kubrick's film 2001: a Space Odyssey”. 24

Following the ideas of Dowling and Harwood,25 Sloboda argues the existence of two distinct types of relationship between musical structures and emotional responses, naming them iconic and symbolic. According to this division “Iconic relationships come about through some formal resemblance between a musical structure and some event or agent carrying emotional ‘tone’. For instance, loud, fast music shares features

---

24 Sloboda, J.: Affect. In Deutsch, D. et al. The facets of affect, including the extrinsic and intrinsic will be discussed later.
with events of high energy and so suggests a high-energy emotion such as excitement” whereas “Symbolic” relationships come about where the listener's response is determined by an appreciation of formal and syntactic properties of the musical sequence. It is well established that even short and simple musical sequences set up powerful expectancies in listeners for what will follow these sequences …These expectancies can be based on fundamental properties of human perception, such as the so-called gestalt laws of perception” 26 Sloboda summarises the subject of extrinsic and intrinsic affect stating that:

“Since both extrinsic and intrinsic affect often depend for their operation on acquired knowledge (whether biographical or related to specific musical styles), cultural and developmental factors will strongly influence emotional response”. 27

Extrinsic and intrinsic types of affect, cultural and developmental factors of emotional response, iconic and symbolic relationship between musical structures and emotional responses – all these take us more than half the way into analytical psychology and its understanding of the concept of image. The extrinsic and intrinsic are close to Jung’s ideas of the opposites and introversion/extraversion elements of the psyche’s energy. Cultural and developmental factors support the concept of ever-evolving dynamics of the archetypes and the ways they manifest in both personal and collective forms (both conscious and unconscious). The iconic and the symbolic match with Jung’s idea of the difference between sign and symbol, a concept that by distancing image from pure semiotic representation allows it to endorse the non-visual as dynamically acceptable and equally relevant.

27 Ibid.
This thesis will present music-as-image in three cumulative stages in three parts. Part I will explore the psychological image, (mainly) under the Jungian model, building the case for the validity of the non-visual image. Part II will discuss the music-image and its presentation in film alongside the visual image. The last part will attempt to analyse three films different in genre and style for the role of the music-image in them and its unique ways of collaboration and co-existence with the visual.

* * *

- 11 -
PART I

THE PSYCHOLOGICAL IMAGE: IMAGING & IMAGINATION

- A JUNGIAN PERSPECTIVE

Part I of this thesis makes the case for understanding the non-visual image in general, and music-image, in particular, as a psychological concept. The main route of this investigation will use C. G. Jung’s Analytical Psychology\textsuperscript{28} to explore both traditional Jungian and contemporary post-Jungian takes on this subject of image.\textsuperscript{29} In order to pursue this line of research it is necessary to exhibit and clarify some of the main Jungian concepts that relate to the idea of image, which is a central pillar of the entire archetypal basis of analytical psychology and which runs through the philosophical to the practical and applied aspects of Jung’s psychological theories.

Initially termed primordial images (1912) and later re-named dominants of the collective unconscious (1917), these images cum dominants were finally defined and re-named by Jung as the archetypes of the collective unconscious (1919), of which he says:

\textsuperscript{28} To be distinguished from Sigmund Freud’s psychoanalytic school.
\textsuperscript{29} A great interest in film-analysis based on the understanding of Jung’s work has been growing in the last decades. Many Jungians and Jungian influenced scholars have contributed to this field, based on the following aspects of Jung’s ideas on image. Among the Post-Jungian writers in this field are Hockley (2003 & 2007), Iacino (1994 & 1998), Izod (2006), Singh (2009), Coleman (2010) and Hauke and Alister (eds., 2001) to mention only a few. This section will exhibit those ideas on which the foundations of Jungian film analysis are based.
“I have chosen the term ‘collective’ because this part of the unconscious is not individual but universal; in contrast to the personal psyche, it has contents and modes of behaviour that are more or less the same everywhere and in all individuals. It is, in other words, identical in all men and thus constitutes a common psychic substrate of a suprapersonal nature which is present in every one of us.” (Jung, CW 9i, para. 3)

These archetypes ‘reside’ in the depth of the lower layer of the unconscious, named by Jung as the collective unconscious above which resides the personal unconscious. Jung’s archetypes, somewhat (but not entirely) resembling Plato’s Ideas, are thus the blueprint of humanity carried forward for endless years of existence via those images/dominant/ideas, being the building blocks of the ‘psyche as a whole’. These fluid notions of apparently confusing terms already show Jung’s inclination to treat images beyond their visual quality only, stepping towards the realm of abstract and shapelessness.

Dealing with the abstract alongside the concrete, and rational side-by-side with the irrational, there is no wonder that Jung’s definitions and ideas changed over time and include contradictions and partial explanations. Yet, going through his extensive writings we can find a solid basis to support his ideas, even when they appear abstract, irrational, complex or compound. One of which is in need of more compound coherence is his interpretation of the concept of Image.

30 Psyche as a whole is an expression, used by Jung and others to denote the interactivity of all of the elements inside this unit (psyche). This ‘as a whole’ model will be later used in this thesis for units other than the psyche, e.g. a film on its entirely interacting inner elements/images.
1. Jung, Image, Archetype and Complex

“The image is a condensed expression of the psychic situation as a whole, and not merely, or even predominantly, of unconscious contents pure and simple” (Jung, CW 6, para. 745; original italics). Originally formulated as a concept, the image was experienced as a companionate psychic presence. Although mainly expressing unconscious contents the image is not solely so as it corresponds with the momentarily constellated conscious situation of the psyche. “This constellation is the result of the spontaneous activity of the unconscious on the one hand and of the momentary conscious situation on the other”. Jung postulates that it exists in a state of reciprocal relationship, as it can start “neither from the conscious alone nor from the unconscious alone” (Jung, CW6 para. 745). This reciprocity between the two opposites brings forth emotion and affect into imagery. From this perspective the image is a container of opposites standing in contradiction to the symbol, which is a mediator of opposites. As such, it does not adhere to any one position but elements of it can be found in others. Jung conceptualised the image as endowed with a generative power which was psychically compelling and whose function was to arouse. For him, “the image is always an expression of the totality perceived and perceivable, apprehended and apprehensible, by the individual”.

---

31 The term ‘psychic’ refers to the grammatical form denoting ‘of the psyche’ and shall be used throughout as such. No mystical reference intended whatsoever.
32 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 72
33 Ibid.
34 The terms affect and emotion can be extremely confusing in Jung’s writing; sometimes equating, sometimes replacing and at times complementing each other. It is this thesis’ understanding that affect is the trigger (external or internal) that causes us to be ‘moved’, while the emotion is the outcome, our psychic and/or somatic response to the ‘movement’ triggered by the affect. It is possible to be affected without producing an emotion; yet, emotion being created as a response to affect may manifest itself without it’s producer’s awareness.
35 The concept of Opposites will be explained in chapter 2 below.
36 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 72
37 Ibid., p. 73
To quote Samuels again, “Images have a facility to beget their like; movement of images toward their realisation is a psychic process which happens to us personally. We both look on from the outside and also act or suffer as a figure in the drama.”

This suggests the Jungian understanding of image-making (imagery, and as we will see later on – imagination) as being a dynamic process that involves the rational alongside the irrational, and the conscious together with unconscious; it is a process which is independent of the sign, one which opens the door to perceptions beyond the visual appearance, casual or scientific. In this sense it is not a semiotic system, but rather a system that embodies and carries its own history and psychological experience. Jung notes, “It is a psychic fact that the fantasy is happening and it is as real as you - as a psychic entity - are real. If this crucial operation of entering in with your own reaction is not carried out, all the changes are left to the flow of images, and you yourself remain unchanged” (Jung, CW 14, para. 753). This suggests a blurring between fantasy and reality, and other imagery including linear and non-linear, rational and irrational, conscious and unconscious dynamics. Hence, fantasy is an image-driven psychic truth.

In defining ‘image’ Jung professes to mean that:

“When I speak of "image"… I do not mean the psychic reflection of an external object, but a concept derived from poetic usage, namely, a figure of fancy or fantasy-image, which is related only indirectly to the perception of an external object. This image depends much more on unconscious fantasy activity, and as the product of such activity it appears more or less abruptly in consciousness,

---

38 Ibid., p. 73
39 Linear: Corresponding with a continuous time/space flow; hence 'real' reality. Non-Linear: Corresponding with a non-stable/interrupted flow of time.
somewhat in the manner of a vision or hallucination, but without possessing the morbid traits that are found in a clinical picture.” (Jung, CW6, para. 743)

Here he also refers to his idea of the plurality of the term ‘reality’ by distinguishing between ‘sensuous reality’ and ‘inner image’

“The image has the psychological character of a fantasy idea and never the quasi-real character of a hallucination, i.e., it never takes the place of reality, and can always be distinguished from sensuous reality by the fact that it is an "inner" image. As a rule, it is not a projection in space, although in exceptional cases it can appear in exteriorized form.” (Ibid)

Following, using the ‘internal’ and ‘external’ distinction of realities we may find a connecting point between them:

“Although, as a rule, no reality-value attaches to the image, this can at times actually increase its importance for psychic life, since it then has a greater psychological value, representing an inner reality which often far outweighs the importance of external reality. In this case the orientation (q.v.) of the individual is concerned less with adaptation to reality than with adaptation to inner demands.” (Jung, CW6, para. 744)

In terms of the ‘acting’ image in a given time and under given conditions we may be tempted to treat the visual image as relating to external reality (linear) and the non-visual as representing the inner, non-linear reality. Thus, a linear, visual image may be perceived and ‘seen’ as a consciously and finally resolved outcome of the process while the non-visual image is an in-process unconscious idea, not yet resolved. In

40 As the dichotomy of ‘reality’ and ‘fantasy’ is confusedly defined in different ways throughout Jung’s writing I shall refer to it in terms of ‘linear reality’ (the external, here-and-now reality, adhering to continual and cumulative flow – hence linear) and the ‘psychic reality’, being the ‘inner’ psychological reality which includes fantasy.
looking into dream material we can recall these two types of images; one relating to ‘real-life’ images, characters and objects we are familiar with from everyday life and stemming from our own personal unconscious, then mingling with the second type made of irrational, nonsensical characters, objects and ‘non-realistic’ metamorphoses. Here other non-linear image-aspects such as time and space inconsistencies may be involved, thus making dream images to be interpreted by us as ‘irrational’ and/or ‘illogical’.

One of the main reasons for the rift between Jung and his former ‘mentor’ Sigmund Freud was over their different views concerning the structure of the unconscious. While Freud was digging deep into a layer of unknown material underneath the conscious mind, Jung followed suit, only arriving at radically different levels. Freud’s model of the unconscious was of a layer underlying the matrix of the ‘known’, serving as a receptacle of all rejected, repressed and traumatic experience of the individual; they are repressed in order to offer psychological relief/escape until they are brought up to consciousness – thus resolution - often through the therapeutic intervention of psychoanalysis. Freud’s unconscious can sometimes become a hidden circus of demons accumulating then taking place throughout a person’s life. Being demonic, Freud’s unconscious offers mainly suffering; only bringing it to surface can ‘release’ the suffering by becoming conscious. Jung, from a certain point in their collaborative friendship, saw Freud’s model as reductive and one-sidedly negative. He expanded the idea of the unconscious into two levels: the personal level, (corresponding very approximately to Freud’s idea of the unconscious) and the collective layer, lying underneath the personal, containing the past and archaic

41 The implications of dream-like imaging will be dealt with in part II in conjunction with film image-type and how the two interact.
‘images’ now called archetypes that carry within them the seeds of soul and the blueprint of humanity and which - in departure from Freud’s model - are more comprehensive and have healing and compensatory powers.

Before tackling the distinction between an archetype per se and an archetypal image we may find a considerable deal of confusion in Jung, which we may benefit from later on. At times Jung would claim that archetypes were images, as if they had precise specific contents, yet on other occasions he would say that archetypes were pure forms, or categories of the imagination, and, on that basis, would distinguish more precisely between archetypes and archetypal images.\(^{42}\) Adams adds that:

“When he [Jung] distinguishes archetypes from archetypal images, he says that the former are collective inheritances and the latter, personal acquisitions. Archetypes, Jung says, are inherited categories that "give definite form to contents that have already been acquired" through individual experience. That is, they do not determine the specific content of individual experience but constrain the form of it, "within certain categories" (Ibid, p. 45 referring to Jung, CW 15: 81, para. 126)

He also emphasises that:

“As sensible as the distinction is between archetypes and archetypal images, it nevertheless does not adequately address the fact that personal acquisitions through history, culture, and ethnicity also have a collective dimension. What Jung calls archetypes and what Freud calls prototypes, or schemata, are natural rather than cultural categories. They are categories of human nature, not human culture”

and that “Jung and Freud are neo-Kantians: it is as if they were both attempting to write a psychoanalytic critique of the pure imagination.” 

There is a growing tendency among post-Jungians to question the validity of Jung’s claim to the archetypes’ pre-existence and innateness. When Jung postulated the collective unconscious as a type of “innate human nature”, saying that:

“In addition to our immediate personal conscious ... there exists a second psychic system of a collective, universal and impersonal nature which is identical in all Individuals and is inherited. It consists of pre-existent forms, the archetypes”

he rejected the contradictory thought of what he would call ‘the archaic conception’ of the psyche starting as a ‘blank slate’; “just as the body has an anatomical Prehistory of millions of years” – he would insist - “so also does the psychic system...” (Jung, 1963). The opposition to this point, declared by behavioural psychologists of Jung’s era is re-surfacing among some post-Jungians nowadays. Yet, this controversy may have held in both assumptions, the dynamism of the archetypes is not confined to pre-history only, but also to the ever-growing addition accumulated in a non-static manner. The collective unconscious with all its archaic contents is dynamic and ever self-renewing. While pre-historic man attributed thunder storm to the great Unknown – depicted by him as the awesome divine – modern man may relax this collective fear due to conscious scientific comprehension. This does not affect the concept of the

---

43 The notion and definitions of ‘culture’ will be dealt with later on, as it is crucial to understanding the interpretation of the music-image in film and other arts.
44 Yet, Stevens (1982), from a biological point of view, believes that we should look for (and find) the location and transmission of archetypes in structure of DNA itself.
45 Jung, CW 9i, para. 90
Unknown altogether or erases fear, but rather frees that Unknown dynamically from the parts of it that had developed into consciousness and thus formed its awesome divinity.

Offering a broader understanding of the term ‘collective’ Adams suggests two dimensions – an archetypal and a stereotypical; the former is a ‘natural’ - trans-historical, trans-cultural, trans-ethnic, while the latter is historical, cultural and ethnic. This may sound more like a ‘Global’ and ‘Local’ division of the collective; yet, if archetypes underlie the collective, one may wonder whether Adams’ stereotype category above is nothing but divisional, as it refers to the collective by size and/or specifics and not by comprehensive qualities. Yet, this distinction may be useful when dealing with the collective elements of smaller size human groups which, in spite of size, are particularly distinguishable and collectively unique at the same time. By adding that “both stereotypes and archetypes, as well as stereotypical images and archetypal images, may have either a negative or a positive value in psychical reality” (p. 46) Adams adds a new pair of opposites to the pairs already existing in the structure of the psyche; in addition to the following:

- Personal ↔ Collective
- Conscious ↔ Unconscious
- Negative ↔ Positive

We now may add:

- Archetypes and archetypal images ↔ Stereotypes and stereotypical images

- 20 -
It should be noted that before post-Jungianism\(^\text{47}\) started taking analytical psychology up to higher academic levels it was James Hillman who started his Archetypal Psychology in 1970, being an attempt of:

“…moving beyond clinical inquiry within the consulting room of psychotherapy by situating itself within the culture of Western imagination… The term “archetypal”, in contrast to “analytical”… was preferred not only because it reflected “the deep-ended” theory of Jung’s later work which attempts to solve psychological problems beyond scientific models… “Archetypal” belongs to all culture, all forms of human activity, and not only to professional practitioners of modern therapeutics.” (Hillman, 1983 p. 1)

Hillman’s Archetypal Psychology, though a brave attempt at breaking with the ‘strictly therapeutic’ atmosphere of Jung’s first-generation followers aspired to replace that ‘old style’ with a poetic psychology by ‘poeticising’ image and soul, spirit and archetype etc’. This new branch of Jungian thought sowed the seeds of what is now known as Post-Jungian psychology, involving – according to Samuels (1985) – three main approaches: classical, developmental and archetypal, each with its own different emphases and which depart in varying degrees from the original ‘old school’ ideas on different Jungian elements, interpretation and new methodology. Samuels, who had coined the term Post-Jungians (ibid,) intended it "to indicate both connectedness to Jung and distance from him." The need to expand and include sources not natively Jungian but contributing to a wider understanding makes it “not possible for Jungians to be anything other than post-Jungian” (Kulkarni, 2003).

\(^{47}\) A term coined by Andrew Samuels, denoting the next Jungian generations after Jung’s death.
Following all the above we must explore Jung’s ideas and understanding of the concept of *complex*, as this was his input into the linking of the personal and the collective.

“A complex is a collection of images and ideas, clustered round a core derived from one or more archetypes, and characterised by a common emotional tone. When they come into play (become ‘constellated’), complexes contribute to behaviour and are marked by affect whether a person is conscious of them or not. …It is also important to remember that complexes are quite natural phenomena which develop along positive as well as negative lines.”

In his own (and rather harsher) words, Jung defined complexes as follows:

"Complexes are psychic fragments which have split off owing to traumatic *(q.v.)* influences or certain incompatible tendencies. As the association experiments prove, complexes interfere with the intentions of the will and disturb the conscious performance: they produce disturbances of memory and blockages in the flow of association *(q.v.)*; they appear and disappear according to their own laws; they can temporarily obsess consciousness, or influence speech and action in an unconscious way. In a word, complexes behave like independent beings, a fact especially evident in abnormal states of mind.”

A complex is *not* an archetypal image. It is “not just the clothing for one particular archetype (that would, more accurately, be an archetypal image) but an agglomerate of the actions of several archetypal patterns, imbued with personal experience and affect.” Jung also postulated that emotion is “organised by feeling-toned groups of

---

48 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut, 1986 p.34
49 Jung, CW 8, par. 253
50 Samuels, 1985, p. 47
representations\textsuperscript{51} that can affect memory so that ‘the entire mass of memories has a definite feeling tone’\textsuperscript{52}. Accordingly, a complex is really a complex entity, as its mechanism refers to the ‘meeting’ between the ego and varied archetype’s configurations; e.g.:

“the ‘mother complex’ contains emotions derived from the interaction of the ego position with numerous archetypal configurations: the individual, the mother, the individual and mother, mother and father, individual and father, individual and sibling, individual and sibling and mother, individual and family, etc., etc.”\textsuperscript{53}

Due to its intricacy, Jung attempted to explain complex and its aspects in many different approaches. In his Tavistock Lectures (Jung, 1970) he addresses his audience with the following declaration:

“Ladies and Gentlemen …the fact that a complex with its given tension or energy has the tendency to form a little personality of itself. It has a sort of body, a certain amount of its own physiology. It can upset the stomach. It upsets the breathing, it disturbs the heart – in short, it behaves like a partial personality.” (p. 80)

Speaking about one specific type of complex, an autonomous feeling-toned complex, Jung says:

“What then, scientifically speaking, is a 'feeling-toned complex'? It is the image of a certain psychic situation which is strongly accentuated emotionally and is, moreover, incompatible with the habitual attitude of consciousness. This image

\textsuperscript{51} Jung, CW2, paras. 329 & 359
\textsuperscript{52} CW3, par. 80
\textsuperscript{53} Samuels, 1985, p. 47
has a powerful inner coherence, it has its own wholeness and, in addition, a relatively high degree of autonomy, so that it is subject to the control of the conscious mind to only a limited extent, and therefore behaves like an animated foreign body in the sphere of consciousness.”

Jung’s theory of complexes is very comprehensive in its scope and includes aspects of personality, behaviour, mental illness and points of the analytical process. For the purpose of this thesis, the idea of clustering images and memories around an archetypal nucleus may be a reference to pinpointing ‘local meaning’ of music, music-around-core-visual - as music comprehension can present rather striking similarity to the process of a complex’ image/idea clustering around an archetypal core. Yet, we must not confuse a complex with an archetypal image.

2. Jung, Opposites and Psychic Energy

The idea of opposites, opposite-pairing and psychic energy is another main Jungian theoretical concern. This has to do with both the structure and the operation of the psyche and the dynamics of the image. Jung used the terms ‘energy’ and ‘libido’ interchangeably, though for him the idea of libido was not limited to sexuality, as it has become with Freud’s use of the term. Jung's conception is closer to that of a form of life-energy, neutral in character; a psychic energy in the pre-oedipal phases of

54 Jung, CW 8, par. 201
development which takes many forms: nutritional, alimentary and so forth – even before the emergence of the sexual manifestation (Eros).\textsuperscript{55}

Although attempting to compare with and incorporate a physical model of energy, the psychic energy – applied psychologically – is more of a complex metaphor. As Samuels notes:

1. There is a need to indicate the intensity of any particular psychological activity;
2. There is a similar need to demonstrate a shifting focus of interest and involvement;
3. The alteration in the direction of flow is not random;
4. Psychological conflict can be discussed in terms of disturbances in the flow of psychic energy. (Ibid, p. 53-54)

According to these, and unlike Freud’s input, for Jung a conflict is natural, not a psychic struggle of incompatible forces.\textsuperscript{56} As this metaphorical flow moves between tensing opposites in order to create ‘energy’, both poles are necessary for the process or there will be no energy created. This vast psychic energy is then expansive rather than reductive, as it is open to multiple encounters of opposing elements, and not solely to the oedipal or Ego/Id conflicts suggested by Freud.

Jung postulated that “The opposites are the ineradicable and indispensable preconditions of all psychic life” (CW 14, para. 206), as it was ‘a foundation for his

\textsuperscript{55} Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 53
\textsuperscript{56} In Freudian terms, conflict is an ‘opposition between apparently or actually incompatible forces’ (Rycroft (1972) p. 22).
scientific endeavours and lay at the root of many of his hypotheses\textsuperscript{57} The first law of thermodynamics stating that energy demands two opposing forces was the core model for the dynamism of the psyche as its metaphoric energy.

“From the time of his conceptualisation of the role of the \textit{unconscious} as a counter-pole to consciousness (and, therefore, capable of exercising a compensatory function), Jung applied the concept of intrinsic duality to an ever-widening field of psychic research, observation and insight.” (Ibid)

Applying the physical model of energy-creating due to motion between opposing forces makes the psychological opposites irreconcilable. In a ‘natural’ state they co-exist in an undifferentiated manner; in conflict there is an unbalanced tension running between them. Yet,

“Fortunately, out of collision between two opposing forces, the unconscious psyche tends to create a third possibility. This is of an irrational nature, unexpected and incomprehensible to the conscious mind. Presenting itself as neither a straight \textit{yes} or \textit{no} answer, in consequence the third will not be immediately acceptable to either of the opposing points of view. The conscious mind comprehends nothing, the subject feels nothing excepting the oppositions and, so, has no knowledge of what will unite them… Therefore, it is the ambiguous and paradoxical \textit{Symbol} which is capable of attracting attention and eventually reconciling the two. The conflict situation which offers no rational solution to the dilemma is the situation in which the opposition of the 'two' produces an irrational 'third', the \textit{symbol}.” (Ibid)

Archetypes seem to contain an inherent duality of opposition, thus the images carried within are neither positive nor negative but rather of an equally bound

\textsuperscript{57} Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 102
negative-positive quality. The volume and amount of negativity, positivity or otherness determines the dynamism of the conflict and can be expressed through both internal and external images.

3. Jung’s Psychological Types

Wishing to demonstrate how *consciousness* functions differently for different individuals in everyday life Jung formulated a theory of psychological types, a theory that enables us to distinguish between the plural components of consciousness.58 He observed that while some people might be more interested in (or ‘excited’ by) the external world, others would be more energised by the internal world. These two opposing traits were termed by Jung as the *extraverted* and *introverted attitudes of consciousness*. Yet, in addition to these attitudes towards the world there are, according to Jung, separate *functions* of the conscious mind. In his system there are four main functions of consciousness: Thinking, feeling, sensation and intuition.

Put simply, the scope of the functions can be described as follows:

- *Thinking* – “knowing what a thing is, naming it and linking it to other things”.
- *Feeling* – “something other than affect or emotion, a consideration of the value of something or having a viewpoint or perspective on something”.

58 See CW 6, *Psychological Types* (1921)
- Sensation – represents “all facts available to the senses, telling us that something is, but not what it is”.

- Intuition – “a sense of where something is going, what the possibilities are, without conscious proof or knowledge”.59

Thinking vs. Feeling and Sensation vs. Intuition are two opposing pairs. Both these attitudes, pairs and the qualities inside each of the pairs work in opposition - of superiority (strength) and inferiority (weakness). That already indicates that they all exist in the individual, only their strength and weaknesses, prowess or impuissance are felt and acted upon. A person with a strong extraversion attitude may be using – when needed and called for – the introverted “weakness” within him and vice versa. A thinking type person, who might usually show an underdeveloped feeling function may ‘surprise’ at some given moment and burst with sentiment, while a feeling type, usually keeping to emotional tones may suddenly and unexpectedly adhere to a very strictly calculated and thought-of sentiment. So far we can detect the following ‘opposites’, each of which being the superior or the inferior to its opposite:

| Attitudes | Extraversion  ↔  Introversion |
|           | Thinking  ↔  Feeling         |
| Functions | Sensation  ↔  Intuition      |

In addition, Jung determined that each consciousness function – inferior or superior – is ‘attached’ to a conscious attitude, thus we get the following pairings where each is the superior/inferior to its opposite:

59 Following Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p.153; also note that Jung divided the four functions into two pairs: the rational (feeling and thinking) and the irrational (sensation and intuition).
“We are now in a position to describe a person's overall style of consciousness and his orientation towards inner and outer worlds. Jung's model is carefully balanced. A person will have a primary (or superior) mode of functioning; this will be one of the four functions. The superior function will come from one of the two pairs of rational or irrational functions. Of course the person will not depend exclusively on this superior function but will utilise a second or auxiliary function as well. This, according to Jung's observations, will come from the opposite pair of rational or irrational functions depending on whether the superior function came from the rational or irrational pair. Thus, for example, a person with a superior function of feeling (from the rational pair) will have an auxiliary function of either sensation or intuition (from the irrational pair).”

When a person is of a strong extraverted thinking type and accordingly his/her inferior conscious stream is introverted feeling, then this person also has one ‘quite solid’ auxiliary function (of the opposite pair) and a ‘weaker’ one which is the opposite of the main auxiliary function. Thus we arrive at sixteen basic personality types. Jung’s typology is based on the relative quantity and balance between all the components of our conscious activity, this quantity and balance that make the difference between individuals. Unfortunately, and due to the human trait of labeling or pigeon-holing, Jung’s typology became for many an ‘either-or’ theory: you are

---

60 Jung referred to Sensation and Intuition as "irrational" (or perceiving) and to Thinking and feeling as "rational" (or judging).
62 The more distant a component is from the superior-function quality the closer and deeper it will lie in the domain of the unconscious.
either an extravert or an introvert; a thinking type or a feeling type. Even the usage of
the terms extraversion and introversion have been robbed of their original meaning
and popularised into a rather flat expression of ‘shy’ vs. ‘outspoken’.

Many attempts to clarify, expand, elaborate and even contradict this typology have
taken place in psychological literature in general (as Jung’s typology has been revered
by Jungians and non-Jungians alike) and in analytical psychology circles (including
the post-Jungians) in particular. A clarifying light is shed by John Beebe, trying to get
to the root of Jung’s typology:

“It has not always been clear to students of Jung’s analytical psychology what
his famous 'types' are types of. The commonest assumption has been that they
refer to types of people. But for Jung, they were types of consciousness, that is,
characteristic orientations assumed by the ego in establishing and discriminating
an individual's inner and outer reality.”63

Jung, – claims Beebe, elaborating on the root understanding of Jung’s construct of
the conscious functions – was consistent with his greater emphasis on the possibilities
of consciousness, “…and concentrated on the functions, the ego needs to orient itself
to any reality with which it must cope. To understand reality … we need a function of
consciousness that registers reality as real: this he called the sensation function,
which delivers to us the sensation that something is” (Jung 1968: 11). Then, says
Beebe, “we need a function to define for us what we are perceiving when we notice
that something is there: this he called the thinking function”. Next, [Jung] understood
that we need a function that assigns a value to the thing that we have perceived and
named; this is called the function of feeling. Finally, he [Jung] realised that we require

a function to enable us to divine the implications or possibilities of the thing that has been empirically perceived, logically defined and discriminatingly evaluated: this he called the intuitive function.”

According to Beebe, the first notable development in Jung’s typology theory came from his close associate, Marie-Louise von-Franz. Von-Franz put her emphasis on the inferior function for each type. Von Franz, who “systematically studied the inferior function for each of the types …also clarified the relation of the inferior function to Jung's transcendent function, pointing out that if the inferior function is made conscious, then the relation to the unconscious changes and the personality is unified.”

Referring to the inferior functions in film symbolism, Beebe argues that:

“the auxiliary and tertiary functions are often symbolised as an older and younger person of the same sex, as the figure identified with the superior function, …the auxiliary function is carried by a stable parental figure (usually a father in a man and a mother in a woman) and the tertiary function by an unstable child figure, given to cycles of inflation and deflation.”

Jung assumed that the functions were physiologically based and had a psychic ‘element’ which is partially controlled by the ego.

“To some extent a person can choose how to operate, but the limits are probably innate. No one can dispense with any of the four functions; they are inherent to

64 Ibid., p. 132
67 Ibid. Referred to by Jung as puer aeternus in a man and puella aeterna in a woman (Ibid.)
ego-consciousness. But the use of one particular function may become habitual and exclude the others. The excluded function will remain untrained, undeveloped, infantile or archaic and possibly completely unconscious and not integrated into the ego. But it is possible for each function to be differentiated and, within limits, integrated. Nevertheless, for social, educational or familial reasons one function may become one-sidedly dominant in a way that is not in tune with the person's constitutional personality.”

4. **Jung, Sign and Symbol**

Jung strongly advocated that a *symbol* should be strictly distinguished from a *sign*. He insisted that ‘Symbolic and *semiotic* meanings are entirely different things’ and that ‘Every view which interprets the symbolic expression as an analogue or an abbreviated designation for a *known* thing is *semiotic*.’ In discussing the Freud/Adler differences regarding the principle of imagination “since they reduce fantasies to something else and treat them merely as a *semiotic* expression” Jung adds the following footnote:

> “I say “semiotic” in contradistinction to “symbolic”. What Freud terms symbolic are no more than signs for elementary instinctive processes. But the *symbol* is the best possible expression for something that cannot be expressed otherwise than by more or less close analogy.” (CW 6, para. 93 &n)

---

68 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 155  
69 Jung CW 6, para. 814  
70 Ibid, para. 815. The following will reveal that Jung did not intend to use the term *semiotic* as referring to the *theory of semiotics*. 
Upon defining the term ‘reductive’ Jung uses again the symbol-sign, symbolic-semiotic dichotomy, stating that:

“Reductive means “leading back”. I use this term to denote a method of psychological interpretation which regards the unconscious product not as a symbol (q.v.) but semiotically, as a sign or symptom of an underlying process.” (Ibid, para. 788)

The above are to emphasise Jung’s usage of the word semiotic as adjectival and not in any reference to any of the theories of semiotics (Peirce, Saussure and their followers). One must bear this in mind, as Jung attributes little importance to assigning meaning to words but rather to the difference between symbol and sign in both conscious and unconscious dynamics. For him the word ‘semiotic’ means “of or pertaining to signs” and not “of or pertaining to semiotics”. Illustrating the difference between sign and symbol he uses some practical ‘real life’ examples:

“For instance, the old custom of handing over a piece of turf at the sale of a plot of land might be described as "symbolic" in the vulgar sense of the word, but actually it is purely semiotic in character. The piece of turf is a sign, or token, standing for the whole estate. The winged wheel worn by railway officials is not a symbol of the railway, but a sign that distinguishes the personnel of the railway system.” (Ibid, para. 814)

Elaborating on his own example Jung explains:

“A symbol always presupposes that the chosen expression is the best possible description or formulation of a relatively unknown fact, which is none the less known to exist or is postulated as existing. Thus, when the badge of a railway official is explained as a symbol, it amounts to saying that this man has
something to do with an unknown system that cannot be differently or better expressed than by a winged wheel.” (Ibid)

The following example from Jung, dealing with ‘abstract’ and religious imagery will show how thin the line between symbol and sign can (or symbolic and semiotic) be, even when it comes to ‘non materialistic’ images such as the ‘symbolic’ cross:

“The interpretation of the cross as a symbol of divine love is *semiotic*, because "divine love" describes the fact to be expressed better and more aptly than a cross, which can have many other meanings. On the other hand, an interpretation of the cross is *symbolic* when it puts the cross beyond all conceivable explanations, regarding it as expressing an as yet unknown and incomprehensible fact of a mystical or transcendent, i.e., psychological, nature, which simply finds itself most appropriately represented in the cross”. (CW 6 para. 815)

From a base in anthropology and comparative-religion Eliade (1991) expresses a view which corresponds with Jung, especially when he emphasises the antiquity and necessity of symbols to man:

“Symbolic thinking is not the exclusive privilege of the child, of the poet or of the unbalanced mind: it is consubstantial with human existence, it comes before language and discursive reason. The symbol reveals certain aspects of reality - the deepest aspects - which defy any other means of knowledge. Images, symbols and myths are not irresponsible creations of the psyche; they respond to a need and fulfill a function, that of bringing to light the most hidden modalities of being. Consequently, the study of them enables us to reach a better understanding of man - of man "as he is", before he has come to terms with the conditions of History.”

---

Both Jung’s and Eliade’s theoretical positions concerning symbols are far from being close to that of a sign. Yet, as we shall see later, symbol and sign have been sharing a great deal of definition perplexity. As far as depth psychology is concerned it is possible that Jung’s and Freud’s different definitions of the terms are to blame, as Freud’s ideas of these are far from matching Jung’s. According to Rycroft’s *Dictionary of Psychoanalysis* a symbol is:

“…something that refers to or represents something else, in contrast to a *sign*, which indicates the presence of something. In this sense, words, emblems, badges are all symbols since they derive their significance from the fact that they refer to something else, their referent, the connection between them and their referents being based on association of ideas and, usually, established by convention. In all these instances, however, the connection between symbol and referent is *conscious*, whereas the psychoanalytical theory of symbolism concerns itself with the unconscious substitution of one image, idea, or activity for another.”72

Psychoanalytically speaking, it is therefore the case that ‘true symbolism’ “arises as the result of intrapsychic *conflict* between the repressing tendencies and the repressed... only what is repressed is symbolized; only what is repressed needs to be symbolized.” (Ibid p. 162)

Looking back at Jung’s examples above, it becomes quite apparent that his signs qualify as symbols within a Freudian definition; Jung’s ‘winged wheel worn by railway officials’ may not even qualify as a sign according to Freud, since it does not indicate the presence of something. Even when concerned with the unconscious substitution of image, idea or activity for another, this substitution is still within the

---

72 Rycroft, Ch. (1972) pp. 162-163
limits of a Freudian view of the unconscious which stems from personal images mostly rejected by trauma. Collective experience is not the pillar of Freud’s unconscious; at least not in the ‘classic’ Freudian theory. Freud himself would change some of his views towards the end of his life and so would follow some of the Neo and Post Freudsians.\textsuperscript{73}

Expanding on the nature of Jung’s symbol, Pietikäinen (1999) presents through a more recent Post-Jungian view two importantly unique implications: “first, a symbolic representation is originally derived from beyond the sphere of cognition, and, second, a symbol is a carrier of meaning, and as such it has its own life cycle.” (p. 87). He also reminds us that for Jung, a sign denotes the "elementary instinctual processes" and it is interpreted semiotically, whereas a symbol denotes "the best possible expression for a complex fact not yet clearly apprehended by consciousness". (In CW 8, p. 75)

Jung, says Pietikäinen:

“…was not interested in developing his ideas concerning signs any further than to the extent it was necessary to distinguish signs from symbols. He never discussed modern theories of language, and Ferdinand de Saussure's much acclaimed semiology, where a sign (Signe) is divided into a signifier… and a signified…did not get any attention from Jung. Probably because de Saussure's semiology and the theories of language in general are concerned with the conventional and conscious uses of linguistic signs (like syntactics and semantics), Jung could not have found himself at home in linguistic disciplines, which refrain from using depth-psychological ideas in their studies or even from considering, e.g., the possible value of Freud's or Jung's dream symbolism for their own studies. Semiology does not agree with Jung's fundamental claim that

\textsuperscript{73} e.g. D. W. Winnicott, Christopher Bollas, Carl Rogers, Erik Erikson, Erich Fromm, Karen Horney, to mention only a few
psychic processes are not primarily linguistic processes.”

Some post-Jungians detect a shifting between the symbolic and the semiotic and stress that “what we understand by the terms semiotic and symbolic has altered considerably over the period between Jung's formulations and the analyses of representation we find today” (Hauke, 2000 p. 163). Hauke believes that “these days, the meaning of the semiotic and the symbolic has reversed” and that “semiotics, symbols, image and representation are, like everything else, slippery terms in post-modern times” (Ibid). It seems that no matter how confusing the subject is or has become, we should rather take a definitive stand when treating psychic processes, especially when attempting to tackle the plurality of the psyche and of image.

5. **Image, Imagery, Imagination: A Perspective of Placement**

“The experience of reality is a product of the psyche's capacity to image”, concludes Kugler in an article titled *Psychic imaging: a bridge between subject and object*, in which he coherently surveys the ‘brief history of image’. Going through the historical voyage of the concept of image, from Plato to Aristotle, Plotinus to Aquinas, Ficino to Bruno, and Descartes to Hume, from Kant to Jung down to post-

---

75 In order to take a precise stand one has to decide whether to take at the post-modern line which accepts this kind of confusion and even puts it as its flagship at times, or to follow 'less permissive' approaches to viewing differences.
structuralism and modern linguistics\textsuperscript{77} - he illustrates how debates about image tend to revolve around the question of \textit{placement} or \textit{spacing} of the image, whether external or internal, metaphysic or material, metaphoric or practical, divine or mundane. Related to this are debates as to whether an image had a prior capacity of creativity or the other way around. Kugler’s historical survey presents the dilemma’s possible solution in the image being finally liberated by Kant, noting:

“In 1781, Kant stunned his colleagues by proclaiming the process of imaging (\textit{Einbildungskraft}) to be the indispensable precondition of all knowledge. In the first edition of his \textit{Critique of Pure Reason}, he demonstrated that both reason and sensation, the two primary terms in most theories of knowledge up to this point, were \textit{produced, not reproduced, by imaging}”\textsuperscript{78}

Following this line of thought we may adopt the idea that image pre-existed knowledge and is a psychic necessity for the construction of it; knowledge results from the psyche’s capacity of \textit{imaging}, being a process of engaging images in creating it. Knowledge is consciousness. After Kant, claims Kugler, ‘psychic images could no longer be denied a central place in modern theories of knowledge, art, existence, and psychology. With this epistemological shift, mental image ceases to be viewed as a copy, or a copy of a copy, and now assumes the role of ultimate origin and creator of meaning and of our sense of existence and reality. \textit{The act of imaging creates our consciousness which then provides the illumination of our world}’ (emphasis mine).

Kugler concludes that:

\textsuperscript{77} See also Kugler P. (2002)
\textsuperscript{78} Ibid, p. 78-79
“The relation between reason and image has come a long way since early Greek thought. As we enter the nineteenth century a more peaceful rapport between the two begins to be established. Kant's liberation of image led in the nineteenth century to the spawning of powerful new movements in art and philosophy”

A hundred years after Kant, Freud begun to

“…explore the recesses of the human mind through an analysis of psychic images. Dreams, fantasies, and associations were carefully examined in an attempt to understand how psychic images are involved in personality development, psychopathology, and our experience of the past, present and future” (Ibid).

But instead of adhering to Freud’s view of mental images as representatives of instincts, Jung embraced the approach of imaging as a primary phenomenon, “an autonomous activity of the psyche, capable of both production and reproduction”.

And while Kant assumed his categories to ‘provide the a priori structures necessary for reason itself’, Jung ‘extended the subtle implications of Kant's Critique of Pure Reason to the realm of depth psychology, positing archetypes as the a priori categories of the human psyche,’ (Ibid.):

“One could also describe these forms as categories analogous to the logical categories which are always and everywhere present as the basic postulates of reason. Only, in the case of our "forms," we are not dealing with categories of reason but categories of the imagination . . . The original structural components of the psyche are of no less surprising uniformity than are those of the body. The archetypes are, so to speak, organs of the pre-rational psyche. They are eternally inherited forms and ideas which have no specific content. Their specific content

---

79 Ibid, p. 79
80 Ibid, p. 80
only appears in the course of the individual's life, when personal experience is taken up in precisely these forms.” (CW 11, para. 845)

The quest for the ‘true’ image and a clear concept of it seems to be approached through its assumed placement, location and relativity to either the psyche or the divine (when these are not equated, philosophically and psychologically). Following Jung’s ideas the images are the building blocks of the psyche; in fact, image is psyche.

As such it is originally not a mere representative of anything else but the very ‘image of itself’. Being the psyche and its building blocks at the same time indicates that image does not adhere to one form of either-or (e.g. visual and not auditory). This allows the other ‘formats’ to live alongside each other – mental image with concrete representation, mind’s-eye with dream fantasy as realities of a psychological processes. The existence of psychic realities ‘in addition’ to the linear reality contributes to the symbol-sign relationship as they play along the opposites’ irrationality and irreconcilability. And yet, this confusing relationship does not call for an either-or solution – symbol or sign, psychic image or external presentation – as both opposites participate in creating energy.

---

81 Jung can be very confusing when mixing or interchanging psyche with God, especially when expressed through the archetype of the Self (with capital S). This thesis will concentrate on the psyche and leave God to the theologians.
6. The Autonomous Ways of Images: Dreams and Synaesthesia

6.1 Dreams

Images in dreams appear to us in a wide scope and variety of forms, from an accurate rendering of objects and people known to us to distorted and non-realistic apparitions with which we might be totally unfamiliar. All the above may be acting and interacting in a range of stories, plots and appearances, again from very simply ‘linear’ dramas to very complex ones, when time and space do not adhere to the ego’s logic by abandoning any sense of linear continuity. Both Freud and Jung agree that the messages in dreams are of an unconscious nature; furthermore, this faculty of the psyche (the unconscious) is expressing and revealing what is unknown to consciousness as images. However, from this general agreement Freud and Jung then divert to adopt different positions concerning two main issues: a) the meaning and interpretation of the dream message, and b) the purpose of it. For Freud the meaning of the dream is what Jung would call ‘semiotic’, an image standing for another. Most of the time there are many ‘obvious’ sets of meaning to each so-called symbol; not surprisingly they are mainly sexual.82 Since the meaning is ‘straight forward’83 then the purpose is similarly so – indicating to unknown, repressed ‘true’ meaning now revealed as a little enigmatic drama. Once realised and became known, the way ahead to healing opens. Although Jung also can sometimes be accused of ‘reductionism’ in his way of understanding dreams, his views here are intrinsically more complex and open. While claiming that the dream depicts the situation (both conscious and

---

82 As Freud’s idea on life-energy is mainly of sexual nature and in pursuit of pleasure  
83 Maybe not directly to the dreamer, but allegedly to the learned analyst…
unconscious) as it is, the symbolic attitude permits almost a non-restrictive interpretation view than the semiotic one. The dream images can resemble known figures/objects from our conscious life and/or the personal unconscious level of the psyche, yet they can emerge from a collective and totally unknown matrix. Both the former and the latter can mix and mingle and even metamorphose into one and the same or one another. The connecting elements of time and space may become very loose, thus making the images more complex and confusing for the conscious psyche to handle. Jung’s interpretation of dreams is not of a fixed, language-like expression.\(^8^4\)

While needing to delve into humanity’s spiritual resources – i.e. myth, fairy tales, and religion – for possible clues into collective images, the personally known images are treated in relation to the dreamer’s associations, bearing in mind that once recognised they may change in the course of the dream, not only in shape and location but in interchanging meanings. Thus, while in Freud’s understanding dream images tend to have fixed meanings, they behave as a language, hence ‘semiotic’; Jung’s on the other hand, treat these dream images as blocks\(^8^5\) of a flexibly open communication between conscious and unconscious, where symbols are the mediators.

Defined as “a spontaneous self-portrayal, in symbolic form, of the actual situation in the unconscious,”\(^8^6\) Jung saw the dream also as compensatory to consciousness.

“In contrast to Freud, whom he felt looked at dreams only from a casual standpoint, Jung spoke of them as psychic products that could be seen either from a causal or a purposeful point of view… The causal point of view tends

---

\(^8^4\) Jung’s depiction of specific suggestions is expressed so compellingly that he at times sounds as ‘fixated’ as Freud was. Fortunately he does not close the ‘meaning’ road to movement through the dreamer’s input. Unfortunately many of his followers remained with the old compelling fixation.

\(^8^5\) Described by Samuels as ‘the best possible expression of still unconscious facts’ See Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 49

\(^8^6\) (CW 8. para. 505)
toward uniformity of meaning, he wrote, a sameness of interpretation, and tempts one to assign a fixed significance to a symbol, while the purposeful point of view 'perceives in the dream image the expression of an altered psychological situation. It recognises no fixed meaning of symbols’” (CW 8, para. 471).87

6.2 Synaesthetic Imaging

Synaesthesia is a phenomenon of cross-sensory interaction, the most familiar of which is the cross between the visual and the auditory senses. It deals with quite rare pairing of senses ‘crossing the border’ into another sense’s ‘territory’. Although scarcely mentioned, and when mentioned in an apropos manner by Jung, and despite being still generally observed as a curiosity, this phenomenon can shed some clues and thoughts as for the validity of images as ‘seen’ through other senses than the visual. This cross-platform imaging, though not to be found regularly in everyday life may lead to a wider understanding of the imaging activity of the psyche.

Being completely distinct from conscious visualization, Synaesthesia is a peculiar phenomenon of sense border-crossing, where one sensory modality ‘lends itself’ to another, thus reverting, converting, and/or transporting images between senses. These are the intriguing cases of hearing colours, tasting numbers and smelling music. Though not yet fully accepted as a scientific phenomenon and even rejected sometimes as nothing but coincidental oddity, this occurrence has raised enough wonder, as more and more cases were drawing attention to this phenomena. This

87 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 48
occurrence is a rather compelling and involuntary psychological process.\textsuperscript{88} When Synaesthesia occurs, the following conditions may apply:

1. Synaesthesia is involuntary, and cannot be suppressed.
2. The sensations are real. They are actually experienced by the sense that is stimulated.
3. The synaesthetic reactions are consistent and discrete.
4. They are memorable.
5. They evoke a strong emotion and conviction that the sensation was felt, or tasted, or seen, depending on the sense.\textsuperscript{89}

Martino and Marks (2001) make a distinction between ‘strong’ and weak’ cases of Synaesthesia, in which the strong case is characterized by a vivid image in one sensory modality responding to stimulation in another one and the weak case is characterized by cross-sensory correspondences expressed through language, perceptual similarity, and perceptual interactions during information processing.\textsuperscript{90} Yet most research done into this phenomenon (or rather phenomena, due to its diversity and plural varieties) since the 19\textsuperscript{th} century [Baron-Cohen, S. & Harrison, John E. (1997)] has pursued the neurological causes and examined the psychological outcome less. Unfortunately, Freud, Jung and their contemporaries hardly mentioned it at all.\textsuperscript{91}

\textsuperscript{88} Throughout three of his novels (1813, 1815, 1822), 19\textsuperscript{th} century novelist and musician E. T. A. Hoffmann presented his alter ego disguised as moody, antisocial composer Johannes Kreisler, a musical genius whose creativity is hindered by excessive sensibility, of which Synaesthesia (“seeing” music as colours in his case) is a disturbance and blessing at the same time.
\textsuperscript{89} In “Psychologist World” (http://www.psychologistworld.com/issue/synesthesia.php) Viewed July 2010
\textsuperscript{90} Martino and Marks (2001), p. 61. The notion of image in a sensory modality opens yet another gate to the acceptance of images as unique properties of each separate sense, beyond the ‘visual-only’.
\textsuperscript{91} Jung mentions Synaesthesia in an à propos manner, referring to it as ‘colour hearing’ when speaking about fusion of psychological functions (CW 6 para. 684). In CW 2 (para. 139), dealing with Word
Referring mainly to the sound-colour pairing of sense crossing, as it is the strongest and most detectable variation of Synaesthesia in many researches (at least statistically), colour-hearing, known also as chromaesthesia (a form of Synaesthesia in which non-visual stimulation results in the experience of colour sensations) is yet awaiting more psychological research in addition to the ongoing neurological ones. One of this phenomenon’s definitions reads:

“1. Generally and literally, a form of Synaesthesia in which non-visual stimuli produces the experience of colour sensation. 2. More specifically, the experiencing of colour with auditory stimuli. Meaning 2 is usually intended; hence coloured-hearing and coloured-audition are synonyms.”92

The notion of intention (above, 2nd meaning) may imply that Martino and Marks’ division into ‘strong’ and ‘weak’ synaesthetic motion might be too extreme to allow the whole synaesthetic experience to become a branch of image-processing psychic phenomenon rather just a neurological peculiarity. The events of Synaesthesia, in all its varieties (and maybe even more so in the case of chromaesthesia), do resemble some of the peculiarities that happen in dreams, where images do not necessarily adhere to linearity, time-and-space and visualisation. This phenomenon may be of a great help in understanding the non-visual image and the image’s non-linearity in its own process-cum-image.

---

Association theory and tests we read: “A special peculiarity of this subject is the occasional occurrence of marked synesthesias (audition colorée) which influences the reaction”. 92 Reber, A. S. and Reber, E. S. (2001) p. 119
7. **The Non-Visual Image**

The characteristics of the image now allowed a wider scope - both substantial and ‘behavioural’ - due to the duality and plurality of the psyche’s structure and its conscious-unconscious processes as shown by Jung - and in light of its ‘behaviour’ in these processes we can assume the image to be expressed both visually and/or via other senses. Even though the case of chromaesthesia reveals a greater ‘familiarity’ for this type of image cross-over shifting, it might be possible, following further research that other sensory modalities will reveal further flexibility of the image in the psychological processes of the mind. Following the Jungian ideas of the image as a building block (or a ‘still unconscious fact’) we can also assume that the process is its own substance – the psyche’s capacity of image-making (encompassing imagery and imagination, conscious and unconscious), as psyche itself is – Image. Image is not restricted to one sense only, as it is both a concept and an idea at the same time - essences that include senses and beyond. This psychic imaging process is indeed a bridge between subject and object, conscious-unconscious, internal-external. Responding to Jung’s thought that the symbolic process is an experience in images and of images and that there would be no symbols without images, Samuels (1997) expands this by claiming that "before something can become a symbol it has to be an image" (a little warning worthy of noting); this warning goes on to say that… looking at symbols in an academic manner …makes them into something less than images by removing them from any specific context, mood or scene… If we look at an image from a symbolic viewpoint, we instantly limit it by generalisation and convention.”

---

93 “Movement of images toward their realisation is a psychic process which happens to us personally.” Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 73
We should, then, treat the image as such and use its symbols as mediators wanting to bridge its opposites, or signs as indicators for the here-and-then. The following Part II will attempt to do exactly this in treating music as image.

*   *   *

- 47 -
PART II

MUSIC AS IMAGE: THE ENCOUNTER OF VISUAL AND NON VISUAL IN FILM

1. Music as Image: An Emotive Introduction

Having established the Jungian and post-Jungian views on image – the psychological and concrete, linear and non-logical, external and internal, conscious and unconscious – we can now attempt to investigate the non-visual image. In this specific investigation we shall deal with sound as image in general and with music as image in particular. We will be treating music as a form of organised sound, a sound governed by systemic patterns and structures. The main endeavour will be the investigation of the phenomenon of music in film (usually referred to as film-music) where the non-visual image acts alongside and with reference to the visual image to create the experience of film-as-a-whole.94

In his ‘Chronicle of My Life’ composer Igor Stravinsky95 states that:

"Music is, by its very nature, powerless to express anything at all, whether a feeling, an attitude of mind, a psychological mood, a phenomenon of nature. If, as is nearly always the case, music appears to express something, this is only an illusion and not a reality"
The first half of the above declaration is quite straightforward and easy to accept, as music is not a language\textsuperscript{96} nor does it come pregnant with its own built-in meaning(s) – ‘by its very nature’. Yet Stravinsky’s use of the terms ‘illusion’ and ‘reality’ is confusing, especially to the psychological mind. For the psyche, any external agent that triggers emotion of inner dynamics, of sign and symbol (conscious and/or unconscious) is neither an illusion nor a linear reality. If, however, it referred to fantasy and realities the expression triggered by music would count as an external phenomenon starting a whole new imaging process, a process that creates individual (sometimes based on collective) image experience. Referring to the thoughts of Jean-François Lyotard, Clark (1982) draws our attention to the fact that:

“…art is not meant to reconcile, to reveal or to tell the truth. Where language is understood to do these things, music ("another artifice", "another game") is not language. It might be said, of course, that language too is its own end, narrating its own history. This would be less false to music, but would require reconstituting our view of language so as to collapse the syntax/semantics model altogether.”\textsuperscript{97}

If music is not a language and it can not express anything at all, as Stravinsky believed, why has the human mind been engaging with the quest of meaning in music for so long? In Jungian terms the nearest aspect of meaning to be considered can be related to the \textit{numinous} effect. Derived from the Latin \textit{numen} (will, the active power of the divine) the term was coined in 1917 by the German theologian Rudolf Otto. For Jung the numinous was a concept that named and circumscribed certain dynamic and constraining psychic events through which the subject became linked to an object that was "completely other" and could not be understood intellectually. Indeed, conscious

\textsuperscript{96} See Clark (1982): \textit{Is Music a Language?} Comparing several views, concluding with a certain ‘No’

\textsuperscript{97} Clark (1982), p.203
will has no hold over the numinous object, which is experienced as indescribable and which "puts the subject into a state of amazement [being dumbstruck], or passive submission." When wishing to exclude God, the Divine and the Holy from the equation we still get the ‘otherness’, bigger-than-life ‘awe inspiring’ feeling towards an object or an event (music in our specific case) which is capable of overwhelming and of detaching the perceiver’s intellectual faculties when encountering the numinous. The ensuing attempt to ‘describe’ the feeling of this experience, will have to use the best vocabulary it may find at the person’s disposal in order to get as close as possible to the nature of the experience. Trying to find meaning in music is then likely to be a similar attempt to hold on to a numinous effect. This effect is highly elusive yet very much present.

Leonard B. Meyer (1956) had stated that:

“The differentia between the affective response and the intellectual response to music lies in the dispositions and beliefs which the listener brings to musical experience rather than in the musical processes which evoke the responses.”

This can be read as standing for the attempted meaning-attachment phase but not to the immediate moment of encounter.

There is no doubt that music has the capacity to evoke emotion in the listener, yet it can not be taken for granted that it does this automatically and/or provokes emotion unwillingly by bypassing the conscious/cognitive faculties of the psyche. Describing

Angel, (2005)

Jung’s use of the term numinous is mostly religious or religiously God-related. For him even the term ‘spiritual’ relates to the above only. My usage of the term(s) refers strictly to the meanings of ‘otherness’ a term that contains great powers without the need for any god or religious value.

music as a link between cognition and emotion, Krumhansl (2002) believes that “the emotional effect of music raises a number of basic psychological questions” among which are: “1) what is it in the music that causes the emotion? and 2) are musical emotions like other emotions?”\textsuperscript{101} It is an attempt to trace the musical emotion’s difference to and uniqueness in comparison with other ‘types’ of emotion. But the key question before trying to answer these questions must be what is emotion? There are endless definitions and attempts at addressing this ‘obvious’ term – and yet each leading in different directions. In his book “The Subtlety of Emotions” Ben-Ze’ev (2000) spends over 30 pages discussing the definition of emotion, only to come up with no clear answer that can cover all that he has discussed. One of his conclusions claims that "although emotions punctuate almost all the significant events in our lives, the nature, causes and consequences of the emotions are among the least understood aspects of human experience”.

Jung emphasises the antiquity and quasi-primitive nature of emotion and its closeness to the instincts. He postulates that emotion “is not an activity of the individual but something that happens to him”:

“Affects\textsuperscript{102} occur usually where adaptation is weakest, and at the same time they reveal the reason for its weakness, namely a certain degree of inferiority and the existence of a lower level of personality. On this lower level with its uncontrolled or scarcely controlled emotions one behaves more or less like a primitive, who is not only the passive victim of his affects but also singularly incapable of moral judgment.”\textsuperscript{103}

\textsuperscript{101} Krumhansl (2002) p. 45
\textsuperscript{102} According to Freud, ‘affect’ and ‘emotion’ differ. Whereas the former is regarded as affixed to ideas, the latter is regarded as valid, independent experience. See Roycroft (1972) p. 4
\textsuperscript{103} Jung, CW 9ii, Chapter II – The Shadow; para 15. Jung confused these terms frequently; even in this quote it is quite perplexing to detect which is ‘affixed’ and which is an ‘independent’ second (or alternative) reality.
He also refers to the ‘images concealed in the emotions’ and our need to ‘translate’ the emotions into those images. The proximity to soma is yet another indication to the emotion’s direct connection with the realm of the instincts, where body and psyche link and perplex at the same time. “Emotions” – says Jung – “are not detachable like ideas or thoughts, because they are identical with certain physical conditions and are thus deeply rooted in the heavy matter of the body.”  

He believes that emotion is the chief source of ‘all becoming-conscious’; we may accordingly assume that feeling, which he regards to be a function of the conscious mind, working in an opposite manner to the unconscious image contents of the emotion it is attached to in creating the process of becoming conscious. This is, in a way, a process based on autonomously ‘stirred-up’ conflict. Yet,

“Conflict engenders fire, the fire of affects and emotions, and like every other fire it has two aspects, that of combustion and that of creating light. On the one hand, emotion is the alchemical fire whose warmth brings everything into existence and whose heat burns all superfluities to ashes (prunes superfluitates comburit). But on the other hand, emotion is the moment when steel meets flint and a spark is struck forth, for emotion is the chief source of consciousness. There is no change from darkness to light or from inertia to movement without emotion.”

Trying to address Krumhansl’s questions above, it is possible to suggest the following:

1) What is it in music that causes the emotion? - Psychoacoustics may be a solid source for understanding elements of sound and tone-combination (music)

105 Jung, CW 9i, para. 179
which may effect (and even affect) the neurological system to perceive and respond collectively or conditionally. Most of those emotions are likely to be mainly triggered at unconscious level. The conditional elements may vary and become different through personal, cultural and social grouping’s experience.

2) Are musical emotions like other emotions? - As music does not contain emotion but rather triggers it, we are bound to regard music like any other sensory trigger of emotion. The conscious, unconscious, personal, collective or cultural ‘bias’ of this trigger is as multifaceted as the output of these trends in other triggers, whether sensory or directly psychological.

The above is true for both sound and its ‘sub-category’ music. Both carry the capacity of triggering an imaging process, both may work on different psychic levels and both are images capable of starting emotive dynamics in the psyche. The psychological attempt to ‘describe’ sound and/or music is a step towards making these images conscious in the best way possible, which is the way of the symbol. Yet, these symbolic attempts turn at times to be semiotic (in the Jungian sense) when the expressed experience has not yet integrated globally. For instance, when a Western person, musically educated or trained listens to a piece of classical music then describes it as “romantic, agitating and un-calming”, this description may ‘fall on deaf ears’ to another person whose musical background has excluded and/or avoided the classical music tone characteristic. The latter may describe these sounds in adjectives such as “annoying, weird, boring” etc’. And yet, both persons may find some more in common when facing a classical music-image while watching a film. In such a case of the encounter between a visual image and a non-visual image (music in this case), the lack (or shortage) of symbolic expression on one side may be compensated by the other. In any case the feelings stemming from the encounter will always stress the
personal over the collective, as the symbolic/semiotic emotional affect goes from the unconscious through the individual’s experience towards the conscious realisation of the ‘experience-as-whole’ – in this case through picture-sound-music. Hence, the ‘globalisation’ and ‘isolation’ of a certain non-visual imagery is not a viable task; two different people might still see or hear different ‘meanings’ especially when emotion and emotional expression are concerned. The film creator’s intention may or may not touch the ‘musical ear’ of audiences, thus paving a wider way for an audience-orientated approach to the study of film music.

Arguing with the cognitivist position regarding the source of emotion in music Radford (1989) confesses to being puzzled about his own music-emotion ‘soul search’ when he writes “I am absolutely persuaded that Mozart's music is morally superior to Tchaikovsky’s without being at all clear what this could mean…”106 He questions whether ‘sad’ music makes the listener sad, and ‘angry’ music makes him or her angry. Yet his conclusions may bring forth more intriguing puzzlement:

“If (listening to) angry music does make one angry it is not because it is angry! ...angry music may make one angry. Having to listen to any music that is inflicted on me may make me angry.” (Ibid)

The case of ‘sad’ music is explained thus:

“…the emotivist need not be agreeable to the view that listening to sad music makes you sad simply in the way in which a change in one’s hormonal levels can make one agitated or sad. The hormonal change causes you to be sad, and explains why

106 Radford (1989), p.69
you are sad, but it is not what you are sad about (and neither, of course, is the music). Either you are just feeling sad, but not about anything in particular, or you, in your hormonally generated sadness, find something to be sad about, an "object." You may then find reasons for the sadness which are rationalizations of it (even though they may be good reasons for your being sad).” (Ibid)

While affect may be triggered by any object its outcome may be reflected - as emotion - on an object, which in the above case becomes 'something to be sad about'.

2. Music as Image: Its Placement in Film

While the unconscious mind handles images as autonomous entities - and is therefore capable of expressing them in any combination of time and space - consciousness seems to demonstrate more linear 'preference' for sequential images. Driven by the order-loving quality of the Ego, consciousness will always try to put images in sequence as much as possible in order to create a narrative continuum. In film a visual storyline may maintain a fully linear continuum alongside the conscious model or it may deliberately break it following the way the film creator perceives the imagery. The sound-image may be 'a different story' in the sense that the non-visual may create a different image-interpretation by the viewer/listener from that the creators intended.

107 See fn. 34 above
108 See Part I on dreams
109 Intention, expectation and interpretation of both sides of the cinematic experience – creators and viewers – will be dealt with later in this part.
The matter of sound’s placement in film may exert a great impact over the narrative and the visual imagery. In investigating this vast field of sound-in-film Gorbman (1980, 1988) and Chion (1994, 1999, and 2009) have employed a generic division of diegetic and non-diegetic sound, relating to both sound (general) and music. Gorbman (1980) defines "diegesis" as “being the narratively implied spatiotemporal world of the actions and characters.” Diegesis and non-diegesis relate directly to the placement of sound and/or music within the narrative; these may be an integral part of it (diegetic) or outside it (non-diegetic). A diegetic sound can be a direct dialogue, a music played from a radio which is part of the scene, a car motor sound of a car seen on screen etc', while ‘background music’ (usually referred to as underscore), voice-over by a person not seen on screen and sounds belonging to objects not seen are examples for non-diegetic sources. Quoting the French filmologues Genette and Souriau, Gorbman concludes that their definitions “agree that the diegesis means the space-time universe and its inhabitants referred to by the principal filmic narration. Souriau's wording shows a more exacting concern for the fine details.”

Chion (1994) subdivides the diegesis event into more precise sound-events-in-film by coining a range of specialist terms and categories. Firstly, there is Acousmatic sound, an invisible sound source, e.g. radio, television, telephone etc’ that emits sound without showing the emitting agent. This is the opposite of Visualised sound, a sound accompanied by the sight of its source or cause). Thirdly there is Empathetic sound - sound or music whose mood matches the corresponding visual images (these may match by participating in the visual action, rhythm or tone), and fourthly its opposite, Anemphatetic sound, sound or music that "seems to exhibit conspicuous indifference

110 Gorbman (1980) p. 195
to what is going on in the film's plot, creating a strong sense of the tragic (e.g., a radio continues to play a happy tune even as the character that first turned it on has died).”

Finally Chion forges the term Synchresis from the conflation of two terms – synchronism and synthesis. Synchresis refers to a mental fusion between a sound image and a visual image when these occur at exactly the same time. As a sound technique synchresis may vary from combining visual with very accurate audio, to the extreme of using sound completely ‘estranged’ from the visual image. (For example: a person tiptoes barefoot on screen, while the sound heard is of woman’s high heels clicking).

One of Chion’s most powerful observations is that of transsensoriality. By this he means that hearing may not take place solely through the ears, and that seeing may not take place solely with the eyes. Both senses – the auditory and the visual – create a complementary psychic process of vision of a new kind, born of the transcendence created by the encounter of the two images – visual and sound/music. He suggests that:

“…when kinetic sensations organized into art are transmitted through a single sensory channel, through this single channel they can convey all the other senses at once”

The idea of aligning sound with picture (or the other way round) is not unique to film only. This sensory pairing may occur and affects each other in any given situation of everyday life. The unique quality of transsensoriality in film is that it can

---

111 Chion (1994) pp. 8-9
112 Ibid, p. 137. This bears some similarity to Synaesthesia, though does not operate in a similar way.
113 Ibid.
be employed, deployed and manipulated in artificial ways that do not often occur in the ‘natural’ form of everyday life. This transcendence of senses metaphorically can parallel Jung’s ‘Transcendental Function’, a function of the psyche that arises from the tension between consciousness and the unconscious and supports their possible connectivity:

“The tendencies of the conscious and the unconscious are the two factors that together make up the transcendent function. It is called "transcendent" because it makes the transition from one attitude to another organically possible.”114

Metaphorically compared115 to other opposites - consciousness vs. unconsciousness, thesis vs. antithesis - the parity of sound/picture creates a resembling transcendent function. Moreover:

“If the mediatory product remains intact, it forms the raw material for a process not of dissolution but of construction, in which thesis and antithesis both play their part. In this way it becomes a new content that governs the whole attitude, putting an end to the division and forcing the energy of the opposites into a common channel.”116

Thus placement (or alignment) of sound/music with pictures is no longer a film technique only. It is first and foremost a resulting psychological aspect, working, at times autonomously, between conscious and unconscious absorption of images. At this junction we may experience ‘viewing a sound’ and ‘hearing a picture’ – a pair of

---

114 Jung CW 8, para. 145
115 It is metaphorical rather than actual, as sound and picture are not basically opposites like conscious and unconscious are, nor they are thesis and antithesis; rather, they operate as different complementaries. In the case of visual/non-visual these images may contain the metaphor of opposition.
116 Jung CW 6, para. 827
parallel (even though paradoxical) experiences that change our cinematic experience from moving-pictures-with-sound to film-as-a-whole.117

Within this sound-placement paradigm Chion observes yet another powerful film technique which he titles acousmêtre. He defines this technique as follows:

“The acousmêtre is this acousmatic character whose relationship to the screen involves a specific kind of ambiguity and oscillation… We may define it as neither inside nor outside the image. It is not inside, because the image of the voice's source - the body, the mouth - is not included. Nor is it outside, since it is not clearly positioned offscreen in an imaginary "wing," like a master of ceremonies or a witness, and it is implicated in the action, constantly about to be part of it.”118

Stating that voices of clearly detached narrators are not acousmêtres, Chion explains his choice for inventing such a ‘barbarous’ term:

“…I wish not to be limited to terms for voices or sounds but rather to explore an entire category of characters specific to the sound film, whose wholly specific presence is based on their characters’ very absence from the core of the image.”119

This category of characters absent from the core of the image can correspond, metaphorically again, to Jung’s notion of archetypal images as it strives at the

---

117 This ‘reversal-sensory-functioning’ outcome may contribute another point to the yet-attempted endeavour towards understanding of Synaesthesia (See Part I).
118 Chion (1994), p. 129
119 Ibid.
collectivity behind the specific images. This may also support Chion’s own definition of the acousmêtre as deriving ‘mysterious powers from being heard and not seen’.

These two cinematic sound techniques (transsensoriality and acousmêtre as suggested by Chion) lead towards a new understanding of the interactive powers of visual and non visual in film. Although referred to in technical terms, they rely on the psyche’s capacity to deal with visual and non-visual images in a unique way. This interactivity starts from the sensory faculty of the eye and the ear but is then left to the psyche to connect and add its own interpretation. Consequently, all the elements of the film amalgamate into a broader experience of film-as-a-whole rather than remaining as separate and distinct elements. The film is no longer a story with sound attached nor is it images accompanied by music.

2.1 Music and Emotional Sub-Placement

Recent researches in the psychology of music concerning music emotion have been trying to ‘map’ and classify emotions invoked by music, a conscious attempt at ‘organising’ emotions even on a non-linear unconscious levels. The tight rope on which this attempt has been walking can be found in the notion of ‘perceived emotions’, defined as “emotions that are represented by music and perceived as such by the listener”. Yet – and fairly enough – the following puts the attempt and the dilemma on a more balanced path:

---

120 Ibid p. 221 (glossary) Emphasis mine.
“An overview of the literature implies that the border between the two alternatives – emotion recognition and emotion experience – may be somewhat blurred in reality, and it has even been suggested that the two alternatives could be seen as opposite extremes of a continuum… In addition recent empirical studies have found more similarities than differences between the two…” (Ibid)

Three principal emotion ‘models’ have been constructed following the above line of thought – a) discrete models, b) different dimensional models and c) domain-specific models. Within the discrete emotion model – the basic emotion model – “all emotions can be derived from a limited number of universal and innate basic emotions such as fear, anger, disgust, sadness and happiness” (Ibid.). Yet:

“It still remains to be clarified whether models and theories designed for utilitarian emotions – such as the basic emotion model – can also be applied in an aesthetic context such as music. It has been argued and empirically demonstrated that a few primary basic emotions seem inadequate to describe the richness of the emotional effects of music. (Zentner et al., 2008).” (Ibid)

In psychic-energy terms this model may be close to an archetypal and instinctual emotional response by the individual. Dimensional modes, referring to an emotional energy are created by a tension between several (two, three or more) triggered ‘nodes’. In the case of film, these nodes can exist inside the narrative or be generated between an emotional point in the film and the viewer’s individual and spontaneous emotional-energy emission. The specific domain model, focusing on a unique object, event or memory, may correspond with aspects of emotion triggered by either a private, individual event or by a cultural/group autonomously influencing the individual emotional response to that ‘domain’.
If we wish to exploit the above system outside its mapping and organising aspects we may benefit by using the models described above as paths of emotional sub-placement, where music (as well as sound, dialogue and picture) triggers the level or mode of a emotional 'type' created autonomously in the viewer at given times.

2.2 Volume: Relative, Internal and External

The paired concept of diegetic/non-diegetic in film holds such a strong position that some may have started to feel uncomfortable with it. That may be due to what scholars see as ‘simplistic interpretation’ of Chion’s terminology and ideas, or maybe due to the lack of inclusion of sound/music volume (loudness) as a component inside the spatial concept of his theory. And indeed, the sound/music volume within the cinematic narrative is an essential ingredient in the spatial placement, playing a significant role in the narrative or sound-music psychology of the experience of film-as-a-whole.

David Neumeyer (2009) argues that:

“the diegetic/nondiegetic pair is now well embedded in film music discourse, agreeing with Henry M. Taylor's assertion that "by now this terminology has been so well established that it would be futile not to use it in its accustomed sense," I will argue further that the terminology is useful: despite its several difficulties, the distinction represented in diegetic/nondiegetic is still fundamental to material relations of image and sound and to narrative functions of music in the sound film. I will propose a model that defines and positions diegesis in relation to spatial anchoring and narration with a goal of sorting out
the functions to make them more reliable for the interpretation of film music. In this model, the diegetic lies in the middle of a process of cognition and interpretation, with the stages anchoring --> diegesis --> narration” (pp. 15-28).

The first diversity “concerns the viewer's relation to the loudspeakers, the second deals with the relation of film sound to the world of the film, and the third to the relation of sound to narrative process (or narrative unfolding). In this model, synchronization/counterpoint is analyzed in parallel with diegetic/nondiegetic” (Ibid.). Although referring to the physical distance between the viewer/listener and the sound-producing device and not to the sound-distance relativity inside the film-as-a-whole, the subject of volume is being explored. The inner sound/music volume in comparison to other sounds and music and in relation to continuity has to be taken into account, as it triggers and builds the viewer/listener’s interpretation of it as such and as a part of the entire cinematic experience. This volume is by no means a mere technical parameter.

Concurrently with the development of sound and music reproduction from the ‘centralistic’ Mono through the ‘dual’ Stereo into the recent variations of the potent ‘divide/unite’ Surround Sound so has the simple ‘high-low’ and ‘loud-quiet’ sound technique evolved into a paramount element of placement in film. With the more recent advances – those of the Surround Sound – both the internal and external positions of distance and proximity acquired ‘new’ dimensions, both within the mimetic aspect and that of a deliberate reality-distortion of sound and music via placement.

---

123 Italics mine.
In attempting to elaborate on ‘the relationship between the sound field presented to the listener and what he actually hears’ Gerzon (1974) refers to the confusion in scientific finding and contradictory information regarding the sound frequency-borders of ‘listening’ only to arrive at a more psychoacoustic statement that “the ears must use a number of different methods of sound localization, possibly deciding on a “majority verdict” in the case when different mechanisms would, if used in isolation, give differing results”. He adds that:

“In the presence of such contradictory information, the apparent localization of a sound also depends on the experience and expectations of the listener and on the type of attention he is paying to the sound”.

Not forgetting that the above quotations date back to the 1970s, long before the advent of Surround Sound, we still may notice and wish to endorse the individual variety of music and music-placement experience with the notion that:

“Because most matrix four-speaker systems give highly ambiguous sound position information to the listener’s ears, the results obtained will depend on the individual listener. Some listeners will learn to assign sounds to their “correct” positions with experience, and others will not”.124

By accepting the “listener’s ears” axiom we may have now added another layer of individual difference beyond the individual interpretation of music. As modern sound technology allows also some ‘non-realistic’ placements of music (e.g. “beyond the speakers”, “coming from above” and moving erratically from side to side, to mention

---

124 This notion refers to the 70’s “Quadro” experimentations, long before the 5.1 and other recent Surround-Sound applications.
but a few), it contributes to the sense of ‘abstract’ and more unconscious processes running through the psyche’s participation in the film-as-a-whole experience.

3. **Music as Image: Its Realities and Functions**

Zuckerkandl (1969) argued that music had a ‘special kind of reality’. On one hand it is outside us, located in the external world, yet it is neither a physical phenomenon nor a projection of psychic states. According to Zuckerkandl what we hear is neither traceable to the properties of sound waves, nor can we define hearing as a ‘hallucination’ in which psychological responses become objectified. This notion is invaluable to any musical and psychological research into Jung’s multiple realities, presenting music as possessing a potentially ‘independent’ reality that may connect (or not) with the ‘linear’ (here-and-now) reality.\(^{125}\)

While inside our psyche multiple ‘realities’ are more likely to be controlled by the unconscious, this phenomenon can be knowingly and deliberately created and manipulated by the film’s ‘Prima Materia’ (visual, story, sound, music) to reflect the perceptions of its creators. Some of this technology and ideology has already brilliantly elaborated by Chion (1994), especially through his observation of what he would name as *Acousmatic sound, Anemphatetic sound, synchresis and transsensoriality*.\(^{126}\) These few examples make a strong case for the argument that music has deliberate and

\(^{125}\) A research in this subject may open a door to the possible connection between music and autism, where realities (plural) are constantly interactive.

\(^{126}\) See above, para 2: “Music as Image: Its Placement in Film”
desired functions to fulfil within a film, far beyond the casually soothing decorative one or an explicit indication for scene changes.

In her significant book *Unheard Melodies: Narrative Film Music* (1988), Claudia Gorbman attempted to cover the entire functionality of music in film and created this encompassing schema:

1) **Invisibility**: The technical apparatus of nondiegetic music must not be visible.
2) "**Inaudibility**": Music is not meant to be heard consciously. As such it should subordinate itself to dialogue, to visuals—i.e., to the primary vehicles of the narrative.
3) **Signifier of emotion**: Soundtrack music may set specific moods and emphasize particular emotions suggested in the narrative, but first and foremost, it is a signifier of emotion itself.
4) **Narrative cueing**: referential/narrative: Music gives referential and narrative cues, e.g., indicating point of view, supplying formal demarcations, and establishing setting and characters connotative: Music "interprets" and "illustrates" narrative events.
5) **Continuity**: Music provides formal and rhythmic continuity—between shots, in transitions between scenes, by filling "gaps."
6) **Unity**: Via repetition and variation of musical material and instrumentation, music aids in the construction of formal and narrative unity.
7) A given film score may violate any of the principles above, providing that violation is at the service of the other principles.
Some of these building blocks will need revisiting; mainly due to the fact that many studies have been made in this field since 1988. The following ‘commandments’ are now being disputed:

“The complexities and ambiguities that arise from trying to interpret specific instances in films using these binary pairs have led some observers to argue that they restrict analysis unduly, holding attention on a narrow set of formal functional relations and inhibiting a focus on other aspects, such as representation or subjectivity.”  

If one expects that sound “should subordinate itself to dialogue, to visuals - i.e., to the primary vehicles of the narrative” then one ignores the autonomous ‘freedom’ that music can bring into film and its power to attract and affect the audience’s imagination by the powers of its ‘personality’.

In respect to the diegetic/nondiegetic dichotomy, Anahid Kassabian (2001) had already noted that the suggested pair of opposites:

"suggests that film music can be categorized within a dichotomous schema - grossly reduced as either 'in' (diegetic) or 'out' (nondiegetic) of the narrative world of the film. This dichotomy is insufficient; it cannot comfortably describe music that seems to fall 'in between' these categories, much less account for its different character.”  

We must note, though, that Kassabian’s reservation is not of the terms themselves but rather of the rigid ‘pairing’ as opposites. Instead, she proposes to replace the opposition diegetic/nondiegetic with a continuum, "a kind of inverse proportionality

---

in which the more identifiably within the narrative the music is produced, the less liable it is to take its cues from the events of the narrative.”

The second component, that of inaudibility, expecting that “Music is not meant to be heard consciously” may sound artificial, by assuming the capacity to psychologically ‘dictate’ to the viewer/listener in which manner he/she is expected to absorb music in film. Although ‘under-conscious’ hearing of music in a film occurs very often, there are many other instances that do not come under this dictate. Using known songs or known pieces of classical music, for instance, can easily ‘invert’ the hierarchy of conscious/non-conscious absorption between audio and visual in film.

Next, assuming the task of a signifier of emotion, Gorbman states that “Soundtrack music can set specific moods and emphasize particular emotions suggested in the narrative, but first and foremost, it is a signifier of emotion itself.” That might be true and can work this way, however music can be made to dictate mood whose power and capacity are stronger than the narrative itself, thereby ‘adding’ emotional input that the visual way or path can not provide alone.

The referential/narrative, or ‘Narrative cueing’ marks music function in film as a demarcating cue in addition to being an ‘interpreter’ or ‘illustrator’ of narrative events. Indeed, music in film can do all the above, unless it is intended to do the

129 Ibid. pp. 48-49
130 A famous complex case of non-conscious/conscious interchangeability of music in film is Roberta Flack’s song “The First Time Ever I Saw Your Face” featuring in Clint Eastwood’s film “Play Misty for Me” (1971). Originally written in a folk-song style by British political singer/songwriter Ewan MacColl for the singer Peggy Seeger; re-recorded by others throughout the 60s then differently by Roberta Flack in her 1969 album “First Take”, not having great successes. Eastwood put this recording in his love scene with his girlfriend Tobie (Donna Mills). The ‘pairing’ of the song with the visual was so strong that Flack’s song ‘rose to glory’ in the music charts all over the world. The music became a stronger emotion-trigger than its visual counterpart…
opposite or otherwise.131 Cueing by music may be better seen/heard as a type of a
‘local conditioning’, one that has been elaborately built by the creator(s) to ‘trigger’ a
feeling or emotion in the viewer (e.g. motifs, leitmotifs and repeated sequences).

Gorbman’s fifth and six ‘blocks’ are very straight-forward and easily acceptable. Yet the seventh (and last one) is dramatically baffling: It allows any violation of the
above principles “providing that (such) violation is at the service of the other prin-
ciples”. If this is the case, then it raises the question whether music in film
necessitates any principle at all or is it just Gorbman’s sense of flexibility in action…?

Diegesis and non-diegesis are of great importance in understanding film music. Yet
as long as they refer only to ‘inside’ of the narrative or ‘outside’ it, their value in
terms of time and space becomes limited, excluding many assets that psychology
could use more successfully. Sensibly, this pair is usually not seen as a strict
“either/or” dichotomy.132 In an article titled “The Non-Diegetic Fallacy: Film, Music,
and Narrative Space”133 Ben Winters poses the following examples-as-questions to
highlight the problematic of diegesis/non-diegesis:

“In a documentary to accompany the DVD presentation of Indiana Jones and the
Kingdom of the Crystal Skull (Steven Spielberg, 2008), the director asserts:
‘Indiana Jones cannot exist without [its musical] theme. And, of course, that
theme would be nothing without Indiana Jones.’134 It is a statement that few
would disagree with, and yet it highlights a potentially troubling issue for film
musicology. For this musical theme is part of what would be called the film’s

131 E.g., Anemphatic sound and Synchresis. See above for Chion’s terminology.
132 E.g., Gorbman (1988) on meta-diegesis pp. 22-23; 26; 73 (as ‘point of view’ music) and 166.n
133 Winters, B. (2010)
134 Quoted in the ‘Adventures in Post-Production’ featurette 8:03. Indiana Jones and the Kingdom of
the Crystal Skull Region 2 DVD PHE 9431. The music is by John Williams.
non-diegetic music: in other words, it is considered an instance of sound, ‘whose supposed source is not only absent from the image but is also external to the story world [the diegesis].’

Winters then poses the essential question on the possible or impossible validity of the diegetic-non-diegetic dichotomy:

“How do we deal with this puzzling theoretical distinction when film theory locates other elements that might be considered quintessentially ‘Indy-esque’ (the hat, the bullwhip, the smart one-liners, for example) within the diegesis? Is it a distinction that is at all useful for explaining our experience of this film character, or cinema in general? Or, to invoke another iconic example, does it make sense to distinguish the ‘non-diegetic’ zither music we hear in The Third Man (Carol Reed, 1949) from the rest of the narrative: is it not just as essential to the fictional world of post-war Vienna presented in the film as the image of the Ferris Wheel in the Prater, or the characters of Harry Lime and Holly Martins?”

Notwithstanding the debates concerning diegesis and non-diegesis, the above examples and questions illustrate strongly the fact of the power possessed by music to be inseparable from the narrative, despite or even because it is ‘outside the main body’ of the film, as Gorbman would agree. Winters sets out to explore “the distinction between what lies inside and what lies outside the diegesis, concluding that branding music with the label ‘non-diegetic’ threatens to separate it from the space of the narrative, denying it an active role in shaping the course of onscreen events, and unduly restricting our readings of film”. He continues by arguing that “music’s description in film as ‘non-diegetic’ is both overly reliant on the concept’s

narratological meaning, and representative of an unwillingness to recognize film’s inherent ‘unreality.’” 137

Neumeyer (2000) tried to diffuse the intensity of Gorbman’s diegetic/non-diegetic stiff rule by “identifying it as merely one category for film music analysis among a much longer list of binary pairs” 138 His interactive binary pairs include:

- Diegetic/nondiegetic (or source/background)
- On screen/off screen
- Vocal/instrumental: performance forces
- Rerecording: synchronized/not synchronized
- Sound levels: "Realistic"/unrealistic (for diegetic music); loud/soft (for nondiegetic music)
- Musically continuous/discontinuous
- Musically closed/open
- Formal interaction of cutting and music: yes/no
- Motivation or narrative plausibility: yes/no
- "Pure"/culturally or cinematically coded 139

These additional pairings add flexibility to the space factor of music in film, allowing some psychological points to enter the time/space equation even if only by diffusing the rigidity of either ‘in’ or ‘out’ position.

137 Winters, B. (2010).
138 Smith, J. (2009)
Starting from not-so-rational reasons, one arrives at a ‘rational’ conclusion concerning the black-or-white, either-or dilemma of the diegetic/non-diegetic scheme. Our Ego-led rationale chooses to locate this pair as opposing, or at least seriously different. Yet, with so many individual film cases that do not necessarily adhere to that division, that rationale starts searching its ways back to the ‘less-rational’ realm.

An impressive resolution to that ‘Great Location Dilemma’ is undoubtedly Jim Buhler and Robynn Stilwell’s contribution of the Fantastical Gap.

“The trajectory of music between diegetic and nondiegetic highlights a gap in our understanding, a place of destabilization and ambiguity. The diegetic and nondiegetic are conceived as separate realms, almost like two adjacent bubbles, and there seems to be little possibility of moving from one to the other without piercing the skin that explodes the two "universes," which certainly is one reason for the reliance on the language of "transgression." – says Robynn Stilwell. – “When that boundary between diegetic and nondiegetic is traversed, it does always mean. It is also hardly ever a single moment—one moment we’re in the diegetic realm and in the blink of an eye, like walking through Alice's mirror; we are in the nondiegetic looking-glass world". 140

Over a film-music round table discussion of The Velvet Light Trap141 the ambiguity of diegetic and nondiegetic gave birth to the Fantastical Gap.

“The phrase "fantastical gap" seemed particularly apt for this liminal space because it captured both its magic and its danger, the sense of unreality that always obtains as we leap from one solid edge toward another at some unknown distance and some uncertain stability—and sometimes we're in the air before we know we've left the ground. "Fantastical" can literally mean fantasy

(cinematically, a musical number, dream, or flashback), and in fact this is one implication of the change of state that has begun to be explored by scholars like Rick Altman and David Neumeyer but it can also mean, musically, an improvisation, the free play of possibility.” (Ibid, p. 187)

3.1 Music as Image: Some Functional Observations

Perceived as Image, music in film can fulfil functions one expects of a visual image; its ‘inside’ or ‘outside’ location will definitely contribute to certain image dynamics when encountering the visual image, yet not always at the same intensity. The world in between the ‘extremes’, being a fantastical gap can accommodate many variables that may stretch and push aside the rigid diegetic/non-diegetic axiom.

The following is an attempt to create a wide framework for the functions one may expect of music-images in film. 

Suggested here are three main categories, all being both independent and yet connected; in many instances they may overlap or transform into an ‘adjacent’ function. These three ‘archetypal’ categories are:

1. INCIDENTAL
2. TRANSITIONAL
3. CONDITIONAL

The very verb ‘expect’ and the noun ‘expectation’ as important psychological parameters in music and film-music will be dealt later in this part.

Part III will also be using these functions to analyse three different films.
The *incidental* main function of film-music is to be ‘involved’ with the ongoing narrative seen on the screen. This category can contain music from within or without the diegesis, as it strives to draw the viewer’s attention to what is happening on the screen ‘right now’; accordingly both diegetic and non-diegetic sources may provide the same. Incidental music thus may be compared loosely to classical programme music\(^{144}\); only in the case of film the music-image will try to ‘attach’ itself to the visual image(s) on the screen instead of the imagined images of a story. As with the two other functions, the incidental music can be repeated to enhance a filmic situation (see Conditional below) or be used as a ‘start point’ to space and time changes (see Transitional). An incidental music sequence may use a repeated motif (or leitmotif) to draw the listener/viewer’s attention, even though (or in addition) this is already in the domain of the Conditional.

The *transitional* function of music-image is to deal mainly with space and time changes taking place on the screen and in the narrative. Attempting to take the spectator through time and/or space (whether linear or otherwise), transitional music may use anything within or without the diegesis as well as using repeats (which, again, border or overlap the transitional with the conditional function). As film has the powerful capacity to leap from time to another and from place to place, transitional music has a quite significant role in psychologically building those leaps in the mind of the viewer, for whom such leaps do not exist in his/her linear (here and now) reality.

---

\(^{144}\) Sometimes defined as “Musical compositions intended to evoke images or remind the listener of events”.
The third function, the *conditional*, should not be mixed and/or mistaken for any behavioural-psychology term of a process (Pavlovian or any other) of a behavioural teaching. Instead, it takes the ‘local’ and temporary response to repetition as a promoter for remembering the last time(s) the repetition appeared, thus connecting the repetition to image(s) that were attached to the former repetition; in short, establishing a conditioned response. In this capacity this function deals with mood creating as well as the conditioned triggers using ‘psychology-led’ musical techniques, such as repeated motifs (from short ‘stabs’ to longer melodies) and creating distinctive colouration, harmony, rhythm or counterpoint to ‘stick’ to and match the signs. Again, as with the other two functions, both diegesis and nondiegesis can work perfectly. As far as creating mood is concerned, the composer may find some specific stylistic limitations, due to the fact that some sounds – or combination of all music ingredients, are publicly accepted and even expected. Yet, it is possible to create the very same moods with newly invented music, as yet unused.

It seems that these three functions of music in film can stand alone for a defined purpose or overlap among them, and even be ‘fantastically-gapped’ in transition from one to another. The diegetic/non-diegetic axis may add to their spatial location (both psychologically and ‘geographically’) as can the physical volume or loudness of the music. These suggested functions (or categories) of music in film allow both the connection, or – when needed and desired – the differentiation among the many elements that the music-image can offer to the film-as-a-whole. The capacity of music both to connect and/or to separate may in a way undermine the over-emphasising of the diegetic/non-diegetic observation but, by the same token, put this pair in a more flexible position as contributing elements in usage and understanding of film-music.
4. Psychological Dimensions of the Film-Music Functions

In a profound research into the psychological element of expectation (in general) Huron (2006) links the phenomenon to music, being a ‘continuous’ expression and thus naturally building up a line of expectation for ‘the next move’ as instilled by the ‘previous’ motion. He tries to discover how the expectation factor might affect music elements individually (e.g. harmony, rhythm, melody, colouration etc’) and also the overall progress of a musical piece as a whole. This psychology of expectation happens to be a pivotal element in film music, as expectation and anticipation are integral to time-based arts and to the bond desired and created between the visual image and the music-image. Huron’s approach explores parameters including predictability, surprise, tension and sense of future as ‘sub-domains’ of expectation from its basic steps to the complex psychological capacity of ‘expecting the unexpected’. If scrutinised through a post-Jungian research, Huron’s theory may add some points into the sensation-intuition dichotomy of Jung’s psychological types with the tension between the opposites creating a ‘third’ element.\(^{145}\)

Yet, the element of expectation and anticipation does not necessarily work continuously inside a film, due to the shift of focus that visual and music-images may express and inflict upon each other at given times. Although believing that “Music seems to elicit strong emotion more reliably and frequently than other art forms”\(^ {146}\), and stating that “…Music unfolds over time and so is capable of engaging the emotions of expectation and expectations realized or dashed more effectively than static forms such as painting…”\(^ {147}\) (while not forgetting to mention that drama,

---

\(^{145}\) See CW 6 and “The Transcendent Function” in CW 8.

\(^{146}\) W.H. Frey: Crying: the Mystery of Tears (Minneapolis, 1985)

\(^{147}\) Sloboda, J.: Affect. In Deutsch, D. et al
dance, film and literature share this feature with music)\textsuperscript{148} – when it comes to the mixing of visual with music-images some rules appear to become somewhat loose. Some explicit examples of music’s “expectation on hold” may be seen in epic war, struggle and fighting grand scenes such as in Indiana Jones or Lord of the Rings among many others. In these cases the viewer’s ear may ‘abandon’ the subtlety of the music’s ‘built-in’ anticipation and concentrate on the visual, where the expectation may build up for the victory of the hero(s) through his/their physical action and progress. Here we can see a classical example of Jung’s difference in conscious attitude among opposing pairs of ‘psychological types’. The Sensation type person (whether extraverted or introverted) is likely to stick with what is happening in the film’s ‘real time’, allowing his senses to carry him forward with the action, while this person’s ‘opposite, the ‘Intuition’ type might be more likely to be drawn to the possibilities yet to come. Jung’s elaborate Typology theory furnishes the foundation to an understanding of the different focuses used by different personalities. In the case of music (including film music) this typology may suggest the necessity to assume more than one way of ‘seeing’ music.\textsuperscript{149}

Aspects including gradually increasing volume (loudness), growing complexity of harmony (or even melody) and rhythm along the time-axis of the music are also important elements in building expectation. These create a ‘quasi-conditional’ preparedness of the ear’s-mind for something to happen. When used in non-film music these may create an expectation for a coming ‘burst’ or any type of climax, but when attached to a visual image the music will ‘lend’ this climax building power to

\textsuperscript{148} Ibid. Emphasis mine
\textsuperscript{149} See PART I for Jung’s Psychological Types theory. See also Jung, CW. 6, Psychological Types. (1921)
the narrative, building the expectation for the next possible event to come. One may want to use an expression such as *filmic crescendo* to describe this audio-visual event. Psychologically speaking, the filmic crescendo is a locally-conditional setting of feeling to expect the unknown or the possibility of things to come. Measured in Jungian terms, the quality and the ‘volume’ of the emotional arousal under a film’s crescendo scene may vary according to the ‘expected’ responses produced in the individual’s psyche according to the ‘psychological type’.

All the above musical elements and their described usage are instrumental in building one of the most frequent elements in many films – the element of tension and suspense. The pairing of the music and visual images in building up tension is unique in its capacity to create a dramatic effect that does not (usually) exist in the here-and-now, everyday reality. Hence a tension-building music can be located in space and placement that the creators may choose, as it does not have a ‘real-life’ parallel to mimic or adhere to. As a result, a tension building in the anticipating psyche of the viewer/listener can be ‘controlled’ with regards to its length, intensity, surprise and release. As music is not (usually) present in real life suspense, it has no ‘rules’ of placement in film; it may precede the visual starting-point, start alongside it, or be intentionally delayed. Such a case is the famous murder scene in Hitchcock’s “Psycho” which starts the high suspense without music. The visual exposes an image creeping towards under-the-shower Lila Crane (Vera Miles); only when the shower curtain is moved and the murderer Norman Bates (Anthony Perkins) begins the brutal knife stabbing does the famous strings shrill start, playing the harsh dissonant glissandi high notes. When Bates leaves, the music ‘steps down’ into low and heavy strings, leaving the spectator not knowing whether Lila is dead or badly wounded. The
certainty of death which follows has no music, just the sound of running shower water, as in the beginning of the shower scene. The question as to whether she is dead or not is yet another ‘trick’ of the opposing psychological types’ mind, the ‘Sensation’ vs. ‘Intuition’ types or the ‘Thinking’ vs. ‘Feeling’.

### 4.1 The Uses of the Overlapping Music Functions

As in the case above, tension and suspense fall into more than one of the categories or functions of film music as described previously.\(^{150}\) They can fulfil both the accidental and the conditional requirements at the same time, as perfectly used in the Hitchcock example discussed above. This ‘duality’ or the capacity of music in film to follow, express and participate in more than only one point or event, is one of the most desirable assets of this branch of music – its capacity to connect and even ‘glue’ ongoing elements rather than divide them or limit their individual functionality. In the Hitchcock-Herrmann case mentioned, the music works on several levels, almost simultaneously. While playing alongside the stabbing scene it seems almost ‘strictly’ accidental, as if ‘describing’ and/or attempting to ‘enhance’ the morbid action of the murder; yet, and due to Herrmann’s exceptionally unique usage of orchestral sound, the affect of horror and fear remains in the viewer’s mind even after the murder action had ended, as if the music is a ‘stand alone’ event that would refuse to let go. This emotional conditioning is unique in its enormous psychological power; this power, transcending the domains of all other functions is the capacity to provoke an (almost) involuntary emotion of \textit{Chill}.\(^{151}\) Evidently, chills seem to have psychological as well

---

\(^{150}\) See 3.1  
\(^{151}\) See Grewe, O. et al (2010).
as physiological correlates (Craig, D.G. 2005, Guhn et al., 2007). Grewe et al. (2010) mention that Sloboda (1991) “found that chills are correlated with various musical structures, such as unprepared harmonies and sudden dynamic or textural changes”\textsuperscript{152}, and that a more recent study (Guhn et al., 2007) “presented further arguments for a direct relation of musical structures and chills”.

“…chills in response to music show some interesting similarities to the classical definitions of an emotion: they result from a combination of a physiological arousal and subjective feeling response; they are related to distinct musical structures (external events); and, in contrast to moods, they are of a short duration… Thus it might be valuable to examine whether chills occur in response to stimuli of other sensual domains (visual, tactile, gustatory) and whether they reflect the same emotional meaning in response to other stimuli as to music.”\textsuperscript{153}

Yet, the writers conclude that “it is plausible that the chill reaction occurs in different circumstances, having different causes and different affective meanings”; in other words – yet another ‘typical’ event of affect and emotion.

In the “Psycho” murder scene the chill does not start with the appearance of an image behind the semi-opaque shower curtain. Although there is something sinister in the not-so-clear image of an apparently female figure, an appearance that intuitively alerts one to ‘sensing trouble’, the viewers still do not know what is about to happen. The chill only starts with the quick move of the curtain, immediately followed by quick and brutal stabbing, staggeringly amplified and intensified by the shrilling strings music. As the realism of the knife slaughtering is not as ‘technically brutal’ as it might have been filmed in the 21\textsuperscript{st} century detailed super-realism, it so happens that

\textsuperscript{152} Accurately matching Herrmann’s score in the shower murder scene.
\textsuperscript{153} Ibid., pp221-222
Herrmann’s music actually takes on the burden of the harsher effect of horror. Thus it serves both the accidental and the conditional functions at the same time, in the same sequence (scene).

In many cases of the incidental function, music may appear at the very beginning of a film, functioning as if an ‘overture’ in stage music.\textsuperscript{154} This phenomenon is possibly a legacy of dramatic music of older times, music that attempts to call the public to attention of what is about to be told ahead, a sort of ‘priming’ the spectators whether by words or any other means of dramatic expression. This musical phenomenon is so ‘conditionally’ embedded in the collective experience that the viewer may ‘need’ it to trigger the sense of expectation of things to come. There is a psychological allusion of discomfort if music or any sound is not present at the very beginning; that discomfort may end the moment a sound comes in, making the uncomfortable viewer feel ‘safe’. This overture-type music can be of any characteristic – from time statement, (using a specific period music, instrumental or vocal) through mood enhancing music to a theme tune or song. As it appears in the very beginning we can not yet categorise or ‘niche’ it as it may be a ‘one off’ or repeat later for conditioning purposes or run under variations that follow transitions. As the strict days of film score are changing we find more and more film starting with a song, whether ‘commissioned’ for the film or just ‘borrowed’. Such songs intend to either make a statement (philosophical or otherwise) or induce a certain mood that will lead the viewer into the coming story. The performer of such a song may be a character from the narrative or a completely unconnected singer; it could be

\textsuperscript{154} The classic example of this is in the music of silent movies, whether recorded or played live.
composed especially for the film or be a famous chart song or a relatively unknown ‘oldie’.  

4.2 Local Conditioning Through Music

According to Metz, film is “born of the fusion of several pre-existing forms of expression, which retain some of their own laws (image, speech, music, and noise).” Jessica Green (1974) expands on Metz’s theory saying that:

“Of these five channels of information included in film, music is the most artificial because in many films the majority of music is nondiegetic. For the audience, it is also the channel most removed from everyday life. While people do interact with images, the spoken word, text, and sound in the normal course of a day, people do not walk around constantly supported by a sensitive soundtrack that follows their emotions and thoughts.”

It might raise some kind of curiosity to mention that Stam, Burgoyne, and Flitterman-Lewis define several types of music that can be used in scores:

- Redundant music, which reinforces the emotional tone;
- Contrapuntal music, which runs counter to the dominant emotion;
- Empathetic music, which conveys the emotions of the characters;

To give a few examples: Mike Nichols’ “The Graduate” (1967), featuring “The Sound of Silence” by Simon and Garfunkel; Lawrence Kasdan’s “The Big Chill” (1983) featuring Marvin Gaye’s “I Heard It Through the Grapevine”; Gordon Parks’ “Shaft” (1971) with Isaac Hayes featuring the title song; John Patrick Shanley’s “Jo vs. the Volcano” (1990), featuring Eric Burdon singing “Sixteen Tons” as the film opening.

155 To give a few examples: Mike Nichols’ “The Graduate” (1967), featuring “The Sound of Silence” by Simon and Garfunkel; Lawrence Kasdan’s “The Big Chill” (1983) featuring Marvin Gaye’s “I Heard It Through the Grapevine”; Gordon Parks’ “Shaft” (1971) with Isaac Hayes featuring the title song; John Patrick Shanley’s “Jo vs. the Volcano” (1990), featuring Eric Burdon singing “Sixteen Tons” as the film opening.
156 1974, p. 58
157 To which he later adds “written materials” as a fifth component.
158 P. 81
159 Stam et al (1992) p. 63
• A-empathetic music, which seems indifferent to the drama; and

• Didactic contrapuntal music, which uses music to distance the audience “in order to elicit a precise, usually ironic, idea in the spectator’s mind.”

In reviewing all the above, Green (2010) concludes that:

“Though these terms can be limiting because music often fulfils more than just one role in a scene, they do demonstrate that music is making an argument or working to convince or persuade the audience, proving that film music is behaving rhetorically. Though film music does often fulfil the basic roles of conveying emotion and suggesting connections or themes in the film, film music also works in more complex roles to affect the meaning in film.” (p. 82)

So far, the above followers of Metz’s semiotic approach to film music cling to the assumption that:

“It is this tendency of audiences to use the score as a tool for understanding the meaning of other channels of information that makes film music so integral to the film-viewing experience. When using the music to help determine the meaning, the audience becomes less questioning, and more accepting, of what is happening on screen.”160

If we are to agree, even partially so, that music in film is only an instrument on the way to understanding the film’s meaning, and that the effect of the music score is mostly ‘artificial’ due to being non-diegetic, then we will have to abandon the Music-Image altogether. But if we agree that music in film acts above and beyond the secondary task of a helper and meaning enhancer, and that it “also works in more

160 Green, J. (2010) p. 82
complex roles to affect the meaning in film”, then we have paced many miles ahead of Metz’s semiotics and Gorbman’s diegetics. And we are still convinced that music is not a language.

Trying to understand how music enhances meaning in film, some believe that the viewer must understand musical conventions in order to understand how these shape film. Kassabian believes that “musical competence is based on decipherable codes learned through experience. As with language and visual image, we learn through exposure what a given tempo, series of notes, key, time signature, rhythm, volume, and orchestration is meant to signify.” As the stance of this thesis negates the idea of music being a language, then equally it does not endorse built-in semiotic trends. Instead, using music for signalling, with signifiers and signified, these can be used locally (and not as a rule), referring to the uniquely created ‘colloquialness’ in the film this music is in.

Although there are enough reasons and instances to make one want to believe that ‘this kind of music does this’ (e.g., violins playing a sweet melody = romantic) and ‘that kind of music does that’ (e.g., dissonant harmony, abrupt tempo = suspense), such stereotyped conventions are anchored in the long history of music, and especially in the development of music style and form. Yet, these phenomena are constantly in motion and progress and may change altogether with time. Believing that sweet violins melody makes violins romantic may show some great confusion (even within the very same film)…

The conditioning function of music in film is a ‘local’ process; it relates to the film-in-question’s world as a whole, closed unit, inside the time of its screening. Hence a conditioning element in a film is local and temporary. If a piece of music is played once at a beginning of a film, but then played again later on and even repeated more, the psychological process of ‘alert’ may conclude that ‘there is something in common’ about the pictures/scenes where this music appears. No matter how many times repeated, how many variations, colouration or harmony changes constitute that ‘conditioning agent’ – it will never become a language; at best it can be metaphorically referred to as a ‘local language’, not for use outside this film. Replaced by a better word, ‘Expression’, this local language now turns into the building materials of the world of Music-Image inside the whole film experience.

Music in film can locally condition using each and every one of its elements, whether by plain repetition, single element change or a combination of them. Thus, melody, harmony, counterpoint, rhythm tonality or a-tonality – all allow endless variations and emphases-pointers to dictate and control a film’s local conditioning.

The amount of change or variation is in the hands of the creators (the ‘music-man’ and the director) to decide how far from the ‘already known’ it is still possible to hold the viewer/listener’s awareness of a connection with the former appearance of the music. It should be mentioned that the gradual change of one element or more, and the variation method of conditioning becomes less possible when a film does not use a score but rather ‘borrows’ existing music; this is not to say that it is impossible to conduct but only to present difficulties not existing in the film score technique.
The concept of leitmotif (a concept borrowed from Wagner’s use of themes in his operas) is yet another way of local conditioning by attaching music to characters in the story. According to Gorbman (1988) the leitmotif could be defined as “a theme in a film [that] becomes associated with a character, a place, a situation, or an emotion.” (p. 3). Gorbman’s definition does not indicate whether or not the leitmotif repeats on other occasions of the-hero-to-whom-it-is-attached appears.\footnote{As it turns out, Wagner often disregarded his own precepts about musical denotation. Of the ninety motifs that run through the Ring dramas, over half do not originate in the melodic verse but in the orchestra instead. The audience is left to judge by dramatic context alone what the motifs stand for; it is not surprising that the names used to identify these motifs vary from critic to critic. These melodies are freer from unilinear identification; thus they are more expressive than referential. If a motif no longer refers to a specific object, it cannot very well operate to recall, either. Wagner’s theoretical specifications in Opera and Drama give way in practice to leitmotifs as we know them, both denotative (Sword, Curse) and “floating” in characteristically suggestive ways.” (Gorbman 1988, p. 29)} For that reason we might agree to consider an opening (title) song, whether repeated or not as ‘leitmotif-like’. Even in ‘classic’ leitmotif films such as the Harry Potter series (2001-2011, music by John Williams) the opening music is more of a ‘statement’ rather than a ‘Wagnerian’ leitmotif. It is slightly possible to assume that leitmotif type of music is more likely to exist within films that use a commissioned score while films that prefer using existing music may be more inclined towards ‘statement’ kind of music.

Explaining how a leitmotif is made and how it works on the viewer’s psyche, Green states that:

“Most of the time, leitmotifs can be identified as a simple melody, usually only a few measures in length. In order to establish the leitmotif with the object of its identification, the leitmotif is usually repeated a few times to firmly engrain its essence with the audience. In order to create these themes or meanings,
composers repeat the same or slightly altered themes, which the audience learns to associate with characters, places, or emotions.”\textsuperscript{163}

It is possible to assume that films which do not lean on the traditional film score but prefer ‘borrowed’ music – known or unknown – will use the opening conditioning appearance as a statement of mood or drama-to-come, without necessarily attempting to connect that music further down the story-line. Yet, in both forms there are no ‘rules of engagement’ or do/don’t-do limitation. Some scholars do believe in the magical myth of the leitmotif power. E. Scheurer, in his book “Music and Mythmaking in Film: Genre and the Role of the Composer” argues that:

“Just as the topics and gestures that accompany the hero and the lovers are meant to get our hearts to swell and to stir our blood to noble action, so the gestures for the villain are meant to remind us of untrammelled violence and fill us with uneasiness.”\textsuperscript{164}

One myth which is now dispersing concerns the idea that music in film can either resemble or contradict the visual on a scene. Gorbman believes that:

“Either the music ‘resembles’ or it ‘contradicts’ the action or mood of what happens on the screen.” (Gorbman 1988, p. 15)

A very intriguing point by using a purely musical term – counterpoint – ‘superimposed’ on the visual is expressed by Siegfried Kracauer (1960) stating that counterpoint occurs when music and picture carry ‘different meanings’ that meet in a

\textsuperscript{163} Green, J. (2010) p. 87
\textsuperscript{164} Scheurer, T. E. (2008), p 121. This formula is not likely to work in films like Tarantino’s, using pop/rock known songs that carry with them some connotations – direct or indirect – to a scene, either through the song’s lyrics or through any knowledge about the song which is known to the viewer.
montage effect. This highly enlightening point may diminish the importance of resemblance or contradiction in putting music to visual and in a way ‘foreseeing’ the autonomy of the music-image and its capacity to create complex motion when connecting with the visual image.\footnote{165}

One further step towards the Music-Image and stressing its multi-level function capacity is summed by Green (2010, p. 90) as follows:

“Functioning in much the same way that a caption narrates a photograph, Gorbman argues that music tends to shed light on the meaning that the director would have you glean from the film. Instead of stringing together words to communicate, music creates meaning through a multitude of varying factors such as instrumentation, tonality, key, and phrasing that work together to create a mood or feeling that suggests or emphasizes something that the audience might not have paid attention to or realized. Though it might be difficult to come up with the narrative solely based on the film music, with the help of other visual or auditory channels of information that direct the meaning, film music can comment on the drama and even persuade the audience to feel a certain way about the action or characters.”

The above quotation makes music an equal partner to the pool of images that make up the film. Its functions can now be compared to other functions of the film experience.

\footnote{165 By far that makes Kracauer and Chion ‘precursors’ of the Music-image.}
4.3 Time, Space and Transition

The Transition function of film music relates to different aspects and angles of time and/or space in film, as film can allow the usage of time and space beyond (and even far beyond) the limited scope of everyday events. In other words, this functionality can link the viewer to non-linear timescales or distances and ‘navigate’ through the parallel realities.

Hedges (1980), lays out some aspects of space and time within the cinematic experience:

“In narrative film it is customary to distinguish between the amount of time it takes to view the film ("screen time") and the amount of time that the narrative embraces ("diegetic time"). Space in the narrative film is also divided into the configuration of images as projected on the screen ("screen space") and the mental image of the space within which the narrative takes place, as constituted by the viewer's imagination ("diegetic space"). Time and space are of course interdependent; in film the sense of passing time is carried by the image track- time is perceived in terms of space. Space, on the other hand, is temporalised, since it is the duration of projection that allows the screen image to be perceived, while diegetic space requires the correlation of spatial information presented over an extended period of time. Underlying the concepts of diegetic space and time is the notion that the film narrative is a diegesis - that the film story is mediated by a narrator or implied author-rather than a mimesis, or unmediated representation.”166

---

166 Hedges, I. (1980), p. 28
Hedges’ notion of the *diegetic space* might have sounded somewhat odd, had he not added later, relating to some metaphoric quote\(^{167}\) that “The act of organising defines the diegetic nature of the narrative film” and that “the organization of the diegesis demands the manipulation of time, space, and sound.” (p. 29)

So far we can easily accept the screen time and diegetic time pairing, the first being the exact time-boundary of the cinematic experience, a time within which the incidental, the transitional and the conditional have their freedom to control, at any time and extent within the given time, the precise duration of the film. The second is the time-span of the narrative, regardless of the real running time of the film on the screen. The diegetic time is the time-frame that compels itself, in the viewer’s psyche, to ignore the screen-time altogether.\(^{168}\)

As for Hedges’s definition of the other pairing, screen space and diegetic space and their transitional options is concerned, here we may become somewhat confused, as a very crucial element of time and space in film – the leap effect in both – is not included or even mentioned. According to him the diegetic space consists of “mental image of the space within which the narrative takes place, as constituted by the viewer’s imagination” (p. 28). In order to include the element of time/space leap we will have to dispense with the ‘diegetic’ notion and consider both non-diegetic and the fantastic gap, as the ‘missing’ space or time in leap are not necessarily in the viewer’s imagination. This leap is about overlapping or by-passing *realities* that can behave in a dreamlike fashion – without adhering to linear, seamless transition and/or change

\(^{167}\) “The novel is a narrative that organises a world, while the film is a world that organises a narrative” by Jean Mitry. (*Esthetique et psychologie du cinema*, II (Paris: Editions Universitaires, 1965, p. 354).

\(^{168}\) This can elaborate on the usage of the word “local conditioning” in a sense other than the commonly accepted meaning in behavioural psychology.
shape and placement. On this scale a transition can represent from a simple flashback to a fantastic, ‘non-realistic’ plot.

Some different angles of the subject are presented in Khatchadourian, (1987), reflecting on another scholar’s thoughts (Alexander Sesonske’s ‘Cinema Space’).\textsuperscript{169} Although limiting Cinema Space to be a “wholly visual space whose visual reality is immediate and inescapable”, Sesonske argues that one of the major characteristic qualities of this space is “its logical duality, its two-faced character. The two aspects of cinema space are \textit{screen-space}, which is ‘a pattern of colour or light and shadow’ within the two-dimensional rectangle of the screen, and \textit{action space}, ‘the three-dimensional space within which the action occurs’. Although we see both aspects at once we normally attend only to the latter. The duality of the two aspects is as real as their identity in some sense; and this 'duality-in-identity makes the action-space of a film different from normal space in a way not noted before”\textsuperscript{170}

Though struggling to remain within the scope of the visual only and the linear continuity of singular reality, we may already trace an ‘invitation’ to the plurality that space (and time) may offer; moreover, it is also a door opening for possible other elements participating in the time-space in film (i.e., music).

From a totally different angle, Kolker & Ousley (1973) pose the following question: What is the relationship between the viewer and what he sees on the screen? Here the writers elaborate on the viewer’s involvement in the matter of time-space in film. “With the possible exception of music, film-going is the one aesthetic

\textsuperscript{169} In Carr & Casey (1973)
\textsuperscript{170} Ibid, pp. 402 & 406.
experience over which the audience has no control”, they argue. “A reader can linger over a book: he has a creative function in that he can envision the novelist's world, create images of the characters… He also has a critical function, for although the narrative line of a novel extends in time, this time is under the reader's control owing to the physical circumstances of reading. He can stop and go back, linger over a passage; he can put the book down”. (p. 388)

But yet,

“All of this is possible under the normal viewing conditions of film-going. About the only control a viewer has in a movie theatre is to ask his neighbours to stop talking or yell up to the projectionist to focus the film… Viewing a film is an experience of forced continuity - even when a film narrative is discontinuous. The theatre darkens, the film begins, and the viewer must remain with it, in the control of its images, until it ends. A musical performance exercises a similar tyranny, but its demands are for an immediate emotional response. A film performance demands immediate response not only of the emotions - very often a wide range of emotions - but also the intellectual ability to draw connexions and conclusions and to make decisions. All of this in the usual space of ninety minutes to two hours.” (p. 389)

It is this thesis’ view that in order to ‘force’ the viewer into this process of non-interrupted continuity, films have developed “a concise syntax… to make the viewer respond and help propel him into the story and along with the story's narrative line.”

“On the viewer's part, he must yield to the film's syntax and allow its narrative flow to substitute itself for his own lived time and space in the ordinary world. The movie theatre and the time spent there are cancelled by the narrative duration and the visual space created by the film.” (Ibid)

- 92 -
All the above present some crossing line, whether visual or not, between the kind of realities a viewer is to encounter while watching a film, and equally so with changing time and space factors inside the film-space and film-time. We are not to forget that “the crucial difference between 'the natural event and its appearance on the screen’ is not physical but psychological”. But while in Jungian terms the axis of time and space will be usually confined to the realm of consciousness, “the unconscious has no time. There is no trouble about time in the unconscious. Part of our psyche is not in time and not in space. They are only an illusion, time and space, and so in a certain part of our psyche time does not exist at all.”

Jung – claims Storr – “came to think of archetypes as existing in this reality outside space and time, but manifesting themselves in the individual psyche as organizers.” (1998, p. 25). And quoting Jung he elaborates:

“Archetypes, so far as we can observe and explain them at all, manifest themselves only through their ability to organize images and ideas, and this is always an unconscious process which cannot be detected until afterwards. By assimilating material whose provenance in the phenomenal world it is not to be contested, they become visible and psychic.”

The transitional function in film music confines itself neither to consciousness nor to the unconscious. Its role inside a film is to bring an ‘organised’ presence of change – alongside, before or right after the event has taken place. The music-image playing a transitional role does it first and foremost just by being present at the right place and time. It can use elements of the other function though, such as using and repeating the

171 Perkins, V. F. 1993 p. 71. (Emphasis mine). This apparently simple statement is, in fact, very crucial in understanding the experience of film in general and film-as-a-whole in particular.
172 Jung, CW 18, para. 684
173 Jung, CW8, para.440
same (or a variation of) music every time a transition takes place. In such cases the ‘transposition’ of the functions may intensify each other’s power when needed.  

4.4 Music as Effect: Encountering ‘Real’ Sound

Regardless of the function it comes under, music can sometimes be used as an effect or as “what it does not seem to be”. In “Escape from Alcatraz” (Don Siegel, 1979), composer Jerry Fielding uses the orchestral instrument to ‘mimic’ real outdoors sounds, such as ‘night sounds’ of an open area, including close and remote sounds of nocturnal creatures (crickets, frogs etc’). The sound starts as an authentic, non-musical sound, and then the orchestral a-tonal and effect-like texture starts fading in and gradually takes over the real natural sound. The musically-aware viewer will notice the transformation, yet, due to the level of the artificial sound remaining loyal to the true sound’s volume (loudness), there is an amount of ‘extra eeriness’ creeping into the scene. (As the orchestral insert seems ‘to be born of another instance’ so does the viewer’s emotion float on a cloud of ambiguity. For him/her it does not make much difference whether it is classified as music, effect or otherwise. What does count is the degree of discomfort into which the newly born hybrid has put the viewer).

Another example, yet of a very different usage of music as an effect, or rather in this case as ‘not what it sounds’ is Steven Spielberg’s film “Close Encounters of the

---

174 Among endless examples of transitional music in film, the following may be of useful guidance: David Hugh Jones’ “Betrayal” written by Harold Pinter, music by Dominic Muldowney (1983), and Robert Schwentke’s The Time Traveller’s Wife, music by Mychael Danna (2009).
Third Kind" (1977, music by John Williams). A five note line of great musical clarity appears several times throughout the film:

![Five-Note Motif](image)

**Fig. 1 – The Five-Note motif**

Yet, it is not a necessarily a motif, nor is it of any of the three functions quality. It serves not as music as such, but instead as a block of signals, or language or a Rosetta-Stone for an alien or unknown language. It is the initial communication between two different worlds. This ‘phrase’ on its different tempi and rhythmical changes appears as all the above is heard for the first time in the film when chanted by a mass of believers in Dharmsala, Northern India. When asked where it came from, they all point to the sky. Lacombe, a French scientist (François Truffaut), later lecturing, trying to equate the five-tone signal to contents from Zoltán Kodály’s music-signs for the deaf, later working on deciphering the code by using an electric keyboard. Barry, a little kid, plays this five-note sequence on his toy-xylophone. He had never heard it before. Towards the climactic end of the film, several attempts of direct communication with the alien spaceships take place. The ‘grand’ communication, that with the largest and most magnificent ship, being successful takes the five-note signal further into a beautifully frenzied orchestral tone dialogue; only at this endpoint can we start to relate to “whatever it was” as music and not as a mere signal.

---

175 See Gorbman’s (1988) remark: “In many cases, the theme's designation is so diffused that to call it a leitmotif contradicts Wagner's intention.” (p. 29)
These examples portray mainly ‘unusual’ musical situations in film by the virtue of being ‘beyond’ or ‘outside’ the three main function categories. In such cases music can stand out by its quite independent quality as a music-image. In this Spielberg film we must notice that despite the ‘catchiness’ of the five-note line it is not at all easy for the viewers to “sing along” (had they wished to do so) with it, yet, it remains strongly in the spectator’s memory. It is so mainly because the uniqueness of its power to elevate its music-image above and beyond the visual, by being ‘gently detached’ from the otherwise ‘gently expected’.

Both films – Siegel’s and Spielberg’s – contribute newer angles to the usage of the music-image; by so doing they manage to enrich the scope of music-expectation in the viewer experience of music in film.

5. Film Music: Type, Style, Original and Non-Original Music

“In the interaction between the musical score and the film it backs, one of the first elements to consider is the very type of music that is used.”

---

176 Because of the down octave leap followed by a perfect fifth up leap, a sizeable proportion of the chanters in India change those leaps to “easier to sing” notes and they then sound as follows:

```
G A G D
```

The down octave becomes down perfect fourth and the up perfect fifth to up perfect fourth, both ‘easier’ intervals to sing.

177 Brown, R. S. 1994, p. 38
It must be clarified that distinguishing between ‘type’ and ‘style’ in music (generally) and film-music (particularly) can at times be a confusing task. The generic word ‘classical’ is erroneously attached to any non-popular music stretching over several centuries now. Until some time ago, any orchestral music would have been regarded as ‘classical’, whether it was Bach, Stravinsky, James Last or John Williams.178

“‘There is hardly a musical style or genre that has not, at one point or another, made its way into the music/film interaction. Everything from the most current manifestations of pop music to the longest-lasting "classical" styles has been heard either from the orchestra pits during silent screenings or on the music tracks of sound films, with stops along the way for jazz, folk music, various ethnic musics, and what have you.’ (Ibid)

While Brown’s preference goes for “the interaction between the various classical scores” to be the principal, if not the sole subject of his book (1994, pp. 38-39), it is more likely to be believed that by now all types and styles of music have gained some auditory equality with each other. Even though the strong ‘classical’ tendency throughout the history of film has always leant towards the many possibilities classical programme music treasures, the choice of the large variety of ‘non-classical’ music used in films has become strongly apparent and rightfully claims recognition. The non-classical (in all its variety), the multi-format mix of styles, the ethnic (world music), pop music, rock music and jazz – are all present more and more frequently in film nowadays.179 In spite of the long term oligarchy of the Hollywood ‘classical’ sound, films coming from other countries have managed to ‘infuse’ their unique

178 Brown refers to the term ‘classical music’ as a type “in numerous of its various styles”. (Ibid.) He also refers to it as in the common use of “highbrow” music, “music that stands in opposition to the more popular forms of art, whether songs, dance tunes, jazz or whatever.” (p. 39)

179 See “Eyes Wide Shut” in Part III
sound and style while expanding the scope of international viewers, slowly breaking the existing barriers and local segregation.

The case of tonal and a-tonal music may be confusing if we try to classify these two as a type, a style or any other term when used in film. “Just as 1940s noir films represented a challenge to the security of home and family” – claims Ness (2008) - “their musical scores defied the emphasis on tonality common in classical Hollywood scoring practices”. In addition he claims that “Scores for the nostalgic second noir cycle are characterized by tension between atonal techniques and the return of more melodic elements”. According to Ness, the move from the ‘safe home’, American score style started shifting to its opposite, the sound of insecurity expressed by techniques such as abandoning traditional melody lines and even tonality, different instrumentation and so on. Moreover:

“The music for noir films not only undermined the security of more conventional film scores through the incorporation of dissonance and atonality, but also through such destabilizing devices as the breakdown of traditional diegetic/nondiegetic distinctions and the use of unusual instrumentation and experimental recording techniques”. (Ibid, p. 53)

Quoting Marc Vernet180, Ness discusses four points of change that contributed to the birth of Film Noir. The first of these four points concerns music: “a transition towards a more serious tone”. This transition towards a different tone “is demonstrated in the move away from the nineteenth-century romantic model of film scoring and toward the incorporation of more modernistic devices, such as serial and

180 “Film Noir on the Edge of Doom,” in Copjec’s Shades of Noir (1993. p. 20)
twelve-tone constructions”. Ness refers to David Raskin, Bernard Herrmann and Roy Webb as composers who contributed to the genre of Film Noir. He also reminds us that “they did not come from the European symphonic tradition of Max Steiner and Erich Wolfgang Korngold, but were born in America and educated in twentieth-century compositional techniques”. (Ibid)

Although music styles such as polytonality, a-tonality and serialism originated mainly in Europe, it seems that it had to take such a change in the American filmic approach in order to allow this kind of “darkness” and “destabilisation” into the Hollywood film score. Abandoning the melodic/harmonic lines altogether apparently needs a ‘justification’. It is very possible that non-melodic and non-harmonic music put the average viewer/listener in great discomfort and unease. It should be also noticed that the ‘second coming’ of the neo-Noir in the seventies has shown some softening approach to music by combining a-tonal with tonal and/or non-melodic with melodic lines as agents of tension. [Alan J. Pakula’s Klute (1971, music: Michael Small), Dick Richards’ Farewell, My Lovely (1975, music: David Shire) and Roman Polanski’s Chinatown (1974, music: Jerry Goldsmith) and many others.]

Another point of change mentioned by Vernet refers mainly to the visual, but has impact on music as well:

“The “shrinking of the frame” …is complemented both by a decrease in the amount of music used in the films and the move toward smaller ensembles and selective instrumentation rather than a full symphonic orchestra.”

---

181 Ness, 2008 p. 53. Some of the specific examples include Hitchcock’s Shadow of a Doubt (1943, music by Dimitri Tiomkin), Otto Preminger’s Laura (1944, music by David Raksin) and Roy Webb’s music for Edward Dmytryk’s Farewell My Lovely (1944).
182 Ness 2008 p. 54
Although Gorbman (1988) refers to part of the decreasing amount of music as a “structural silence”\textsuperscript{183} It seems to be the case of using the music-image rather sparingly and relying more on the natural sound and dialogue.

Though it is not so easy to define types of small ensembles due to the different instrumentation and number of instruments chosen by any specific composer, the broad sound of the symphony orchestra is different in timbre and power; thus, the small ensemble may lend to the film a unique kind of closeness, not frequently present in the big orchestra sound. Small ensemble sound is very likely to lack the pomp of the grand orchestra and thus promote more ‘intimacy’ in the music-image created by it. Intriguingly enough, the “decrease in the amount of music used” may be regarded as a kind of ‘style’, as music-score minimalism dictates the viewer/listener’s “frame of musical mind”, one which is quite different from many other films with regard to usage and presence of the music-image within the experience of film-as-a-whole. According to Royal S. Brown, “smallness has become one of the essential elements of modern film composition”.\textsuperscript{184}

5.1. Jazz, Pop and Independent Songs

Jazz music found its way to the movies in the nineteen forties, and increased its presence there from the fifties onwards. At first there were mainly “jazz stars” of the times (Duke Ellington, Miles Davies etc’) as composers, however ‘pure jazz’

\textsuperscript{183} “A structural silence occurs where sound previously present in a film is later absent at structurally corresponding points. The film thus encourages us to expect the (musical) sound as before, so that when in fact there is no music, we are aware of its absence.” (p. 19)

\textsuperscript{184} Brown, R. S., 1977
gradually expanded its qualities to fit into the demands of the film. Composers such as Henry Mancini, Elmer Bernstein, Jerry Fielding, Bernard Herrmann and many others ‘fused’ the colouration and textures of the big-band with the big symphony, and at times the intimacy of the jazz quartet with a chamber group of ‘classical’ instruments.

In her extensive discussion of David Raksin’s score for “Laura” Kathryn Kalinak observes that

“For white audiences of the era, jazz represented the urban, the sexual, and the decadent in a musical idiom perceived in the culture at large as an indigenous black form. Playing upon these culturally empowered stereotypes, the classical score used jazz as a musical trope for otherness, whether sexual or racial. Difference could thus be encoded into a text not only by visual representation but by music as well.”

Yet, Jazz and Blues were (and in some regard, still are) the main junction for massive changes in music as well as in many other arts. Technically speaking, from relaxation of form and introducing freedom of imagination, to socially speaking, the growing impact of the black cultural and inspirational components into the non-black societies – Jazz has fundamentally changed the rigidity of form and cultural segregation of music in particular and the Arts in general. Judging by so many examples it seems that as far as film is concerned, Jazz has been and is here to stay.

Moreover, Jazz melodic, harmonic, rhythmic and counterpointal structures, presenting a difference and diversion to the classical equivalent elements opened the gates for

185 1944, Otto Preminger’s film with David Raskin’s music.
186 Kalinak, 1993 p. 167
new styles, tone and structures of music to become a ‘legitimate’ element in film, upgrading from ‘just effects’ to full-bodied music-image in film. Culturally, psychologically and artistically, the new musical ‘attitudes’ started changing the viewer/listener’s conception of elements such as dissonance, a-tonality, multi-rhythm and polytonality. All these could now become acceptable to the ear and by the attached imagination, transforming past axiomatic music-images into newer ones.

“The fate of jazz as film music strongly resembles that of classical music: it was taken over by established film composers like Henry Mancini, Lalo Schifrin, Dave Grusin, John Barry, and Michel Legrand, who took elements of its basic language and integrated them into a ‘mod’ style tailored to the flow of the film.”

According to Russell Lack, it was Elmer Bernstein who claimed that the death of the classical film-music score began in 1952, “with an innocuous pop song that was used in the title sequence of the classic Gary Cooper Western High Noon. The song itself, ‘Do Not Forsake Me, O My Darlin’, sung by Tex Ritter, went on to become a substantial hit in its own right, and it was this initial instance of commercial success that sent every producer scurrying in search of songs for their next picture.” (Lack, 1997 p. 207)

Lack’s cleverly semi-sarcastic observation encapsulates one aspect of pop-music usage in film, the commercial aspect. According to Lack, the ferocious competition between the emerging television and the Hollywood film industry might have been

---

188 Nowell-Smith, 1997 p. 654
189 “The death of the classical film-music score” might have begun in 1952, but the usage of commercially popular songs might be seen and heard earlier. i.e., "When You Wish Upon A Star" (Walt Disney’s “Pinocchio”, 1940), “Be My Love” sung by Mario Lanza & Kathryn Grayson in “The Toast of New Orleans” (1950), “Singin’ in the Rain” (1952) and many others.
the urgent need of looking for more commerciality on the film industry side. (pp. 208-209). While it is hard to deny the commercial goals of using pop music in film, this is not to say that the usage of popular music, [whether internally (diegetic) or externally (non-diegetic)] – has no artistic impact in and on the film. Following a brief historical account of Jazz music in film, the Oxford History of World Cinema notes that “a very similar aesthetics was responsible for allowing popular music, in its various manifestations, to play a much more significant role in narrative cinema after 1960”. 190

Beyond the usage of pop songs as commercial, musical markers for a film that may satisfy the balance-sheets of the film and music industries respectively, there stands a new artistic development that can simultaneously be found in parallel arts, namely the inclusion of culturally collective experience (e.g., known pop songs) into another art form through association. While on the one hand a new ‘theme song’ may be inserted at the beginning, end or any other location in a film, whether in connection with the narrative or not, all for the sake of commerciality, on the other hand songs that have not been written for the occasion but have been ‘borrowed’ can have a very powerful effect in the build-up of the narrative. One may now find in many films that besides an ‘original music by…’ there would also be an additional list of “out of score” borrowed songs that are either diegetically used or externally so. Some examples may enlighten this diversity:

- "The End" by The Doors; playing at the beginning and the end of the film in Francis Ford Coppola’s Apocalypse Now (1979). In addition to the ‘original music’, by Coppola himself and his composer father, Carmine Coppola, and to

190 Nowell-Smith, 1997 p. 655
the usage of Wagner’s The Ride of the Valkyries there is a list of another five external songs used in the ‘pastiche score’ of the film.

- "Little Green Bag" by George Baker Selection, Playing during the opening credits after the film’s introduction at the breakfast in Quentin Tarantino’s Reservoir Dogs (1991). While there is no ‘original music’ there are another ten ‘external’ songs making up the music-image of Tarantino’s individual way of eschewing built-to-serve scores while preferring the usage of existing songs; those may be diegetic, including the situations of the characters talking about the particular song (e.g., Jackie Brown) or totally independent (yet very intrinsically connected by association).

- Robert Schwentke’s The Time Traveller’s Wife (2009) opens with a song that puzzles the viewer. It is sung in German, taking its time for the viewer not to have any idea of what is to come, only to be revealed later that it is sung by a woman driving a car, then having her son – who is in the back seat – joining her in singing (still in German), then turning into a short conversation in English between the two. As a song is the first image to start the film, it does obviously capture the viewer’s attention yet leaves him/her quite uncertain as nothing is yet known or connecting to the song.

- Some independently external songs, whether written for a specific film or ‘borrowed’ from the outside have become the ‘trademark’ of the film. They can start, end or appear anywhere in the timeline of the film; the public automatically associates these songs with specific films, some examples are: "The First Time Ever I Saw Your Face" in Play Misty for Me (Clint Eastwood, 1971), “Raindrops Keep Fallin’ On My Head” in Butch Cassidy and the
Sundance Kid (George Roy Hill, 1969) and “The Look of Love” in the 1967 version of Casino Royale (brilliantly and wildly directed by five directors…).

- James Cameron’s Titanic (1997) featuring Celine Dion in "My Heart Will Go On", Barry Sonnenfeld’s Men in Black (1997) introducing Will Smith as a singer with the song “Men In Black. "Peter Jackson’s Lord of the Rings: The Return of the King (2002) with Annie Lennox singing “Into The West” – are only few examples where popular songs, not directly connected and playing at the end of the film have become iconic and directly linked with the film they ‘represent’.

From a psychological point of view, all the above examples may enhance the understanding that film has become a phenomenon that is greater than just entertainment or an isolated pastime event. The associative connection with outside music, bearing whatever social and/or individual meanings, and may belong to another place, another time and different history, connect the filmic experience to a wider imaginal scope in the psyche of individuals and groups. In post-Jungian terms, the position of film in our everyday life – including all filmic formats such as the theatre, television, video-formats and so on – could open a gateway to suggesting an additional/alternative freer consideration to Jung’s original dependency on mythology, fairy-tales and religion as a source for understanding humanity and the human psyche. While these can successfully remain as solid historical references, film today, with its persistently constant involvement with Image and its changes can offer the capacity to contain all of them in a way of ongoing accumulative development rather then
sticking with static/semi-static images, some of which are archaic or no longer representing change.\textsuperscript{191}

6. **Film, Music, Archetype**

Since film presents content to be received, adapted, accepted (or rejected) by the psyche it has to undergo archetypal psychic processes. Hockley (2003) claims that:

“Precursors to his [Jung’s] psychological adaptation of the principle of the archetype can be found in the numerous theories which are concerned with how 'structuring potentials' are inherent in the universe. One of the earliest of these theories can be found in the work of Plato, who conceived of a system in which 'original ideas', existing before the world was created, dwelt in the minds of the gods, and from those 'ideas' came all matters and reason”.\textsuperscript{192}

Elaborating on Jung’s archetypal assumptions, Hockley adds:

“One of Jung's insights was that this model of universal form might be helpful in understanding not just the concrete material world, but could also usefully be applied in helping to understanding the psychological world and particularly the unconscious. In suggesting the archetype as a theoretical construct that structured both the inner and outer world, Jung anticipated some of the developments of modernist and postmodernist thought.” (Hockley 2003, p. 60)

\textsuperscript{191} The very attraction to film within the late post-Jungian interest and writings may present corroboration for this argument and for the focus on Image though contemporary film analysis.
\textsuperscript{192} Hockley, 2003; referring to CW 8, para. 154
In trying to implement Jung’s archetypal line of thought it may seem to us that following ‘tangible’ visual images, behaviours and events down to their non-concrete but rather structural and organisational patterns can be made possible if we follow down the root of the Symbol\(^{193}\) (through fairy-tales, mythology and legend or any other referential tools). One can trace and try to understand the archetypal ground and background of the narrative, the characters and their behaviour. But can one find and get to the archetypal basis of the music-image? Jung had already stated that:

“…the archetypal representation (images and ideas) mediated to us by the unconscious should not be confused with the archetype as such. They are very varied …and point back to one essential ‘irrepresentable’ basic form. The latter is characterised by certain formal elements and by certain fundamental meanings, although these can only be grasped approximately.”\(^{194}\)

When we try to link all the above to searching an archetypal basic, ‘irrepresentable’ form, we can easily cling to simplistic speech, by claiming, say, “this music is very romantic” or, “this music sends a chill down my spine” and so on. The simply expressed terms – romance, love, fear, suspense etc’ – are basic forms of human existence, yet, we may ask, what is or are the ‘representables’ of these archetypes in the music-image? Is it possible to say with full certainty that this-or-that tone-cluster or this-or-that orchestral colouration constitute an archetypal ‘representative? It might be possible but not to the ‘collective ear’; as these representatives are by nature cultural ones.

\(^{193}\) In the Jungian sense

\(^{194}\) CW 8, para. 417
In his book “Twenty Four Frames Under”, Russell Lack (1997) dedicates a chapter to Musical Archetypes. Referring to the classical Jungian archetype he states that:

“A musical archetype might be characterized as a soundless, rhythmless impulse of sonic images or impressions …a living system of reactions and aptitudes that ultimately help to shape new musical ideas. A musical archetype might also be similar to the philosopher Henri Bergson’s notion of ‘éternal incréés’; a tonal map of prefigurations activated by exposure to music in which mental energy fields constantly form and re-form musical Gestalten — modulations, leitmotifs, repetitions and other associating structures that underscore the listening experience. This process of 'capturing' musical imagery from the wider set 'offered' to the conscious mind may also help to explain some of the processes involved in compositional choices as well as the process of musical interpretation or understanding.”

If so, and if the psychic-energy fields constantly form and re-form basic musical forms, then we may also ask whether these archetypal music forms are universal. Scrutinising the harmony-based Western music against the unison driven Arab and some of the Eastern music output may suggest non-uniformity on this subject even if there is some proximity in forming tonal centres in both. The above question may apply mainly to music as such and less so to film music, as the duality of senses and image types is expected to be ‘less abstract’ and even provide each other a ground to lean on, being even stronger than in the case of music on its own. Yet, ‘a musical archetype might be characterized as a soundless, rhythmless impulse of sonic images or impressions’ only if the cultural elements themselves are the “mental energy fields constantly form and re-form musical Gestalten”.

Hockley (2003) presents some possibility of clarification by saying that:

195 Lack, 1997, p. 184
“A concrete example of this distinction between archetypal forms, which is more accurately termed pattern, and its contents, or image, would be the figure of the hero.”

Following this distinction we may want to apply the term ‘pattern’ to “a soundless, rhythmless impulse of sonic images or impressions” where the images are not concrete, and to apply the term ‘image’ to any connected heard sound, rhythm, or impulse of sonic impression. If we accept this understanding then what is left to be solved is the question ‘what is in the music archetypal pattern that anticipates and drives forward cognitive musical patterns’ – collectively and culturally. More specifically we may wish to learn whether form images, such as tonality, melody, harmony, and rhythm have archetypal images that adhere to universal patterns or whether these are just random geographical/cultural expressions through sound.

Discussing William Walton’s score for Henry V (1944), Lack states that:

“Since film music is deployed in a highly coded way to provoke reaction or arousal, one might think that some sort of all-inclusive taxonomy might be produced that can render the precise effects of film music decipherable in the same way as the generative structures of language can be revealed. This, I think, is illusory and is perhaps best proved by reference to the failure of semiotics to produce a complete sign system to explain other aspects of cinematic ‘language’.” (p. 186)

It seems that by any method of linguistic investigation – e.g. Chomsky’s ‘universal grammar’, Lerdahl and Jackendoff’s ‘musical grammar’ – music is very unlikely to comply, as it is not a language and does not adhere to language rules. The archetypal

---

196 Hockley, 2003; referring to CW 8, par. 154
197 Hockley, 2003, p. 61

- 109 -
images of music may cluster around any specific idea, but that is more likely to turn them into a *complex*\(^\text{198}\) rather than a grammatical rule.

7. When Image Turns Hero

Any film-music theory may encounter some confusion when music is the subject and protagonist of the film (hence ‘Hero’ above…), such as a musical, an opera, a life-story of a composer or a performer. In such cases there is an ‘image priority switching’ where the visual image goes alongside and adheres to the music-image, whereas in other cases the music-image usually follows the visual one.

“…musicals …are a form that was perfected by cinema's ability to jump the time that in a theatre would be devoted to scene changes, costume changes or other spell-breaking activities. In the musical, time and motion are coordinated to the rhythm of song and dance, with everything subordinated to the principal of spectacle. Oddities such as *Meet Me in St Louis* (1944), *Yolanda and the Thief* (1945), *Ziegfeld Follies* (1946), *Summer Holiday* (1948) and *An American in Paris* (1951) were true originals - Technicolor splashes of pure cinematic invention and surrealism, turning the two-dimensional world of the theatre into the three-dimensional world of the *mise-en-scène*.”\(^\text{199}\)

One should bear in mind that the stage-musical, which is an offspring of the operetta, which, in turn, is the offspring of the opera – all being musical forms made for the stage – is ‘upgraded’ once transformed into a film. All the stage’s time and

\(^{198}\) See PART I, chapter 1
\(^{199}\) Lack, 1997, p. 240
space difficulties disappear and are resolved with great ease. Relating to the absurd format that classic musicals may present to some, Lack says that:

“This concept of a musicalised everyday, where characters spontaneously burst into song as if it were the most natural thing in the world, is one of the most surreal conceits ever played by the film industry upon its audience.²⁰⁰ Both dialogue and lyrics bleed into each other in the musical’s diegesis. From the perspective of the present day it seems as outmoded and kitsch a form as a Gilbert and Sullivan opera, yet in its kinetic energy and the sheer audaciousness of its staging and design, the classic musicals represent a high point in film aesthetics.” (Ibid, p. 242)

As stage musicals developed and drastically changed over the years, so did film musicals, only much more. Eventually there came new film-musicals that were originally written for film instead of being adapted from a stage musical.²⁰¹

The precursor of the stage musical, the opera, has become a problematic art form when put into film format. The ‘main attraction’ in opera is the voice that uses music to convey a narrative through singers (who may or may not be actors/actresses). The real hierarchy in the classic opera form is:

Voice → Music → Singers → Story

This seems – at least from the visual angle – to be ‘inside out’. The great focus on the voice and the music, then the performers and last on a ‘plot’, be it convincing or

²⁰⁰ This can be perceived as truth only by those who believe that the ‘audience’ has no right or wish to indulge in an escapist fantasy, musical or otherwise...
²⁰¹ e.g. Moulin Rouge (2001), The Lion King (1994), Chitty Chitty Bang Bang (1968), Mary Poppins (1964), Singin’ in the rain (1952), High School Musical (2006) and surprisingly enough, The Wizard of Oz (1939), to name but a few.
not, may leave the filmic version not much but being a messenger – if you can’t make it to the opera house, here is your easier chance to see La Traviata…

Lack includes filming an opera (and even a musical, if filmed on stage) as ‘cinematic forms which seem alien to the basic idea of cinema, because they seem to utilise so little of cinema’s aesthetic possibilities’.

Even though the film technique can offer smoother transitions between scenes or use close-ups to enhance focus on the character in action, filming an opera (or musical) from stage may seem even more limited than filming a documentary, as in the latter there is room for space and time shifts that can not exist directly on the opera stage. Yet, more and more contemporary operas do lend themselves to wider artistic possibilities and less rigidity of ‘factual’ stories. Many film makers got attracted to an operatic drama, this or another, but most likely due to the dramatic story rather than the music. Carmen, apparently, has been one of the most attractive filming objects of any musical genre; a quick visit to IMDB’s database will reveal around 70 ‘Carmens’, mostly being variations on Bizet’s original opera, both of story and of music. Menotti’s chamber opera, The Medium, was made into a film by the composer himself. Being a chamber opera and set in a single space, a séance, The Medium allowed the more subtle usage of film technique to be artistically employed and expressed.

It seems that the more contemporary an opera is, the more possible it becomes to engage with non-restrictive cinema’s aesthetic possibilities. While this process progresses we may want to look back, even for a moment, to the hierarchical ladder of the operatic being, the first of which is the voice. But then, if a voice is the main ‘protagonist’ of a film, concentrating our mind to it may need some kind of

---

202 Lack, 1977, p. 246
‘assistance’; at least lyrics, so that we can connect the voice to a visual or an idea that psychologically we can create. Then, if the voice (even with lyrics) lingers we may need a kind of a story-line to keep our watching/listening mind within a ‘frame’, one that can expect and anticipate events, a continuum and an end. By then we have already changed the Voice’s placement in the operatic hierarchy, just by ‘promoting’ the narrative upwards. Chion (1999) says the following about our consideration of the voice:

“Discussions of sound films rarely mention the voice, speaking instead of "the soundtrack." A deceptive and sloppy notion, which postulates that all the audio elements recorded together onto the optical track of the film are presented to the spectator as a sort of bloc or coalition, across from the other bloc, a no-less-fictive "image track." (p. 3)

Even though not (yet) differentiating speaking voice from singing voice, he attempts to define the location and hierarchy of the Voice, by arguing that:

“In actual movies, for real spectators, there are not all the sounds including the human voice. There are voices, and then everything else. In other words, in every audio mix, the presence of a human voice instantly sets up a hierarchy of perception.” (p. 4)

Theoretically, in a filmed opera the Voice can naturally occupy a top hierarchy, leaving the music, the characters and the story to be ‘everything else’. Yet, it (cautiously) can be so when going to the opera house to listen/hear an opera, as it is quite expected so by the opera goer. The expectation from a film seems to be different a-priori, as in our anticipating mind film carries the promise for a ‘greater than life’ experience, including the life confined to the opera stage. Paraphrasing an existing
sentence ("The presence of a body structures the space that contains it") Chion suggests the following, to enlighten the perception of the human voice: “the presence of a human voice structures the sonic space that contains it.” (p. 5). This would make more sense when applies to the next type of Music as a Hero.

When the life of a composer, singer or a music group happens to be a subject of a film, the music in which the subject is directly involved in may become the Hero of a film. We may even slightly paraphrase Chion’s paraphrase and claim that in such cases “the presence of the music structures the total space that contains it”. One is more likely to find feature films about great composers’ lives while less famous ones may (or may not) find their lives and work in documentaries. The film industry’s attraction to composers’ lives is likely to become greater than for other composers’ stories when:

a) A composer has more ‘famous’ works than another’s, and
b) There are enough colourful and/or scandalous lives involved. No matter which choice is to take the lead, the composer’s music (and sometimes his era’s music as well) will become very central in the film.\(^{203}\) This is likely to be anticipated by the film-goer, as he/she is more likely to know, or to have heard of the composer’s music rather than the composer’s biography.

There are similarities in the case of music performers’ biographies (a.k.a. ‘biopic’), as the music they have performed might – in the collective memory of their fans – be considered as ‘greater’ then these artists’ lives. Unlike the case of composers, whose

\(^{203}\) e.g. The Music Lovers (Ken Russell, 1970); Mahler (Ken Russell, 1974); Lisztomania (Ken Russell, 1975); Amadeus (Milos Forman, 1984); Immortal Beloved (Bernard Rose, 1994); Coco Chanel & Igor Stravinsky (Jan Kounen, 2009).
creative output is much more shrouded in mystery or remoteness, or for better precision, the proximity to the ‘stars’ is more likely to involve a part of the viewer’s social psyche both in the music and in the life of the performer(s), when this reflects and invokes own memories by the viewer. Yet, even in this case, music is a central and pivotal element of such films and in many cases the artist’s life may seem to revolve around the music associated with him rather then the other way round. The reason for this is the sheer volume of affect and emotion music is capable to provoke in us directly and immediately; the more the biography plot evolves the greater may the power of the music-image become, yet this image and the visual one will go on to strengthen the emotional affect driven by the power of this combination of images.

8. Conclusion: The Music-image – Inside and Outside Film

Sound-images, visual-images and music-images exist equally in the world we live in. They all are constantly present in varied volume and frequencies (literally so when it comes to sound and music…) and they affect our psyche in different measures, angles and directions. Music is being played or performed on many daily occasions, whether we notice it, totally ignore it or are semi-conscious of it. Of all the elements that make up music it might be rather safe to conclude that rhythm and tonal-centre are of an archetypal nature, as we assume they manifested even before the formation

204 To mention but few examples: Oliver Stone’s “The Doors” (1991)’ Todd Haynes’ Bob Dylan’s lives “I’m Not There” (2007); James Mangold’s “Walk the Line” (2005), Johnny Cash’s story); Taylor Hackford’s “Ray” (2004); Michael Apted’s “Coal Miner’s Daughter” (biopic of Loretta Lynn); Mark Rydell’s “The Rose” (1979); Anton Corbijn’s “Control” (2007), the life and death of Ian Curtis, the enigmatic singer of Joy Division; Zefirelli’s “Callas Forever” (2002), a fictionalized account of the last days of opera singer Maria Callas; Richard Thorpe’s “The Great Caruso” (1951), with Mario Lanza as the great tenor; Anthony Mann’s The Glen Miller Story” (1954).
of speech and language. In his book *The Prehistory of the mind*, Mithen (1996) argues that:

“…pre-sapiens hominids like Neanderthals lacked “cognitive fluidity” or metaphorical thought - the ability to hold concurrently in mind information from several different cognitive domains. Additionally, the absence of symbolic artifacts in their dwelling sites implies absence of symbolic thought and hence of symbolic utterance - i.e., spoken language (p. 228). Yet the challenging lives of Neanderthals - with their physically difficult environment, large body size, and large but dependent infants - required complex emotional communication and intergroup cooperation. They developed a “music-like communication system that was more complex and more sophisticated than that found in any of the previous species of *Homo*” (p. 234), one that included iconic gestures, dance, onomatopoeia, vocal imitation and sound Synaesthesia.”

He also mentions that: “…music-making is first and foremost a shared activity, not just in the modern Western world, but throughout human cultures and history” (Ibid. p. 205). It may be reasonably assumed that the other elements of music – melody, harmony structure and colouration – then developed culturally, stemming from the basic two – rhythm and tonal-centre.205

Even though music nowadays is regarded as “cognitive” as speech is, the affect and emotion it exerts on its listeners runs deeper in their unconscious, collective and/or personal. On the collective level we may trace the instinctive seeds of life that moved man of antiquity onward: through rhythm as linked to time and through tone-centre as a link to space and communicating within it.

205 The reference to “culture” here is in regard of development/innovation within the collectivity of a large group of people but not restricted by number.
Inside film, the music-image encounters collaboration with the visual image, a collaboration that may sometimes ‘force’ the two images into a kind of dependency and mutual ‘sacrifice’; this may in turn enhance the pair even more if they were separated and independent. The music-image is and always has been a ‘legitimate character’ in the film.

And finally, it takes at least two, the director and the composer, and sometimes also a sound or music editor - to collaborate in bringing to the birth of the composer’s music. This collaboration is quite essential to the hierarchy of the making, as the director, whose task here is to foresee the full picture even before it is complete. This creates the meeting of two individual characters and personalities, whose concept of Image may or may not be different from each other’s; yet, they will need to produce the best of this highly psychological encounter to the extent that both can agree on the result. Thus the creation of the music-images in film starts with an interpersonal psychological discourse attempting to result in the gestation of one agreed and acceptable new image that will end up as the ‘live’ image alongside the visual image.

Although this interpersonal psychological process is beyond the scope of this thesis, it might call for research and exploration of successful results but also of cases “when film and music won’t work together”.\textsuperscript{206} This mutual process of bringing forth a new image - the music image - starts and progresses consciously between the personalities involved. The end result, the output of this ‘creation’ involves both the conscious and unconscious faculties of the music creator(s), the very same way that the director’s story/script interpretation evolves and produces results.

\* \* \*

- 117 -
PART III

CLOSE ENCOUNTERS OF THE MUSICAL KIND: AN

ANALYSIS OF THE MUSIC-IMAGE IN THREE FILMS

Introduction

This part will endeavour to test the Jungian Music-Image hypothesis by examining three films, thus connecting theory to practice. These three films have been chosen to represent different styles and genres from different decades in an attempt to encompass a wide range of musical elements and approaches. The aim of this task is to point to the ways the Music-Image can work in film beyond the style and genre used in this age of narrative diversity. It must be emphasised, however, that while the methodology and approach in creating this image may be understood and read systemically, the viewer’s interpretation of the image can be individually different, given the personal, musical and cultural differences existing in the core of the enigmatic (and at times mysterious) nature of music. The three selected films are:

1. Taxi Driver – 1976, directed by Martin Scorsese, original music by Bernard Herrmann
2. Nuit et brouillard (Night and Fog) – 1955, directed by Alain Resnais, original music by Hanns Eisler
Addressing the question of film interpretation, Chion (2006) discussing Eyes Wide Shut, argues that:

“A film's exegesis always provides matter for discussion as, unlike a novel, where it is accepted that Anna Karenina is above all Anna Karenina, it is often based on the generalisation of a particular image or character. But what rights have we to generalise what we see, giving it a different, more general or symbolic meaning from that which it has in the story, for example by regarding a character as emblematic of a category? In other words, can and should we regard Alice Harford, the young, white, American doctor's wife, played by Kidman, as representative of young, white, American doctors' wives, or of young, white, American women, or of young women, and so on? Theoretically we should see only particular stories; yet we know that a film often advances a view of a more general situation. There is surely something of every woman in Alice, of every man in Bill, while their marriage has something of every marriage” (p. 39).

In the films chosen here, even if we wish to address primarily the music-image, we can not do so by ignoring the other elements included. Thus one’s interpretation of the music in a film can be equally attached to one’s interpretation of the characters and the entire narrative. “With Eyes Wide Shut, as with 2001: A Space Odyssey,” – says Chion,

“there is a great temptation to construct the 'perfect interpretation', which would mean that the film would no longer be any more than a coded message made transparent. The disadvantage of this approach is that it erases everything which brings a work alive and consists of details of texture and particular effects which do not necessarily have anything to do with the main theme” (p. 35).

207 Eyes Wide Shut; Stanley Kubrick, 1999
The right way to work on a film, Chion believes, - “to avoid too closed an interpretation - seems to me to be to watch it several times with no precise intentions. … As in a police inquiry, one should not set up any hierarchies or look in any particular direction. One should not banish emotions and projections, but rather bring them to light, formulate and be aware of them, let them float” (Chion (2006), p. 35).

Any style and usage of music in film may reflect its time of making. This ‘time-stamp’ is revealed by the specific musical style, recording and picture/music mixing techniques and the musical usage ‘philosophy’ of that era. When dissecting a film we must take into account its global properties before going into further inquiry of particular scenes and sequences inside the film. The logical next step in such a quest is to explore each sequence that contains music while paying attention to the no-music zones immediately before and after that scene. By so doing we will actually be ‘reverse-spotting’ the film, as if we were going to build the film’s music-images from scratch.208

As already mentioned at the end of Part II – it takes both the director and the composer (and often a sound or music editor) to bring the composer’s music to term for a new film. This process can be fraught with difficulty. Many directors use the temp track throughout the process of creating the film. This temp track may be any kind of music that the director feels to supply – though temporarily – his musical needs for the filming/production to develop; it may vary from using parts of one musical work to using scattered pieces of music from different works and styles – anything that makes the director feel the right rhythm and mood, the equivalent of

208 Spotting is the name given to the stage where the musician, director and/or the music-editor first meet over a rough-cut to decide where in the film, what kind of music, measured cues etc’ are to be made.
which he/she wishes to finally get from the composer. But regardless of the director’s personal taste in music, this situation may create some clashes between director and composer, as the director may build up an expectation for some very similar music from the composer, who may not necessarily agree (and probably will become very unhappy ‘copying’ others’ music). At times, the personality/artistic fine (or rough) dynamics between the two creators can go very sour; such was the case of Alex North’s score for 2001: A Space Odyssey (Kubrick, 1968). Gorbman (2006) explains the birth of that insensitively unhappy ‘collaboration’:

“In the process of making 2001: A Space Odyssey (UK/USA, 1968), the director appears to have made a definitive shift: henceforth he would bring pre-existing music to the fore, sometimes instead of, sometimes in addition to music specially commissioned from screen composers. As is well known, during post-production on 2001, he quietly replaced Alex North's original score with orchestral and choral pieces that had at first been used as temp tracks during production. The change came as a cruel shock for North, who only found out that his work had been jettisoned when the completed film was released.” (p. 4)

Nevertheless, the viewer is not aware of any of the film creators’ professional relationship; he/she gets to see and hear only the final result. Having said that, we must also bear in mind that – at least in the case of the music – the viewer may or may not have such a knowledge of, say, music styles, history of music, etc’; he may not know which operatic aria heard on screen comes from which opera, and whether its Italian libretto connects to the immediate scene he/she is watching. In other words, the knowledge of the spectator may make the subtlety of the filmic event greater or lesser; yet, the very presence of music will have the capacity “to do something” to the spectator’s ear and eye minds, with or without knowledge of music.
In 1979, an article by Martin Marks observed the following two intriguing notions; the first was:

“Because film communicates (at least potentially) through a conjunction of visual and auditory signals, research into film music requires an understanding of not one but two nonverbal systems of communication.”

This is then followed by a second notion:

“It would …appear that for scholarly inquiry into film music to advance, film ought to be studied with music at the center of observation rather than on the periphery - but this is far from an easy thing to do, at least when inside a theater.”

Marks then explains the difficulty in so doing thus:

“As we view a film, our minds must contend with the ever-changing content of the moving image and the soundtrack. The individual elements (not just music, but also lighting, camera angle, editing, and so forth) are submerged into the flow of images on the screen. Hence the engrossed audience rarely perceives these elements consciously; it is simply carried along by the stream of sights and sounds.”

Attempting to analyse these three films’ music we shall focus on both the music-element itself (‘music-as-music’) and the music-image as a specific image-entity in a specific film as part of the film-as-a-whole. Putting music at the centre of observation may be as exaggerated as ‘putting it on the periphery’; it is a part of the whole filmic

209 Marks, M. 1979, p. 282
210 Ibid, p. 284
211 Ibid.
experience. When trying to understand how the engaged audience perceives music in film we may need more than just sending it to the realm of the unconscious only. We shall also need to account for its relations with all systems of communication, non-verbal and verbal alike.\textsuperscript{212}

\[ * * * \]

\textsuperscript{212} The ‘amount’ of conscious vs. unconscious effect of music in film is of a flexible nature. It can depend on the way the creators put the music within the scene, whether technically (loudness) or philosophically (the type of music and its relation (if any) to other instances of music before, as well as its relations with all systems of communication, non-verbal and verbal alike.
1. Taxi Driver

Year: 1976
Director: Martin Scorsese
Script: Paul Schrader and Martin Scorsese
Music: Bernard Herrmann

Plot Synopsis

Travis Bickle (Robert De Niro) is a twenty six year old loner, an honourably discharged Marine (according to him), possibly a Vietnam veteran. He lives in Manhattan, (origins and hometown unknown) lonely, depressed, suffering from insomnia and living on pills. He keeps a journal and sends his parents letters, birthday and Christmas cards, he lies and tells them he works for 'the government'.

At the beginning of the film he applies for a taxi driving job and due to his chronic insomnia he asks for night shifts, a job he gets after impressing the personnel officer. Travis lives in a rundown apartment, where he spends his free sleepless hours and sometimes goes to the seedy porn theatres in central Manhattan. He works minimum of twelve hours a night, carrying passengers to every part of the big city, where he sees all the ugly sides of New York urban night life, a life made of pimps, hookers, cops, bursting hydrants and drunkards. The more encounters of this nature he has, the bitterer he becomes and ruminates about the filth and destruction of the city. He starts developing an apocalyptic vision for the Big Apple, declaring that "Some day a real rain will come and wash all this scum off the streets".

During this time Travis becomes infatuated with a young lady named Betsy (Cybill Shepherd), a volunteer for Senator Charles Palatine in his presidential election campaign. He starts following her and eventually introduces himself to her and slowly gets up the nerve he asks her for a date. She is intrigued and agrees to go with him for coffee, during which - and through the sweet talking - he sympathises with her 'loneliness', convincing her that her work partner really does not care about her. Due to lack of social skills or just insensitivity, Travis invites Betsy to go with him to the movies. He takes her to a hard-core pornographic film, and the date ends abruptly.
with Betsy leaving the cinema and calling for a taxi. He phones her but she hangs up; she does not wish to see him again. He confronts her at the campaign office and shouts at her saying that she will burn in hell like the others.

Travis grows angrier; now he believes that the senator (Betsy's boss) is to be blamed for his own failure and adds him to the list of the 'scum'. He next purchases some guns and knives, starts harsh indoor physical training while talking to his own reflection in the mirror. He's got plans... While late shopping at the local grocery a black armed robber enters, who threatens the owner and demands money. The robber is unaware of Travis’ presence on the other side of the shop. Travis sneaks up from behind and shoots the robber. Remembering that his guns are not registered he leaves the place in a hurry.

Travis bumps into Iris (Jodie Foster), a twelve years old hooker, and wants to be with her. She sends him to her nearby pimp, "Sport" (Harvey Keitel) to do the business. He then goes with her into the shabby hotel room, but instead of having sex he tries to convince her to abandon this way of life. They have breakfast the next morning, and he becomes obsessed with convincing her to go back home to her parents in Pittsburgh, Ohio. Sport seduces her to stay.

Travis is next seen with a Mohawk haircut, and armed with his guns he is off to senator Palantine's support rally planning to shoot the senator (a failed attempt, as the Secret Service guys spot something in time). Travis flees to his taxi, now hastily driving to "Alphabet City" (on the Lower East Side). Confronting Sport, he shoots him then storms into the brothel, shooting anyone on his way. He is shot too but survives and manages to find Iris. The police arrive and put an end to the gory scene.

Travis is now regarded a 'hero' who triumphed evil. Iris goes back to her parents, Travis regrows his hair in its normal style and he even picks up Betsy as a passenger in his taxi. Smilingly he does not respond to her words of regret and chivalrously refuses to take her taxi fare.

* * *
**Music**

Many Italian and Italian-American directors\(^{213}\) have been labeled “operatic”, Scorsese included, mainly for their flamboyant editing and camerawork. “But what is most operatic - and nightmarish - about TAXI DRIVER is the conversion of its principal elements (music, imagery, even characters) into motifs. The circularity of a cab driver's movements makes his existence peculiarly susceptible to the recurrence of motifs; in Travis Bickle's case, they recur like the Furies.”\(^{214}\)

“On the one hand” – says Michner,

“…it underscores, in the most old-fashioned manner, the film's every dramatic moment and shift of mood, approaching at times the effect of a sledgehammer. On the other hand, it heightens, by its very qualities as an old-fashioned movie score, the dreamlike nature of TAXI DRIVER, proclaiming it not a slice of life but an exercise essentially in surrealism, a *movie.*” (Ibid)

And indeed, this ‘old-fashioned movie score’ acts magically as a trickster between ‘life’ (linear reality, here-and-now) and what Michner defines as ‘surrealism’, which, in Taxi Driver’s case is one of psychologically multiple realities.\(^{215}\) Travis Bickle is

\(^{213}\) With the exception of the neo-realists and Antonioni
\(^{214}\) Michner, 1976, p. 4
\(^{215}\) The Trickster is one of Jung’s complex archetypes. Appearing in many disguises such as the fool, the prankster, a clown, mischievous gender-role changer etc., he represents non-conformity to authority by tricking its ways out of their boundaries. Like any other archetypes and archetypal images, the trickster can be a helper or a destroyer. Religions and mythologies are rich in the trickster's images in many different forms and with very different functions. They often even become depicted as culture heroes. Such is the case of Prometheus who tricked the gods and stole fire to give it to the mortals (for which he was punished...) The Garden of Eden serpent tricked Eve to eat of the apple of knowledge (and both got punished...). These are only two classical examples of the trickster's dual-intention and risky behaviour. The trickster can be found in every walk of life, whether expectedly or when the least expected; it is sometimes our enemy and sometimes our benefactor. Its main theme may be "Stay away from trivia"... The trickster is capable of hopping between the multiple realities of the psyche and as such it can also be the reality-connector.
not a clinically schizophrenic paranoid; he is a lonely man, engulfed by his own bleak realities and at times resorts to delusional outbursts of hope, soon to be shattered by a fierce clash of those realities. In very traditional ways, Herrmann’s motif melody depicts Travis’ loneliness, the urge to escape his situation and to build a romantic sense of communication.

Taxi Driver was Bernard Herrmann’s last work, which he completed just a few hours before his death in 1975. Like his earlier outstanding film scores [Orson Welles’ Citizen Kane (1941) and Alfred Hitchcock’s Psycho (1960)], Taxi Driver is written in the motif tradition of the ‘old school’, a method that is shown to be the very right choice for the film’s motif-based structure. Travis’ quiet, subdued and lethargic side usually twins with a slow, soulful jazzy saxophone melody that accompanies him through the film, appearing many times. (Fig. 2)

\[
\text{SAXPHONE}
\]

![Saxophone](image)

**Fig. 2** Travis’ peaceful-side motif

The other motif of the score is not melodic. It is a succession of clustered chords, sometimes under a rhythmical pattern, and sometimes as hallucinatory, non-
rhythmical texture; sometimes in very low and dark colouration and sometimes in the eerie sound of muted brass instruments. This type of flexible, non-melodic music lends itself both to events and moods. As such it functions perfectly with all three suggested functions – Incidental, Transitional and Conditional – separately, jointly or overlapping. Even when researched from a different categorical approach, the first of composer Aaron Copland’s “five ways in which music serves the screen”\(^{216}\) being music’s ability to create a more convincing atmosphere of time and place\(^{217}\), works strongly in Herrmann’s Taxi Driver’s score. The jazz style – especially the “Travis motif” melody puts the film’s scenery in New York, the music identifying with the ‘jazzy’ aspects of the Big Apple. The other, non-melodic music takes the viewer from one time frame to another, enticing him to travel along with it. As time and space in the film play within relatively narrow borders, both musical motifs trick us superbly into moving from one place to another, from indoors to outdoors, from dawn to midnight. In Butler’s own words,

“Time and music are intimately related and the consequences of that relationship can have a significant impact on our understanding and perception of the passage of film time: both within the world of the film and our own experience of the film unfolding before us”\(^{218}\)

He then adds the following:


\(^{218}\) Ibid. Referred to as ‘Story Time’ and ‘Viewing Time’ by Bordwell, D. & Thompson, K. (1985), *Fundamental Aesthetics of Sound in the Cinema* in Weis & Belton (1985)
"I want to concentrate on Taxi Driver as a summation of Herrmann’s compositional style and the temporal functions fulfilled by it. In extra-textual terms alone, it is difficult to think of a film score marked more poignantly by the passing of time than Taxi Driver." (Ibid, p. 52)

It is quite intriguing to follow David Butler’s article bearing the title “The Days Do Not End: Film Music, Time and Bernard Herrmann” as it focuses on Taxi Driver to make his case of three suggested music-in-film categories - or in his own words: “three ways in which music can assist our understanding of a film’s temporal properties” - which he describes as Anachronism, Navigation and Expansion. As one explanation for choosing this particular film he argues that

“…one of the distinctive features of Herrmann’s composing for film was his understanding of the potential for music to distort and expand the audience’s perception of film time.” (Ibid)

Mentioning Anachronism in conjunction with Copland’s categories, Butler argues that

“Rather than endorsing Copland’s first function, the vast majority of classical Hollywood film scores feature an anachronistic use of music, albeit one motivated by standardisation rather than artistic decisions regarding the use of musical anachronism to comment on or modify the audience’s response to the on-screen action.” (Ibid)

While all this relates to tackling the historical-time vs. music-time, he does remind us that “the film audience does not necessarily hear anachronistic music as ‘wrong’” and that “Neither does it follow that our understanding of the associations generated

---

219 Butler, D. (2006) [As discussed on the previous page].
by a particular musical idiom guarantee a particular interpretation. The cultural code attached to music may operate as an effective (albeit often clichéd) shorthand (bagpipes for Scotland, brass bands for Yorkshire, accordions for Paris etc.) but it can all too easily result in generalisation and misinterpretation. Claudia Gorbman falls into this very trap in her comment that “if one hears Strauss-like waltzes in the strings, it must be turn-of-the century Vienna.” (Ibid)

Butler is interested more in the deliberate use of anachronism, rather than its default use (i.e. late orchestral romanticism as the standard idiom for classical Hollywood film music). Referring to a well known ‘deliberate anachronism’ he brings forward some writings on Kubrick’s use of Strauss’ ‘Blue Danube’ waltz. One study quoted by him is the work of Timothy Scheurer, building on the observations of Royal Brown, arguing that “a late nineteenth century waltz provides more than just a comic interlude”:

“The composer Irwin Bazelon in fact states, ‘The waltz is Muzak – an endless flow of rerecorded, sentimental musical pap, heard in any air terminal the world over’. The music, then, is conventional, written in the idiom of not only muzak but of much of film scoring since the 1930s, and as a result it suggests a world of order, circumscribed behavior, values, norms, and manners – a world much like ours, except 30–odd years in the future [. . .], we are witnessing extraordinary technological achievement that has now become part of our ordinary everyday lives.”

Relating to Bernard Herrmann’s usage of anachronism, Butler says that:

---

“Bernard Herrmann’s score for Taxi Driver also employs musical anachronism as a means of imparting information about the state of mind of its cinematic narrator, in this case the unreliable narrator that is Travis Bickle” (Butler, D. (2006),

then quoting Levinson saying that

“Herrmann’s music does not serve merely to inform us about Travis’s mental life or to second redundantly what other elements of the film establish about his mentality, but rather enters into making it fictional in the film that Travis’s mental life is a certain way at a certain time.”

The above quoted may call for a slight objection: as stated before, the time (and space) of Taxi Driver is ‘locally confined’ and the ‘Travis’ motif’ is not anachronistic to New York or the time in which the story takes place. Moreover, in any case Travis’ life and realities are not fictional; they are real.

The film starts with a strong and clear exposition of the two musical motifs combined – Motif B (dark chords) followed by Motif A (Travis’) then goes back to B. Travis’ motif (A) will follow him and accentuate his loneliness and softer side. Motif B is serving as a signifier of place, time and mood; while Travis’ motif brings forth a human softness, yearning for love and connection as if those were his benevolent shadow. (TD_Ex_01).

---

222 Even though appearing first I have deliberately marked the ‘chords-motif’ as B, due to the strong feeling that the melodic, jazzy motif (A) serves as a ‘centre’ of the full score, hence A.
223 All along the film, while motif B undergoes many variations motif A does not change drastically (except at the end of the film).
224 The examples on the attached DVD are marked by the film name’s initials followed by underscore, then by Ex_ and the example number, e.g. TD_Ex_01.
The opening starts with a ‘hint’ of things to come, as the motif (B) is both dramatic and loud. The usage of the music level, all along the film is done by two methods: a) using musical dynamics, sometimes from \textit{ff} to \textit{pp} and everything in between, as written by the composer, and b) the director/music-editor’s decision on level (volume). In this example we are first ‘introduced’ to the quite threatening mood of motif B, only to merge with the soft and smooth Travis’ motif (A) playing along a close-up of his face, mainly his eyes. This then merges again into a much harsher moody B, then back to the smooth tune over a close-up of Travis’ face. In less than two minutes the viewer is already ‘conditioned’, yet, with question marks as for what to anticipate. As the B motif already changes within this first two minutes and yet it is ‘attached’ to the view of the city at night, the possible conditioned anticipation is that “when I hear this music I will be taken to see New York”. At the same time, the transition to the mellow saxophone playing motif A ‘in front of De Niro’s eyes’ is such a contrast – in texture, harmony, melody and colouration - that the viewer might easily ‘condition himself’ to believe that Travis is the ‘good guy’ as the viewer knows nothing yet.

The haunting beauty and softness of Travis’ motif (which appears eleven times along the film) suffers some cracks in our positive conditioning that initially it inflicts, as the story unfolds. While we are lured to attach this music to the positive, maybe even sensitive and human qualities of Travis, we learn about his not-so-positive sides as the film progresses, until another aspect of his character is revealed, that of a mentally disturbed person. In any event, the Travis’ motif conditioning power is so strong that for us, at times, Travis and the saxophone melody seem the same entity. In other words – Travis’ motif is the music-image of Travis the man, with all his
qualities, positive and negative. In Jungian terminology, Travis’ music-image stands for Travis’ Self and Shadow combined.  

Most of the music in Taxi Driver is non-diegetic. There are three cases of music diegesis, though; the first one is the sound of drumming played on the street when Travis and Betsy walk towards the cinema theatre. Although it is a non-pitched music the jazz-style imitation of the ‘virtuoso’ street drummer is undoubtedly an artistic music (TD_Ex_02). The second is a song on Travis’ television set that he is watching after returning from the corner shop, where he had just shot a black robber. The song coming from the TV is “Late for the Sky” by Jackson Browne, and it has, apparently, no particular meaning to the film, parallel to Travis’ empty face while watching. (TD_Ex_03).

Yet, the third case is a real enigma. It is Travis’ motif, the very same haunting sax melody; only it is played from a vinyl gramophone player by Sport (Harvey Keitel) the pimp to his twelve-year-old hooker Iris (Jodie Foster), trying, while dancing with her, to soft-talk her about how much he loves her. Before that, and following her breakfast with Travis she apparently has told Sport about her doubts regarding her life as a prostitute (TD_Ex_04). The usage of Travis’ motif seems to make no sense and has attracted considerable speculation. Butler, in discussing his ‘second function’ – Navigation – being the referential function of music in film, involving mainly the work of motif and leitmotif (in the Wagnerian sense or any other), attempts to address

---

225 Both Self (with capital S) and Shadow are Jungian archetypes. Here we are encountering their earthly manifestations as archetypal images. Some may argue that it is his Ego we are encountering; yet it is my understanding that the non-Shadow side of him is expressed in circumstances that go beyond Ego.

226 Due to the popularity of “American Bandstand” a popular television show of the time, in which this song is played on screen, it may make reference by insinuation to a part-of-life, day by day continuum as well.
the mystery of using Travis’ motif under an event that does not have Travis on the screen:

“In Taxi Driver, awareness of the referential function of film music provides us with the means to make sense of one of its most curious moments, one in which music is prominent. The vast majority of the film is relayed from Travis’ point-of-view with the jazz melody expressing …his inner thoughts. Yet there is one instance of the jazz melody playing in which Travis is not present.”

According to Butler, “In the script, Sport is described as putting some ‘slow soul music on the stereo’ but in the film the record he plays to seduce Iris is none other than Travis’ ‘melody in the head’: the jazz theme for alto saxophone. It’s a moment that calls into question our understanding of the melody’s previously established referential function.” From the viewer’s point of view, the explanation of what and how it was meant in the script is probably irrelevant, as he/she is not familiar with the ‘original intention’; he or she can only absorb and judge by what is on screen. Butler then declares that

“Taken as a whole and guided by our awareness that the jazz melody refers to Travis’ psyche …a different interpretation of this scene emerges in which the dance between Sport and Iris can be understood as being a projection of what Travis imagines is taking place in the apartment, and his delusion that Sport is appropriating his personal theme to deceive Iris furthers his hatred of Sport and the world that he represents. An understanding of the function of the leitmotif in film music, then, transforms this scene into a more complex moment that adds to the film’s already compelling psychological portrait and takes the scene out of a more straightforward linear sequence of events.”

---

227 Butler (2006) p.58
228 Ibid, italics mine
229 Ibid, p. 59
While the event itself (Sport’s dance and seduction of Iris) is linear, both in the narrative and a psychological sense, the imposing of Travis’ motif is not, as the viewer has already and several times before become ‘conditioned’ to the equation “Motif A = Travis”. The assumption that we are witnessing a projection of Travis’ imagination could make some sense, but equally so could the assumption that this is Iris’ projection of a new fantasy just ‘instilled’ in her by Travis, the Rescuing Knight. To support the second assumption we need to continue watching that scene, which is cut by shooting sound of Travis’ pistol training and his preparation for his ‘mission’. (TD_Ex_05). As Travis left Iris a letter and money to go back to her family, it is clear that his initial mission’s target was not Sport, the enslaver of the innocent girl, but rather Senator Palentine, who is our Don Quixote’s windmill. It is more likely to have been Travis’ projection had the rescue of Iris, his Dulcinea del Toboso, being the centre of his psychological projection; alas, it was not to be so. Travis’ motif appears again during this long scene when he leaves a letter and money for Iris to go back to her parents. In this sub-scene the music follows him the way we have already heard before. Had she gotten this letter and money and decided to return to Pittsburgh Ohio, her ‘rescue’ would not have been so violent. It is likely then to assume that it became so following the failure of his ‘original plan’.

The third function of music in film according to Butler – Expansion – is described by him as “aiding the rhythmic flow of a scene, uniting a series of disparate shots into a continuous montage for example and speeding up the passage of story time.” (p. 59) He quotes Chion who defines it as follows:

“Music can aid characters in crossing great distances and long stretches of time almost instantaneously. This use of music is fairly frequent, ever since the
beginning of sound. In King Vidor’s Hallelujah protagonist Zeke moves through several locales during the singing of one spiritual, ‘Going Home’: a boat on the Mississippi, the roof of a train, a prairie [. . .]. In Vidor’s film music gives the characters winged feet; it functions to contract both space and time.”

This category is somewhat similar to this thesis’ category of Transition, only with a few differences. Whereas Chion deals with this subject under ‘Relative offscreen space and absolute offscreen space’ and ‘temporal immobilisation’, Butler turns to anthropologist Claude Lévi-Strauss’ aid, saying that:

“Because of the internal organisation of the musical work, the act of listening to it immobilises passing time; it catches and enfolds it as one catches and enfolds a cloth flapping in the wind. It follows that by listening to music, and while we are listening to it, we enter into a kind of immortality.”

The notion of immobilising time and the sense of immortality may intrigue the philosophical rather the psychological mind. Lévi-Strauss’ statement that “Myth and music are both languages which, in their different ways transcend articulate expression” will not be endorsed by this thesis, which rejects the ideas of both music and myth being languages, even when “transcending articulate expression”. Both music and myth are containers of images connected by a ‘rational’ arrangement of structure, narrative and so on. The film-music function of transition (or expansion in Butler’s view) does not ‘paralyse’ or ‘immobilise’ time, but rather, here, it tends to ‘skip’ or even ‘ignore’ time. This quality is parallel to the mechanism of the dream.

---

231 Ibid, p. 82
233 Lévi-Strauss, C. (1975)
234 See PART I chapter 6.1
when time and space do not necessarily comply with linearity and rational continuity. In dreams, any object can transfer in time and space or transform into something else, leaving the dreamer with the abstraction of non-linear realities. Taxi Driver’s scene discussed above exhibits the transitions from Sport-seducing-Iris (with underlying music from ‘another reality’), followed by the new phase in Travis’ life – the preparation for killing – jumping to the character of the good hearted, the damsel-in-distress rescuer, leaving a letter and money for her - back with ‘his’ music…Time, space and emotion – all change and interchange within four minutes of the scene without a linear chronology.

The capacity of filming technologies allows leaps in time and space that in turn allow the condensation of chronological events so that it is possible to ‘shrink’ a story spanning over any period of time into a ninety minute film. In a ‘traditional’ manner of filming this condensing will not turn the story into a dream, assuming that despite the editing cuts the story will still keep a linear chronology. But a scene may start to resemble a dream if the cuts and jumps ignore chronology and linear continuity. The technique of confusing time and space in film became a desired artistic expression that makes the spectator’s mind more ‘active’ than just following events. The process of recombining elements into a meaningful order becomes a task that may at times remind us of trying to ‘decipher’ a dream we had last night.

In Taxi Driver there is a wonderful synchronisation of visual image with music-image in doing just this – making events a part of a whole story while at the same time providing these events the ability to become ‘self sufficient’ entities that call for our fractal meaning-making psychological processes. While Travis’ motif (A) is
generally ‘stable’ in that it sticks to Travis throughout the film, (apart from in the enigmatic Sport and Iris scene), motif B undergoes many changes – from minute to large – mainly in order to ‘catch up’ with both place/time and emotional changes that happen throughout. When related to events to come, these changes accentuate the atmosphere directly connected; thus New York at night may be calm and peaceful at times, or dark and threatening at others.

The genius of Bernard Herrmann, coming from a traditional ‘school’ of film music, with its huge orchestra, long melodies and heavily leaning on classical music, transformed most of that school’s elements (melody, harmony, counterpoint and orchestra size), bringing in the idea of the motif. In Taxi Driver (and in other scores as well) Herrmann abandons the classical-music sound in favour of a jazz combo\(^{235}\) and the heroic melodies in favour of a jazzy relatively short tune that allows improvisation as a part of the style.\(^{236}\) Butler detects “the rejection of extended melodic lines; the emphasis on instrumental and harmonic colour; distinctive groupings of instruments as opposed to a reliance on the large-scale orchestra; a predilection for small musical ‘cells’ and the use of the ostinato device in particular” (Butler, p. 60). In Taxi Driver, Herrmann brilliantly merges the classical ostinato\(^{237}\) with the jazz ‘walking-bass’ to transform the heavy clustered chords from static to motional. Based on that walking-bass and in less then two minutes we can follow a day in the life of Travis Bickle’s first weeks of cab driving in New York – with highs, lows and neutral emotion achieved by extreme musical dynamics (TD_Ex_06).

\(^{235}\) Though he employs instruments such as a harp which is not very likely to be found in a jazz combo.

\(^{236}\) Similar ‘philosophy’ takes place in Hitchcock’s Psycho when he abandons the full orchestra for the string section only.

\(^{237}\) From Italian: stubborn. A repeated motif or phrase, usually in the same key but may change the key in favour of harmony change, thus preserving only the rhythmical pattern.
Frith (1998) elaborates on the nature of the stubbornly repeated ostinati, saying that “…repetition (which is central to our understanding of rhythm) is equally central to our understanding of time – it is only as things recur that there can be said to be movement in time” (p. 151).

Quoting Frith stating that “experience of ‘timelessness’ actually describes an out-of-the-ordinary attention to time”\(^\text{238}\), Butler suggests that “…this principle is at work in Herrmann’s use of the ostinato. As the short phrase is heard repeatedly, the audience is given the opportunity to memorise its structure and anticipate its return, the legato tempo of many of Herrmann’s ostinati making them easier to commit to memory” (Butler, p. 60).

A very fine example for Herrmann’s exciting use of the walking-bass ostinato can be seen and heard at the beginning of the film, alongside Travis’ starting his taxi driving job, reading aloud the letter he sends to his family and roaming around the streets of New York (TD\_Ex\_06). This piece of brilliant music appears on the film’s soundtrack CD under the title “Thank God for the Rain” (TD\_Ex\_06\_aud). “The cue” – says Butler –

“…is founded on a steady, rising walking bass figure (four basses were used by Herrmann for the score) over which a sustained chord (alternating between the brass and the woodwind) increases in volume until the bass pattern begins to climb all over again with a different sustained chord, now playing more quietly than the first. The effect is of a gradual increase in tension then its eventual dissipation as the sustained chords swell and are then released: a musical inhalation and exhalation of breath.” (Butler, p. 61)

Herrmann had always preferred short phrases (or motifs) to long and complex ones (such as in some of Wagner’s leitmotifs). He explained his philosophy of this subject saying that:

“The short phrase is easier to follow for audiences, who listen with only half an ear. Don’t forget that the best they do is half an ear”

“The short phrase” – adds Brown – “also serves as a more manipulable building block better suited than a developed theme to the rapidly changing nature of the cinema and its edited flow of images” (Brown, p. 154). These two technical points of view call for a reminder: some directors prefer cutting the film to the music, and some choose to cut the music into the picture. Some demand precise music timing for change and some prefer streaming music more ‘abstractly’ into the film. There is no doubt that for a tightly-cut film inserting and editing short phrases is easier to work with, no matter what is one’s editing method of choice. Though Travis’ motif (A) is a slow tempo ‘standard’ eight-bar melody, the choice of instrument and the easy flow allow fading in and out to be used without damaging the motif.

When music employs part (or all) of the above techniques it can create uncertainty in the viewer’s music mind. Herrmann’s usage of the short phrases and the ostinato-based chords takes us through the discomfort of “not being sure” as to what is about to transpire. Meyer postulates that “the human need to envisage leads us to conceptualise the world as being more or less predictable”, and therefore “…continual

---

239 Brown, R. S., p. 291 (interview with Bernard Herrmann)
succession without functionally ordered structure (as in cosmology, evolution, and human history) creates the uncomfortable uncertainty of unordered endlessness.”

Despite Herrmann’s personal belief that audiences “listen with only half an ear”, even this amount of ear can easily absorb the uncertainty in the scene of Travis being thrown out from the Senator’s campaign office after his tantrum of anger directed at Betsy, who refuses to see him. He is back in his cab. The walking-bass-under-chords (motif B) is running and changing variations while he picks up a weird man (Martin Scorsese) who insists that the cab driver stops and looks up to a lit window where a silhouette of a woman is seen. This woman, according to the passenger, is his own wife; only the flat is not his, it is some black guy’s flat. Our deranged passenger, who talks to Travis non-stop, tells him that he is going to kill his wife… Throughout the entire scene (over two minutes) Travis (whose only word is ‘yeah’) is apparently more baffled than the viewers, with the passenger behaving so obnoxiously. There is a great amount of uncertainty, increasingly driven by the music as to who is the more perplexed – the viewer or Travis himself… (TD_Ex_07)

Following his total failure to reconnect with Betsy, the volunteer worker at Senator Palentine’s presidential campaign office, Travis starts revealing his other lurking realities; he now embarks on important missions of ‘cleaning the filth’, the first exemplar of which is his attempt to kill the Senator. His failure in love is projected upon the VIP behind his failed love object; he is to be blamed for the failure. Now Travis buys arms: not one gun, but some guns. He starts training physically and improving his shooting skills, sanctifying himself to the holy mission ahead – Killing

---

The non-melodic music (motif B) accompanies his self-preparation in stabbing chords (TD_Ex_08). But that mission fails and he has to flee for his life, being spotted by the secret service men. His delusional sense of mission grows further; instead, he determines go to and rescue Iris, the twelve years old prostitute. He drives to find Sport; an unpleasant talk between the two ends with Travis shooting Sport, then goes on a rage shooting inside the ‘hotel’ where he was first taken to by Iris, leaving a field of blood and corpses everywhere. Travis himself has been shot and is bleeding heavily, but at that stage we do not know whether he is to die or to stay alive. There is no music to this scene; just the natural sounds of gun shots, objects falling, death cries and finally the bitterly crying voice of Iris, begging him not to shoot the elderly landlord. Was it a director’s decision to have no music in the gruesome scene? Or maybe the composer had not written it, as he died so unexpectedly? For the viewers with musical imagination these natural sounds are themselves music, as insane as is the entire nightmarish scene.

Herrmann’s music enters into the scene from the point where a policeman enters the slaughter room. The heavy and dark chords dive below and hover above the bloody floors, stairs and walls, adding timpani into the nightmare drama. And here is when Herrmann ‘breaks the expectation’ – he adds fragments of the melodic A-motif; only these fragments are no longer sweet and peaceful. Instead of the sexily caressing saxophone there are now aggressive, coarse and shrilling French Horns. These horns

---

241 His first killing, that of the black robber at the corner shop, was not planned: he just happened to be there, having a gun with him. But this event put his mind into a ‘mission’ mode…
also take us to the outside, where crowds of neighbours gather and police cars are arriving. (TD_Ex_09). 242

Travis manages to survive, recover and even go back to being a taxi driver. A thank you letter from Iris’ parents is read with his own voice-over, motif A being quietly played in the background. (TD_Ex_10) He picks up Betsy as a passenger and has a short and formal conversation with her, again ‘accompanied’ by Travis’ motif. The melodic jazzy tune opens up into the end-film credits, leaving the viewer to wonder whether it is a ‘happy ending’, but not for long. The sweet melody merges down into the dark, heavy and sinister chords. Are these referring to the sinister face of New York City or to Travis’ unstable psyche? (TD_Ex_11)

**Conclusion**

The music-images of Taxi Driver are of two major types, different by nature and even quite opposing each other. They are sometimes treated as leitmotifs and at other times independently, remote from prior connection. The first one – which has been herein referred to as motif A – is a melody that repeats itself many times throughout the film and being a motif faithfully dedicated to some aspect of the protagonist, Travis Bickle. With the two exceptions - the Sport/Iris diegetic use and the fragments

242 Throughout this scene, Herrmann (who also wrote the score for Hitchcock’s ‘Psycho) uses a separation technique: the bird’s eye surrealist death shots are scored against ‘nightmarish’ sounds and shrills, while the use of the softer, dream-like harp sound return the viewer to a state of ‘reality-dream’ that of Travis and the people outside, watching the parade of death.
of it as a broken melody in rough and ‘unrealistic’ manner – this is the tune we have been conditioned to, accepting and grew to love. The other musical image is the opposite of the first as it ignores melody and works on the basis of constantly changing harmony and rhythm, creating a variety of movement – from very slow, almost static to fast and restless.

Being used in a rather ‘minimalistic’ way, these images were made to stand for all film-music functions, sometimes individually and on other occasions combined. Acting as Travis’ persistent musical twin, his motif (A) accompanies him wherever he goes. Unless and until this music-image ceases to be present and changes to the other motif, it brings forth the positive side of the man, the side of contemplative calmness and being a part of a peacefully ongoing space. This music is Travis’ very close and intimate alter-ego. Yet this alter-ego is also fragile and prone to mischief. Beyond it there is a killer lurking. Travis’ motif mainly functions as conditional; it makes the viewer ‘know he is here’ even before the visual asserts that fact, and it keeps our positive thoughts about him reinstated time and again, setting a constant frame of positive mood. Some may find the haunting melody also working as a transitory theme, as there are some scenes where the music underlies Travis’ driving from place to another in the big city. The very choice of the solo instrument carrying the tune – the alto saxophone – makes, first and foremost a statement of the music style chosen, escaping the traditional classical-music style. The saxophone’s capacity of utmost smooth softness makes it a great choice in presenting Travis’ soft and non violent side.
Motif B is another creature altogether. Carrying the burden of being multifunctional it does not have a melody, just short blocks of chord progressions, a feature that allows high flexibility of usage. In his unique harmonic style coupled with a mastery of instrumentation and orchestration Bernard Herrmann turns a few clustered notes into vast worlds of fantasy, dream, horror and different realities.\textsuperscript{243} As condition bearers they may draw the viewer’s psyche straight into a approaching danger, or even a disaster. In other, ‘mellower’ cases these chords may just cause the feeling of remote alertness, whether predictable or not. The very quick change from motif A to any block of moving chords switches the viewer’s anticipation drastically. As transition, the chords put us in a state of readiness the moment they show up; we start travelling to wherever they’ll take us. Most of the transitions in Taxi Driver are in space rather than time, an essential element in moving around such a vast city like New York, hence the feeling that time is somewhat depending on space more than being an independent factor. The composer’s usage of faster or accelerated motion using walking-bass ostinati makes the feel of ‘real time’ vs. ‘film time’ sustainable. The accidental factor exhibited by motif B chord-progression is all over the film, attached to any momentary event. Here is where Herrmann uses his immense skill of colouration to make the very few chords into ‘something new’, the result of which is the viewer’s feeling of déjá vu (“Have I not heard this before?”) while ‘knowing’ it is a new event.

Because of the ‘minimalistic’ use of music by repetition and/or close variation, the music-images of Taxi Driver are the images that ‘condense’ the huge city with its millions of dwellers into the small physical and psychological world of one person.

\textsuperscript{243} Herrmann’s command of instrumentation shows in his very skillful solo-instrument writing; his very delicate mastery of orchestration shows beautifully in his control of colouration using overtones created between instruments due to their harmonic and pitch conditions.
They turn the vastness into non-threatening; they make Travis Bickle’s psychic world a threat. In a miraculous way the music’s intensity makes us feel the discomfort of detachment – mainly by the use of repeats and contrast, dynamics and variations.

Even if Bernard Herrmann believed that ‘audiences listen with half an ear’ he undoubtedly managed to dictate so much into the meaning of the film. We may only wonder how would this be had they listened with both ears…

* * *
2. **Nuit et Brouillard (Night and Fog)**

Year: 1955  
Director: Alain Resnais  
Written by: Jean Cayrol & Chris Marker  
Narrator: Michel Bouquet  
Music: Hanns Eisler

**About the Film**

*Night and Fog* is a documentary film made in 1955, ten years after the end of WW II. Its aim was to exhibit to the world the horrors and inhumanity that took place in the concentration camps, especially in the extermination camps of Auschwitz and Majdanek. It was made up of contemporary (1955) colour landscape scenes of the places of horror, contrasted by black and white archive film footage and still photography of the real horror that happened in those places. The commentary was written by Jean Cayrol, a survivor of a concentration camp himself, and music was composed by Austrian born Hanns Eisler.

* * *

**Documentary, Facts and Visuals**

“Broadly speaking, any film practice that has as its subject persons, events and situations that exist outside the film in the real world; also referred to as non-fiction film.”\(^{244}\)

Many people who lived the nightmare of *Night and Fog* perished at or before the time of making the film, with the exception of few of the victims who managed to

\(^{244}\) Blandford, Grant & Hillier (2004) p. 73
escape and survive the horrors and some perpetrators of these horrors who either got caught later and tried, or managed to die without ever getting caught. Some of the events in this documentary were filmed by Nazis and some by members of the Allied Forces that won the war and liberated the camps’ survivors. The situations depicted are bluntly shown in the face of the viewers.

Referring to the birth of modern documentary, Ben-Shaul argues that:

“The belief in the power of cinematographic reproduction and editing to reveal hidden aspects of reality was the cardinal rationale for modernist documentary filmmaking, both by filmmakers sharing this belief, and by those who manipulated it for ideological and even propagandistic purposes. Whatever the aims driving them, their cinematography and editing always involved a conscious and subjective manipulation given the necessity of selection and narrative deployment.”

Possibly, and due to the necessity of involving ‘conscious and subjective manipulation’ it is rather difficult to define and categorise traits, styles and functions of and inside documentaries; the functions of music – if and when used – are not less difficult to deal with. The development of the genre is described by Ben-Shaul thus:

“Aware of the problematic subjective import embedded in documentary shots and editing yet still believing in the medium's power to reveal some truth, two main and contradictory strains of documentary filmmaking developed during the 1960s. In the USA, Robert Drew and others initiated the Direct Cinema movement characterizing it as a ‘fly on the wall’ attitude towards the reality recorded. They used several handheld cameras to cover an event imparting a sense of liveliness and non-intervention as evident in their multi-camera

---

coverage of the 1960 Democratic Convention (*Primary, 1960*). In contrast the French anthropologist Jean Rouch initiated what he termed a *cinéma vérité* movement (a term borrowed from Vertov's newsreel series *Kino-Pravda/Film Truth*), in which the filmmaker made himself and his subjectivity present throughout the film, going beyond Vertov's manifestation of the filmmaking process by the constant interrogation of the premises guiding the coverage of events.”

In trying to classify Night and Fog using one of the above divisions it seems that *cinéma vérité* can not lend itself to the task, as the entire idea in the film is the distance from the objects and the non-involvement of the film’s creators. Yet, it will not be easy to describe Night and Fog as pure *Direct Cinema*, as the involvement of the poetic vocal narration and the music are elements – though external – that intervene and assist in creating a kind of ‘tolerability’ without which it would be very difficult to watch. ‘Sharpening’ this problematic difficulty, Bill Nichols says that:

“We need… to examine the formal structure of documentary film, the codes and units which are involved, in order to re-see documentary, not as a kind of reality frozen in the amber of the photographic image… but as a semiotic system which generates meaning by the succession of choices between differences, the continuous selection of pertinent features.”

Replacing the ‘semiotic system’ with psychological process allows room for the artistically added elements in a documentary, such as poetic vocal narration and music to join in the meaning-generating process as a part of the choices suggested by

---

246 Ibid, p. 25
247 Nichols, B., (1976) p. 35. Following the psychological line of this thesis, ‘semiotic system’ can be replaced by ‘psychological process’ as the semiotic narrows the discussed view down to language, while the latter allows greater versatility in ‘generating meaning’.
Nichols. Tackling the sea of definitions suggested for documentary films, Nichols suggests that:

“A more adequate definition of documentary would seem to require that it be placed as a genre alongside narrative, showing in what ways it merges with and departs from this parameter. For the moment, let me simply suggest that documentary may profitably be so examined as a genre with conventions and audience expectations like those of other genres, and that documentary does not form a simple opposition to the term narrative.”

This suggestion leaves a good deal of room for the acceptance of individual changes and for being freer in ‘borrowing’ cinematic ideas from non-similar genres. And yet it is Nichols himself who suggests six dominant modes that a documentary may contain or embody. His suggested documentary modes are:

1. Poetic  (Ivens, Bunuel & Dali, Fischinger, Menken)
   (Subjective, artistic expression)
2. Expository (Grierson, Flaherty, Ivens)
   (Narrator; "Voice of God")
3. Observational (Leacock, Pennebaker, Wiseman)
   (Window on the world)
4. Interactive  (Rouch, de Antonio, Connie Field)
   (Direct engagement between filmmaker and subject(s))

248 In ‘Introduction to Documentary’ (2002) Nichols states at its very beginning that “Every film is a documentary. Even the most whimsical of fictions gives evidence of the culture that produced it... In fact, we could say that there are two kinds of film: (1) Documentaries of wish-fulfilment and (2) documentaries of social representation” (p. 1)

249 Some scholars criticise or even contradict Nichols; Bruzzi (2000) states that ‘all types of documentary have existed at different times’ and ‘have often mixed styles’.
5. Reflexive (Vertov, Godmilow, Raul Ruiz)  
(Awareness of the process)

6. Performative (Resnais, Julien, Riggs)  
(Filmmaker as participant)

If we wish to simplify categories and classifications we may say that Night and Fog has more of the performative spirit, as this ‘mode’ emphasises the subjective nature of the creators as well as acknowledging the subjective reading of the audience; in addition, notions of objectivity are replaced by affect. The observational ‘mode’ with its non-intervening, neutral outlook of the object(s) suits perfectly the usage of both contemporary colour landscape photography of the real areas of events and archive footage that has not been ‘staged’ by the film’s creators. Moreover, Night and Fog is likely to be closer to the ‘Fly on the Wall’ spirit rather than that of cinéma verité.

As a film director Martin Scorsese has worked on many documentaries since the beginning of his career. In an interview with Raffaelle Donato he confesses to his belief that both fact-recording and fact-staging are natural impulses and that for him there is never any difference between fiction and nonfiction. He rationalises this view saying that:

“Edison wanted to record events that could not really be recorded, like the first execution in an electric chair. So he had to stage it. And then, once you get into staging, why stop at current events? You can go back and stage the past. You want to record the battle of San Juan Hill in the Spanish-American war? Stage

---

250 To mention but a few: Street Scenes (1970), Italianamerican (1974), The Last Waltz (1978), My Voyage to Italy (1999), and George Harrison: Living in the Material World (2011)
251 Donato & Scorsese, (2007)
252 Taxi Driver being a perfect example.
it. It’s a natural impulse, and so is recording. They go hand in hand. That’s why, for me, there was never any difference between fiction and nonfiction.” (p. 199)

When asked whether he remembered the first documentary film he saw Scorsese answers: “I couldn’t really separate documentary from fiction. I was just looking at the movies”. He also relates to what he calls ‘the documentary power’; his explanation of it can shed some bright philosophical (and practical) light of what underlies a documentary film:

“…it’s always the people who give you the truth as people. That’s why casting is so important – no matter how good the actor is, he or she has to bring something as a person that fits the role, which parallels the emotions or the situation of the character in some way. In documentary, unless the subject is ‘performing’ for the camera, the way they do in many of the documentaries made today, this truth can be directly transmitted – less easy to control, but direct. So I’m always trying to recreate in fiction that ‘documentary power’, when something unexpected happens, something immediate” (Ibid, p. 202)

“If the making of a film about concentration camps requires preliminary questioning” – says Pollock - “let me start with some fundamental ones about what an image of that world might concern in relation to two facets already put into play: the face as the site of humanness and alterity and the concentrationary universe as a place of a non-human dying.” She continues with exposing an individual example so strong that it can bear the entire terrifying subject of the film on its own shoulders:

“On 10 January 1946, Italian chemist and survivor of Auschwitz-Monowitz Primo Levi signed and dated a poem titled: Shemà. This means Listen! Shemà is

---

253 Ibid, p. 200
in the vocative, a command addressed to another. You - **listen!** Levi is quoting/repeating the opening line of the central and only Jewish declaration of monotheistic faith that is traditionally repeated twice a day on retiring and on rising. Levi's command to *Hear!* is, however, not aimed at fellow-believers. Written by an atheist, secular and politically-active Jewish-Italian scientist, this poetic invocation to pay attention calls to the radically other who never experienced what the writer has survived in that other universe, from which physically he returned but from which psychologically he can never fully return…” (Ibid)

Four elements - individually independent yet tightly complementary - make Alain Resnais’ Night and Fog a non-fictional fiction. A mobile camera that penetrates an unpeopled past; black and white footage of real people’s history, taken in real time; a poetic, yet coldly narrated commentary on the events of that time, and music that stands alone as such yet magically synchronises with all the other elements. But – and this is an elementary question that can be asked about any documentary – how do the building-block elements manage (or not) to keep a non-biased presentation of this film’s subject?

To start addressing this question we must be aware of some controversies surrounding this film. The very title of the film presents some questions as for the overall intention of the film. Taken from a volume of poetry published by Jean Cayrol after the end of the war, this title bears more than one meaning. As explained by Culbert.255

The title of the film, ‘Night and Fog’ stems from a notorious secret order, issued by Hitler on December 7, 1941, a day with special resonance because of the Japanese

---

attack on Pearl Harbour. Hitler, infuriated by armed resistance in occupied Western Europe and in particular France, decided to get tough. He may have remembered his Wagnerian opera. Richard Wagner, in Das Rheingold, has the dwarf Alberich steal the Rheinmaidens’s gold after donning the stolen Tarnhelm, or magic helmet: ‘Nacht und Nebel—niemand gleich!’ (’Night and Fog - no one is the same’). Hitler’s secret order, the Nacht und Nebel Decree, allowed members of the resistance to be treated in a very special way:

“In the occupied territories, offences by non-German civilians that are directed against the Reich ... that threaten their security and ability to strike, in principle always call for capital punishment ...Offences ... are to be tried in the occupied territories only if it is probable that death sentences will be passed on the offenders ... and that the trial and execution can speedily be carried out. If not ... principal offenders will be brought to Germany. Offenders who are brought to Germany will be tried by court-martial if special military interests make this necessary ... It should be said that they have been arrested and that the nature of the trial does not allow one to give further information.”

“Someone in France, or England, or America” – says Culbert – “who encounters the film title Nuit et Brouillard, or Night and Fog, thinks of Nazi Germany, or Hitler, or the Holocaust. This is not the case for a German. Bei Nacht und Nebel means ‘under cover of darkness; furtively; like a thief in the night. ‘Nacht-und-Nebel-Aktion means ‘hush-hush (esp. night-time) operation.’ The phrase is in regular German usage today, without any sense of reference to the Third Reich. The phrase was in regular usage before Hitler came to power. The phrase may well indicate something not quite ethical, but not something which will include murder or bodily harm.” (Ibid)

---

Criticising Resnais, Mowitt (1985) raises three questions regarding Night and Fog:

“First, what is at stake in having titled the film itself, Nuit et Brouillard? Second, is there any sense in which cinema itself, despite the grammatical problem, serves as a response to the question posed at the close of the film: “But, then, who is responsible?” Third, how is cinema’s relation to the historical production of the past enunciated by the film? Obviously these questions are neither independent nor exhaustive.”

Jean Cayrol (1911 – 2005) whose poem collection book, Nuit et Brouillard inspired the film, was himself a Nazi camp prisoner at Gusen concentration camp. Having joined the French Resistance he was betrayed and caught by the Germans in 1943. His life in the camp was unbearably difficult and he attempted to end his life by refusing food. Compassionately saved by a German doctor Johann Gruber he survived the war. While the full connotation of the term ‘Night and Fog’ was more appropriate to Cayrol’s situation and position as a political prisoner, some critics saw the usage of it as the wrong title to a film which is explicitly about the Jewish Holocaust, as the entire imagery deals with the most infamous grounds of Auschwitz and Majdanek, camps especially built for killing Jews. Some saw it as an insult, with or without deliberation. Robert Michael (1984) harshly criticises Resnais and Cayrol:

“Resnais and Cayrol do allow us to bear better what we see and to "feel better" about it. This is accomplished by ignoring particular historical facts and moral issues absolutely necessary for a real understanding of the Holocaust. They make the viewer's experience less, not more, disorienting, stinging, and enlightening by universalizing the guilt of the murderers for their crimes and doing the same with the moral irresponsibility of the rest of the world that stood...”

---

257 Mowitt (1985) p. 67
so silently by. An otherwise historically and morally valid work, Night and Fog omits the particularity of the Jewish Holocaust, and, in so doing, it emphasizes the universal at the expense of the particular. It allows an escape into a mythical evil-in-general or responsibility-in-general for those who should be presented with the specifics of the prodigious suffering of the Jews of the Holocaust. It silently buries the deaths of six million Jews in universal genocide. It sinks the specific case of the central victims in a sea of generalities, and the Jews vanish with hardly a trace.” (p. 36)

“No one can doubt the humanistic intent of Resnais and Cayrol” claims Michael; but – he adds:

“…their silence unintentionally mirrors Himmler's imperative that "in public we will never speak of ...the evacuation of the Jews, the annihilation of the Jewish people." The Nazis were out to destroy not only the bodies and souls of the Jews of the Holocaust, but also to eradicate them from the world's memory. In this sense, all who forget them is acquiescing in this aspect of the Nazi plan.” (Ibid)

Seeing the picture differently, Ohad Landesman finds Night and Fog’s 'globalisation' more effective for the greater cause:259

“Night and Fog is formally constructed as a visual synecdoche, evoking a major chapter of history from a few traces remaining. Moving from concrete evidence to general scenery, from fragmentation to universality and abstraction, the film never allows us to forget that the Holocaust concerned the extermination of millions of individuals; for a film with no characters or heroes, Night and Fog keeps the execution process basically dehumanized, turning its victims to collective signs for the Genocide. Resnais was blamed over and over again for not calling sufficient attention to the Jewishness of the atrocities; apart from several images of Stars of David, and a very well-known photograph of a

frightened Jewish child raising his hands before a German trooper during the liquidation of the Warsaw ghetto, the film fails to mention not only Jews, but also Germans or even Germany itself. The last sequence, a visualization of the argument concerning the banality of evil, abandons the detached modernist tone and ends up with a didactic cry: “Who is then responsible?” When there is nothing left but ruins and desolation, a tragic vision of a world destructed by an undetermined abstract force defines what would eventually become a recurring theme in Resnais’s work: the wrath of God.”

Returning to the four elements that make the film and looking back to Jung’s take on image we can then perceive them as four meta-images or image-containers. “Originally formulated as a concept, the image was experienced as companionate psychic presence.”

According to Samuels, Shorter and Plaut, Jung’s ‘most telling’ discovery “…could be that psyche itself does not proceed ‘scientifically’, that is, by way of hypothesis and model, but imagistically, that is, by the way of myth and metaphor” (Ibid). Jung expands the notion of image and its interpretation:

“It undoubtedly does express unconscious contents, but not the whole of them, only those that are momentarily constellated. This constellation is the result of the spontaneous activity of the unconscious on the one hand and of the momentary conscious situation on the other... The interpretation of its meaning, therefore, can start neither from the conscious alone nor from the unconscious alone, but only from their reciprocal relationship.”

Facts in public always have a ‘political’ element, as it is impossible to address any public without having a Weltanschauung, a stance of world-understanding. Hence the interpretation of a fact projected depends on the interpreter’s reciprocal relationship of conscious and unconscious contents constellating around the image(es) at a given

---

260 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986), p. 72
261 Jung, CW6, para. 745
time. The ‘political’ slant of interpreting certain given facts is – like in the case of religion or any other defensive belief – involved in the process of interpretation and meaning-making. Due to individual and collective different ‘political’ biases, a uniform interpretation of facts may not be easily possible. As it is then, no wonder that documentaries are differently interpreted; it is definitely so in our case of Night and Fog.

**Fog, Darkness and Music**

Along with Alban Berg and Anton Webern, Hanns Eisler (1898–1962) was one of Arnold Schoenberg’s protégés. As such he did adhere to his Master’s a-tonal, dodecaphonic music ideology; many of his compositions are, indeed, a-tonal. Yet, he underwent different phases and changes in his life-of-beliefs and at one phase he had ‘repented’ a-tonality in favour of re-communicating with the public’s human ear.

His close collaboration with Bertold Brecht shows a regression from the abandoned tonal-centre, or maybe, one may say, a progression towards understanding the collective human ear’s needs as opposed to the individualistic intellectual ones. This

---

262 In 1919, after a stint in the Austrian army during WW1, he [Eisler] started a four-year period of study under Arnold Schoenberg, who thought very highly of him. Eisler's time with Schoenberg coincided almost exactly with the transition from atonal to twelve-tone music, and after Anton von Webern and Alban Berg he was the first to write in the new technique. Schoenberg and Eisler quarrelled in 1926, when Schoenberg accused Eisler of "betrayal". At the root of this "betrayal" was Eisler's contention that the new music was living in "splendid isolation", and was actually and transparently lacking in content. For Eisler, the atmosphere of "elitism" in which the new music existed, its disdain for historical events which had literally unhinged the world (Eisler was thinking of the Marxist revolution), and the fact that the music "turned a deaf ear" to the conflicts of its times, its social confrontations, disturbed him greatly and caused a break with Schoenberg, whose music he termed 'lacking in social responsibility and relevance.'

(http://www.classical.net/music/comp.lst/acc/eisler.php)
collaboration has also left its unique Brechtian atmosphere mark, clearly shown in parts of his score for Night and Fog.

The combination of Eisler’s being a prolific composer in both, concert and film fields and him being a rebellious communist, socialist, and anti-fascist led also to his collaboration with another ‘ism’ lover of that time, Theodor Adorno, a philosopher and composer, with whom he wrote the book *Composing for the Films* in 1947.\(^{263}\) The rebellious psyche of Hanns Eisler\(^{264}\) was brave enough to dismiss and reject some (or even most) of the ‘iconic’ musical thinking of Hollywood that had assigned clichés to many events inside a film, a concern, says Culbert, as appropriate to Hollywood scores of 2007 as it was 60 years ago:\(^{265}\)

“Landscape shots without action seem to call for musical accompaniment, which then conforms to the stale programmatic patterns. Mountain peaks invariably invoke string tremolos punctuated by a signal-like horn motif...Music cut to fit the stereotype ‘nature’ is reduced to the character of a cheap mood-producing gadget, and the associative patterns are so familiar that there is really no illustration of anything, but only the elicitation of the automatic response: ‘Aha, nature!’”\(^{266}\)

Eisler’s score is by no means a ‘typical’ film score, neither of fiction nor of documentary film; usually, music is called for in certain places in the narrative, as acceptable at the time of producing, but in Night and Fog the music runs from the very beginning to the very end, as if it were a ‘proper’ concert composition. This

\(^{263}\) Adorno & Eisler, (2005). Adorno elected to have his name removed as co-author... After all, Eisler had been called before the House Committee on Un-American Activities, his Communist ties exposed, and he had been forced to leave the United States. (in Culbert (2007) p. 261

\(^{264}\) To get the feel of Eisler’s whimsical philosophical mood changes see his own writings: *Satirical Aphorisms* (1928) and *On Schoenberg* (1935) in Grabs (1999)

\(^{265}\) Culbert, (2007) p. 261

\(^{266}\) Adorno & Eisler, (2005), p. 13
strong feature breaks the ‘rules’ of music for time and space by creating a ‘time affect’, an affect of endless continuity. This continuity also detaches and distances the viewer from the horrors that the film is about to show, knowing that these will be very difficult to be watched otherwise. Thus Eisler’s score purposely disregards the ‘standard’ film-music functions of both accidentalness and transition. Instead, the music attempts to inflict changing moods in the psyche of the viewer and conditions him/her to an amount of detachment, a local conditioning that may work and affect every individual differently. It is almost a cue-less music even when colouration changes (e.g. at the meeting points of contemporary colour shots and the black and white archive footage.)

“The best way to understand Eisler’s score” – claims Culbert – “is to take advantage of the capabilities of the Janus Collection’s DVD: one can omit the voiceover, and concentrate on the way that Eisler’s score uses a string orchestra and solo instruments to comment on transitions from black-and-white archival footage to colour footage of how Auschwitz and Majdanek looked in 1955.” As for the French language narration of Cayrol’s poem, it may work differently for a French-speaking viewer than for a non-French-speaking one. In any case, either the text itself or the intonation of the speech may ‘lead’ (if not bias) the viewer to points desired by the narration embedded in the film. Yet, viewing Night and Fog without the narration can create a different psychological journey, where music does not attempt to ‘dictate’ anything; it just wishes to mix Time into a flexible, quite absurd Dali-esque entity inside its space. As a deliberate breaker of the Hollywood ‘iconographical’ music Eisler present at times musical features that may be seen by the viewer as

---

267 This is not to say there are no cues, only that the cues of change create – together with the picture – a more ‘philosophical’ rather than precise and practical change.

contradictory to what is expected to be the ‘nature’ of the running experience. In Culbert’s words:

“Never does the musical score attempt, abruptly, to jump from one sort of music to another, as the film cuts from the archival footage of the past to the ‘beautiful’ colour footage of the present. Instead, the score invites the viewer to combine past and present, because of an aural continuity.” (Ibid)

(See NF_full_music_only)

Discussing the detachment that is intended by the whole score, Dümling (1998) says that:

“Through his thin-voiced lyrical music, the composer sought to create a sense of detachment from the overwhelming power of horror. Whereas the string orchestra serves to ‘populate’ the empty landscape in the prelude, the small chamber orchestral and even soloistic instrumentation accompanying the scene with the piles of corpses serves to focus attention away from these to the individual lives that they represent. As the almost tender melodic lines suggest, each of these corpses was an individual in his or her fullest humanity. Eisler resisted convention not only in his treatment of dynamics and sonority, but also in his expression. ‘The more horrible the scenes, the more friendly the music’, recalled Resnais. ‘Eisler wanted to show that human optimism and hope could even exist in a concentration camp’” (p. 581)

The opening music, starting with the titles is played by strings; it is in fact a piece originally composed in 1954 for Johannes R. Becher’s Vinterschlacht, a stage piece

269 The transitions between the B&W footage and the colour are not – as suggested by Culbert – cued with a typical Hollywood exactitude; the musical continuity is in this case more powerful than if it had to run on precise cues.

270 This DVD clip is a full version of the film, without the voiceover; just picture and music.
dealing with the German attack on the Soviet Union. (NF_Ex_01) Dümling (1988) elaborates:

“The camera shots of the Polish landscape at the beginning of the film expose the remnants of the concentration camp Auschwitz, which by 1955, was overgrown with grass and flowers. Eisler contrasts these beautiful colour shots, which do not reveal the camp's former purpose, with a tragic melody for string orchestra. He entitled this ‘A la Funèbre', a reference to the ‘Marcia Funèbre' from Beethoven’s Third Symphony… Since Eisler had to finish the film score within a very short period of time, he used some of his previously written stage music for certain parts, as he had also done on other occasions.” (p. 579)

This string music piece also concludes the film. Even if the reason for this is the short time Eisler had for composing, there is a philosophical idea behind it, that of ‘end is the beginning and beginning is the end’; in the context of Nuit et Brouillard, where time is supposed to have lost linearity and continuity, this ending undoubtedly fits the purpose.

Eisler did not try to ‘match’ a mood to sequence on cue. Had he attempted to pursue this course of action we would probably have been facing a tedious attempt to sound ever more tragic from scene to scene. Instead, he uses the irony of opposites, a ‘trick’ that distances the viewer from the screen and at the same time makes him/her communicate – almost directly – with individuals on the screen. Landesman expresses it strongly:

---

271 Other then the full film, clips of this film in DVD are marked NF_ + example number (e.g. NF_Ex_01). Unlike the full version on DVD, which contains no narration or text, the clips contain both.
“Night and Fog dialectically counterpoints image with sound, past with present, and stasis with movement to set up a thematic tension between our responsibility to remember and the impossibility of doing so, between memory and oblivion or denial. Hans Eisler’s ironic score contrasts beautiful lyrical flute passages with disturbing images of deportation, typhus, and corpses buried by bulldozers. The narration, read as a third-person unemotional commentary by a professional actor, prevents sentimentality and forms an incongruity between what we see and the way we are led to react to it; “The camps come in many styles,” the narrator enlightens us as the camera glides across different designs of watchtowers: “Swiss, Garage, Japanese, No style … a concentration camp is built like a grand hotel.”

Unlike Chion’s Anemphatetic sound, which “exhibit[s] conspicuous indifference to what is going on in the film’s plot, creating a strong sense of the tragic” or Stam’s Didactic contrapuntal music “which uses music to distance the audience “in order to elicit a precise, usually ironic, idea in the spectator’s mind”, Eisler’s irony attempts to push the viewer back into watching the atrocities not from the perspective of real time but through the viewer’s eyes watching now. By so doing the music helps the viewer to detach his psyche from the ‘locality’ and put it in the greater universality of the horror. The irony of the music plays a diabolic game with the ideas of time and suffering.

In contrast to the grave, opening by the strings under the white-on-black titles, the transition to the colour shots of the abandoned place of past horrors by a slow panning camera is heralded by what would otherwise be described as a ‘pleasant music of

---

272 Landesman, (2004) [online]
273 Chion (1994) pp. 8-9
nature’. Even the narrator’s voice does not tell the audience anything yet…

(NF_Ex_02)

Although there is a tone of announcement of drama to come, it is achieved by using dissonance-free chords and melody. This makes the ‘jump’ to the first black-and-white shot being, in a strange way, anticipated; but the music that now runs alongside the power demonstration of the German masses is bizarrely ironic and sarcastic: a pizzicato violin, a high-register bowed violin (arco), mixed with abrupt silent snare drum short tremolos (NF_Ex_03); picture and music standing in utmost, spine shivering contrast. The very young Hitler-Jugend then takes over the broken drum sound and converts it into a ‘proper’ military pattern. (NF_Ex_04).

Over music that may present slight feelings of alert, yet ameliorated by changing a music instrument carrying a melody – from trumpet to trombone, then to flute and back to the trumpet – the narrator reveals the first steps of the horror (NF_Ex_05):

A concentration camp is built like a Grand Hotel.
You need contractors, estimates, competitive offers
And no doubt friends in high places.

Any style will do.
The Swiss style,
The Garage style,
A Japanese model,
No style at all.

The leisurely architects plan the gates.
No one will enter more than once.

275 A comparison between this clip and its equivalent on the music-only full film may bring forth some different affect, as the ‘music-only’ film allows us to ‘drown’ in the tranquility of the music.
Meanwhile, Burger, Stern from Amsterdam,
Schmuiski from Cracow;
People go on living their everyday lives
Ignorant that there's a place for them
Six hundred miles from home.

The day comes when their blocks are finished.
All they have to do is arrive.

Rounded up in Warsaw,
Deported from Lodz, from Prague, Brussels or Athens,
From Zagreb, Odessa or Rome,
Interned at Pithiviers,
Arrested at the Bel d'Hiv,
Members of the Resistance herded at Compiéne.
All those caught in the act, wrongly arrested, or simply unlucky
Make their way towards the camps. 276

This sequence continues showing the gathering of victims into trains that come and
go to bring more. In a moment of extreme sarcasm Eisler breaks, or rather castrates
the German National anthem ‘Deutschland, Deutschland über Alles’ (NF_Ex_06).
Culbert goes into more details about this:

“Eisler, in his collaboration with Bertold Brecht, adopted a style of worker’s
ballad, often explicitly underscoring Brecht’s sardonic lyrics. This occurs just
once in the score to Nuit et Brouillard, in which the viewer sees footage from
Leni Riefenstahl’s Triumph des Willens (1935), her film glorifying Hitler, the
scene in the Congress Hall in which Standarten are borne out of the hall,
dividing right and left before the camera. Eisler first uses a brief excerpt, in a
minor key, using a muted trumpet, from the German (and Nazi) National
Anthem: ‘Deutschland, Deutschland über Alles,’ to accompany the Riefenstahl
footage. More briefly, the melody becomes recognizable, an ironic commentary,

276 English translation (sub-titles) by Alexander Allan.
http://www.class.uidaho.edu/thomas/Holocaust/thomas/n-fog.rtf
in music, which is appropriate to some of the film’s ironic voiceover, such as the comments about the architectural ‘style’ of concentration camp guardhouses.”

“With this passage”, claims Lindepreg,

“Eisler offered an intentional caricature of a song that had been banned in 1945 by the Allied Occupation Forces and was later reinstated, minus its first two couplets, as the national anthem of West Germany. The pastiche could refer not only to the song perverted by the Nazis but also to the song belonging to West Germany, where the economic requirements of reconstruction had outweighed the political requirements of denazification. The East German composer's rough handling of 'Lied der Deutschen' was not to Bonn's liking: in the West German copies of Night and Fog distributed by the Bundeszentrale fur Heimatdienst, the musical passage that opens the Westerbork sequence was deleted, giving way to silence. This pastiche was all the more irritating to the West as Eisler had composed the music of the East German national anthem to lyrics by Johannes Becher.” (p. 64)

“The documentary film” – says Eisler – “as distinguished from the usual romantic story - offers a problem of its own, namely the interrelation of picture, spoken comment and music. I believe the continuous comment accompanied by background music is one of the main shortcomings of this type of film. Three editions of White Floods were made, one with the usual tireless narrator, the second with very limited talk and a third that omitted every spoken syllable and used only subtitles. This last version, in my opinion, is the most effective.”

---

279 Eisler, H. (1998) p. 148, is referring to White Floods, (1940); screenplay and direction: David Wolff, Robert Stebbins, Lionel Berman

- 166 -
The problem of the three element combination (picture, narration and music) is the problem Eisler was trying to overcome in Night and Fog as well. Watching the film’s full version with both narration and music and watching it with music only may seem to some to be two different films. Eisler’s structure of continuity without stopping creates quite a different music-image than when the music focus is lowered to accommodate the narration. The harmonious counterpoint between picture and music changes once the voiceover is in action. Yet, with the help of the voice to focus the viewer’s mind, the music still can do what it intended to do in the first place. It works so due to combined choice of the creators to ‘dilute’ the text, both in length, silence intervals and the tone (expression) of the narration – following the style of the second of Eisler’s White Floods experiments.

The scene of people, objects and belonging being put and crammed in trains while soldiers, officers and dogs control how this happens, lasts one minute and 34 seconds. The first 45 seconds run under a dark and dramatic, rather depressing music; then it changes into lyrical and peaceful flute melody - while the visual continues as if nothing changed - as if there is some humanistic hope just by changing the music (NF_Ex_07).

Eisler is in fact following the idea of the film of jumping from black-and-white to colour and back; his music – all along the film – both in harmony, melody or rhythm, but mainly colouration does the very same jumping action, from colour to black-and-white and back. He does not assign specific elements to a specific ‘colour’; instead he uses any musical means that opposes or contradicts its predecessor. Discussing the film’s colour versus B&W dichotomy, Moses (1987) presents a troubling question
following his conclusion about the certainty or uncertainty that the colour footage provides:

"...if the present provides us with so little certainty, what of the archival stills and newsreels? Surely these document the past, recreate the reality of the camps. Yes and no."

Then, after describing the scenes of horror he concludes:

"After viewing these images, we might say to ourselves, "I've seen everything—the photographs, the newsreels. Everything, I will never forget the twelve million dead." But despite its power to shock, this black-and-white past is faded and scratchy, occasionally even blurred, while the present, even with its ambiguity, is always vivid." (p. 160)

This is the way Eisler takes us through the confusion of past versus present, colour vs. black-and-white and the perplexity of realities. His black and white is not only between colour and non colour; it is at times inside a scene, regardless of its colours altogether. In this way he creates a music-image of multiple realities while ‘visiting’ these in a dreamlike procession, non-linear and whimsical. While doing so in the full version (picture/voiceover/music) the effect of the music in the minus-voiceover version is dramatically amplified, as it is the only agent ‘talking’ to us. As such, and with the multiple-reality quality it can make the viewer’s psyche drift in a much more powerful way due to the loss of the ‘directing’ speech of the narrator. When the horror scenes are too horrendous to watch, it is the music’s black-and-whites and colours that distances us from touching the hot ashes; instead it conditions us to remember. And remembering is the aim of Night and Fog.
From a psychological point of view, viewers are expected to identify with a character, some characters and/or situations. This is more of an individual psychic process rather than collective; yet, every individual psyche can be touched by collective (archetypal) images. One then may say that in Night and Fog it is easier to identify with the ‘coloured’ reality while much more difficult to do so with the harshly bleak black-and-white one. Eisler’s music bridges between the two consecutive realities by using elements not to be found in the footage itself: irony, contradiction reconciled with hope and providing the time-continuance necessary to cope with more than one reality. In the full version of the film all elements work interchangeably; sometimes in unison, some other times in counterpoint, while in the no-voiceover version music takes the lead by connecting the realities.

The last five minutes of the film sum up the end of the nightmare (NF_08). Starting in 1945 we see most disturbing footage of corpses, skeletons, and skulls – all scattered or being bulldozed into a large pit. Bewildered survivors glued to a fence, not understanding what is going on. “I am not to be blamed”, say a Kapo and a Nazi officer in a quick shot of a trial, while under this entire monstrosity a light hearted pizzicato violin plays, as if in the wrong film. A sentimental bowed violin joins, making the impossible a little bit more possible. Eisler uses the strongest irony mixed with soulful individual solo cry before the film moves back to the colour shots of Auschwitz, when the lament of the strings, which opened the film, repeats itself, as if saying “nothing is finished”, echoing the narrator’s lines:

“Then who is responsible?
There are those who refused to believe this,
or believed it only from time to time.
And there are those of us who sincerely look upon the ruins today, as if the old concentration camp monster were dead and buried beneath them. Those who pretend to take hope again as the image fades, as though there was a cure for the plague of these camps. Those of us who pretend to believe that all this happened only once, at a certain time and in a certain place, and those who refuse to see, who do not hear the cry to the end of time.”

*   *   *

- 170 -
3. **Eyes Wide Shut**

**Year:** 1999  
**Director:** Stanley Kubrick  
**Written by:** Stanley Kubrick & Frederic Raphael  
(After Arthur Schnitzler’s novel “Traumnovelle”, 1926)  
**Music:** Jocelyn Pook (original pieces), György Ligeti, Franz Liszt, W. A. Mozart, Duke Ellington, Dmitri Shostakovich  
+ Some popular songs

**Plot Synopsis**

Dr. Bill Harford (Tom Cruise) and his wife Alice (Nicole Kidman), a well-off professional Manhattan couple, leave seven years old daughter Helena with a babysitter and go to a Christmas party thrown by wealthy attorney Victor Ziegler (Sidney Pollack). At the party, while Bill flirts with two skinny models, Alice dances and flirts with a middle-aged Hungarian businessman (Sky Dumont) who attempts to seduce her; she declines because she is married. Bill runs into an old friend, Nick Nightingale (Todd Field), a pianist who studied with him. Nick invites Bill to visit him in the club he plays regularly. Bill is called into Ziegler's private bathroom for an apparent emergency: Mandy (Julienne Davis) who had just taken a drug overdose, is unconscious. Ziegler makes Bill promise not to mention the incident to anyone.

Back home, Alice and Bill are curious to find out whether either of them had sex with their ‘come-ons’ at the party. Conversation continuous on about fidelity and sex drives; Alice reveals her fantasy of having sex with a naval officer she once saw when with Bill in a restaurant. Discussion ends when Bill is called away on a late house call; he is troubled by visions of Alice being ravished by the faceless naval officer. The caller is Marion (Marie Richardson), a daughter of a patient who had just died. Being distraught and emotional she reveals her passionate attraction to Bill; he is very uneasy with the situation, but luckily her boyfriend arrives.
On the way home Domino (Vinessa Shaw), a prostitute, propositions him in the street; he agrees reluctantly. They go to her apartment but then Alice calls on his mobile phone; Bill feels unable to have sex and he leaves. Passing by the Sonata Club Bill stops to visit his Musician friend, Nick. As they sit together, Nick tells him about a sex party he is supposed to be playing at later that night. From that moment on a bizarre chain of events follows. Bill pressurises Nick to give him the address and the password for entering. Being told that it was a costume orgy party he stops at "Rainbow Fashions", a costume shop whose ex-owner was his patient. The new owner, a middle aged European man, Mr. Milich answers Bill’s knock on the door at 1:00am is then generously paid for hiring the costume.

Armed with the costume and the password Bill takes a taxi to the secret mansion, while fantasising his wife having sex with the naval officer. He is allowed entry into the mystery place where he sees people masked and naked women performing some kind of pagan rituals. A masked woman comes to Bill, takes him aside and warns him that he does not belong there. He then meets another masked girl and walks with her through a room where an orgy is taking pace. He is warned by the first woman of being in great danger as other people start suspecting that he does not belong there.

Failing to comply with the demands of the local inhabitants Bill is about to get physically hurt, but the first woman begs to be punished instead and that he should be allowed to go. Bill is then warned not to tell anyone about the place or else he and his family will be suffering.

The next morning Bill finds out that Nick had been beaten up and kidnapped from his hotel room. On returning the costume and having left the mask in the mansion, Mr Milich charges him for the loss and pimps to him his very young daughter. Disturbed, he goes back to the mansion where he is given a written “second warning”. He is now sexually frustrated; at home Alice is working with their daughter on maths. He lies to Alice about having had an urgent call the other night. He goes to see Domino but she is not home. Bill is tempted to have sex with her roommate, but learns that Domino disappeared after finding she had HIV. He tries to contact Marion, but her boyfriend answers...
Bill is followed by a man in the street. He finds a discarded newspaper describing the mysterious death of a former beauty queen. Out of curiosity he goes to the morgue, using his medical credential to gain access; the woman was the one who OD’d at Ziegler’s party and he is sure she was the masked lady who warned him and now she is dead for protecting him. He receives a call from Ziegler who wants to talk to him. Ziegler tells Bill that he was there last night and he must warn him not to keep investigating the secret society he belongs to, as his own life is in danger for his pianist’s (Nick) mistake. He promises Bill that Nick was back in his home town and that Mandy’s death had nothing to do with the secret society, which includes many very powerful people…

He returns home, only to find his lost mask on the pillow next to sleeping Alice. Bill breaks down and tells her everything. Alice cries over what she hears. The next morning, while taking their daughter for Christmas shopping they are relieved; Alice is grateful that they have both survived their recent real-life and dream-life flirtations with infidelity. Having stopped short of promising eternal love and faithfulness on her part, Alice suggests that they should get home and fuck as soon as possible.

* * *
Psyche, Sexuality, Fantasy

“Social taboos and rules of behaviour no longer forbid what is called ‘living out your fantasies’” (Michel Chion, 2002:88)

“The critical reaction when the film first came out was unprecedented in its hostility, but it was a critical reaction which said more about our lingering cultural nervousness and anxieties concerning sex than about the film itself” – claims Deleyto. Yet, Kubrick’s *Eyes Wide Shut* is not the first and definitely not the last film to deal with sex, sexuality and sexual fantasy. It is the way he deals with the psychology of the sexual fantasy that brings forth some unique intriguing points, points that can raise more questions than answers. “…as many… commentators have said, *Eyes Wide Shut* does not say anything original, innovative or profound about sex, but if nothing else, it sparked a critical reaction that brought back to light preoccupations and anxieties which some believed had been long overcome” - concludes Deleyto. He also assumes that the three perspectives of sex dealt by Kubrick in this film are: a) sex as death, b) sex as commerce, and c) sex as love, while Chion reads the purpose of the film to be “…the everyday life of a couple of mortal human beings, from the point of view of the vastness of history and the infinity of the world” (Chion, 2006 p. 41). Alas, Chion takes that point of view to extreme. *Eyes Wide Shut*, he claims, “is a film clearly detached from any form of 'subjectivism'; it is a film in which there is an objective world (even a mental image is an 'object'), and no

---

281 Note that the O.E.D refers both to the fantasy and phantasy spelling as valid. Despite the similar pronunciation and etymology it differentiates between the alleged meanings; while the former being “caprice, whim, fanciful invention” the latter stands for “imagination, visionary notion”. As psychologies use either the first or the last, this thesis will be using the ‘fantasy’ choice.
282 Ibid.
one, neither in the audience or among the characters, can claim to be able to get inside
the head of anyone else” (Ibid, p. 24). Even if it is true that no one ‘can claim to be
able to get inside the head of anyone else’ this thought would turn humans, with their
essential need to do so into nothing more than robots. Chion puts an allegedly
unrecoverable gap between collective and individual; a gap that he himself, as we will
see later, inevitably ignores. In his own words, one paragraph before the above
declaration Chion states that:

“The mental images attributed to Bill that show his wife making love with
another man are very clearly located in his head by the editing codes
(alternating between Bill in colour in a taxi or in his office and the black-and-
white image of his naked wife giving herself to a man whose face is not seen in
detail, returning to Bill in a taxi or his office, in colour). We should note that
they tell us nothing of the precise nature of the disturbing feelings they produce
in Bill” (Ibid).

The real forte of Eyes Wide Shut is the exposition of a psychic phenomenon –
fantasy – in the form of sexual nature, or what Freud (and others) would refer to as
Sexual Fantasy.

Seen through Jung’s mind, a fantasy is:

“a flow or aggregate of images and ideas in the unconscious psyche, constituting
its most characteristic activity. To be distinguished from thought or cognition.
Construed by Jung as initially taking place independently of ego-consciousness
although potentially in relation to it” 283

283 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 58
The Critical Dictionary of Jungian Analysis goes on to describe the nature and action of the fantasy in the human psyche:

“Unconscious fantasy is the direct result of the operation of archetypal structures. Though the raw material for unconscious fantasy may derive in part from conscious elements (such as memories of, or experiences with, real people), these are not objectively connected with the fantasy. One implication of this is that a distinction has to be drawn between the presence of real, external figures in fantasy functioning as raw material for the fantasy and figures that may bridge the internal-external divide.” (Ibid.)

It could then be assumed that:

“…a true ‘mating’ of archetypal expectation with a personal correspondence in the environment is different and follows on from the use of external material by the psyche for the specific purpose of constructing unconscious fantasy.”284

This kind of a fantasy, the passive fantasy may enrich and ‘colour’ one’s life, through pre-existing unconscious contents. Jung saw this type of fantasy as if it were ‘wishing’ or waiting to become conscious; the individual needs to do nothing to ‘encourage’ these unconscious contents, as they tend to ‘erupt’ autonomously into consciousness.

“Jung distinguished between active and passive fantasies. The former, characteristic of the creative mentality, are evoked by an intuitive attitude directed toward the perception of unconscious contents; passive fantasies are spontaneous and autonomous manifestations of unconscious complexes.”285

---

284 Ibid.
Unlike its passive counterpart, active fantasy is in need of assistance from the Ego in order to ‘penetrate’ consciousness; when it occurs it creates a fusion of conscious-unconscious in the psyche seen as an expression of the psychological unity of the person. For whatever unclear reasons, Jung judged the passive fantasy to be ‘usually pathological’ while the active fantasy was ‘highly creative’. Yet, at the same time he referred to fantasy as running “an imaginative activity, a completely natural, spontaneous and creative process of the psyche” (Ibid). He also compared passive fantasies to dreams – that need to be interpreted - stating that “fantasy has its manifest and latent content and fantasy is susceptible to reductive and/or synthetic interpretation” (Ibid).

“The main constituents of fantasy are images, but this is to be understood in an inclusive sense as referring to any elements active in the psyche when there is an absence of direct stimuli and not merely visualisations that originate in external stimuli. The term 'image' is used to indicate the gulf between fantasy and the external world… In Jung's conception, it is fantasies and their images which lie behind and underpin feelings and behaviour rather than vice versa. Fantasies are not secondary, coded versions of emotional or behavioural problems. Jung's is a psychology of the Unconscious and the unconscious is the primary and dynamic factor.” (Ibid, p. 59)

In Jung’s own words:

“This autonomous activity of the psyche, which can be explained neither as a reflex action to sensory stimuli nor as the executive organ of eternal ideas, is, like every vital process, a continually creative act. The psyche creates reality every day. The only expression I can use for this activity is fantasy. Fantasy is just as much feeling as thinking; as much intuition as sensation. There is no psychic function that, through fantasy, is not inextricably bound up with the

---

286 Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 58. These writers are not the only ones who deem this view as ‘suspect or at least contradictory’. 

- 177 -
other psychic functions. Sometimes it appears in primordial form, sometimes it is the ultimate and boldest product of all our faculties combined. Fantasy, therefore, seems to me the clearest expression of the specific activity of the psyche. It is, pre-eminently, the creative activity from which the answers to all answerable questions come; it is the mother of all possibilities, where, like all psychological opposites, the inner and outer worlds are joined together in living union. Fantasy it was and ever is which fashions the bridge between the irreconcilable claims of subject and object, introversion and extraversion. In fantasy alone both mechanisms are united.”

The psyche that creates reality every day is pivotal to the understanding of the concept of the psyche’s multiple realities. These realities’ expression depends on the inner balance, or maybe a hierarchical balance between them within the psyche. But here we are facing two kinds of fantasy – one which is internal, different and separate from the outside ‘here-and-now’, linear reality, and a second type of fantasy which links ‘inner’ and ‘outer’ realities. This difficulty – say Samuels, Shorter and Plaut –

“…can be resolved if we understand by 'inner world' something skeletal and present only in structural form. Then fantasy could be the bridging factor between archetype and external reality while at the same time being in oppositional relation to that reality.”

In order now to link sex and sexuality with fantasy, a quick recap is needed to remind us that Archetype is “the inherited part of the psyche, structuring patterns of psychological performance linked to Instinct; a hypothetical entity irrepresentable in itself and evident only through its manifestation.” Being instinctual (hence,
archetypal) Sex and Sexuality can ‘build’ around it a complex in the same manner as other archetypal contents can do.  

“Meaning, or significance, as well as affect” – say Beebe, Cambray & Kirsch – “influences the strength of a complex. It is well known that different complexes, such as those around aggression, sexuality, and money, are much more highly activated at certain times of life than at others.” Meaning and affect are the significant result of the dynamics of a complex and thus become an active ingredient in its evolvement.

Modern studies of sexuality – especially those which are Freudian in orientation – tend to look into the nature of the activity of the sexual complex mainly in ‘practical’ terms. Thus, and coming under the sub-chapter ‘Solitary Sex’ Rye & Meaney (2007) attribute the following to the term sex-fantasy:

“Sexual fantasy has the appeal of being the safest form of sexual enjoyment: One can fantasize any time, one can have total control, and there are no (direct) consequences”.

Following that ‘safe’ nature of the sexual fantasy the authors continue to explain that:

“Sexual fantasy is difficult to research, especially because it is difficult to define exactly what constitutes fantasy”.

Then they add that:

---

290 “Complex: A collection of images and ideas, clustered round a core derived from one or more archetypes, and characterised by a common emotional tone.” See Part I chapter 1
292 Rye & Meaney (2007) p. 31
“The great majority of men and women engage in sexual fantasy, either as an activity by itself (i.e., daydreaming), or in conjunction with other sexual activities, including masturbation and partnered sex” (Ibid).

From an analytical-psychology point of view it will only be fair to say that a fantasy runs, first and foremost, by and under an autonomous unconscious drive; when this psychic activity then ‘meets’ with the conscious part, an ‘engagement’ may take place. Yet we have to remember that the archetypal complex that constellates in the fantasy will develop with or without practical engagement; it is likely then to appear through dreams, as ‘it’ wants to express itself. One also needs to remember that when constellated with conscious material, the state of ‘not totally unconscious yet not conscious enough’ allows the linear reality’s participants to be treated by the psyche in an impersonal manner. Even when one is ‘engaged’ in a sexual fantasy – say, a man fantasising about a woman he knows – she will still be an object on which to project that man’s fantasy; even if her name is Mary and she lives next door…

In contrast, looked at through psychoanalytic eyes, Friedman and Downey summarise the main elements of fantasy as observed by Freud:

“As Freud observed, [fantasies] may represent wishes evoked in response to frustration in order to convert negative feelings into pleasurable ones. They may soothe, enhance security, and bolster self-esteem, or repair a sense of having been abandoned or rejected. Fantasies may (temporarily) repair more profound damage to the sense of self that occurs as a result of severe trauma.”

And through the eyes of contemporary Freudians, Friedman and Downey show how Freud and Jung could find some more mutual grounds:

293 Friedman & Downey (2000) p. 568
“Organized as images, metaphors, and dramatic action, fantasies in the form of artistic productions and mythology have been part of the human heritage probably for the entire life of our species. Freud provided a new framework for understanding these universal forms of human expression by noting that they could be critically analyzed in a similar fashion as all other products of the mind” (Ibid).

Discussing the meanings of fantasy – conscious and unconscious – they present late thoughts of Freud as merged into the post-Freudian thought:

“The story line of a fantasy, meaningful in itself, also symbolically expresses additional hidden meanings. Underneath one narrative is another, and under that yet another, arranged in layers as is the mind itself. A fundamental discovery of Freud’s, and one that remains valid today (unlike many of his ideas about human sexuality), is that some aspects of mental functioning are not subject to conscious recall. Even when unconscious, they may influence motivation” (pp.568-569)

An association test may quite surprise one to see how many people would attach the word ‘Freud’ to the trigger word ‘Sexuality’. Yet it should not surprise us at all, as Freud did for our perception of sexuality what Darwin did to evolution. But since the times of Freud’s initial theories a lot of water has passed under the bridge, many questions have been raised and many interpretations were incorporated in them. Gruengard (1998) compiles some of the queries that took place upon reading Freud’s theories; some of those questions have been bravely answered and corrections followed through.

“One cannot understand the insistence of Freud on the exclusiveness of the sexual source not only of any form of love, but also of society and morality,
culture, art, religion and even scientific curiosity, if one ignores his apparently ornamental remark\textsuperscript{294} that for him sexuality (and libido) did not at all match the desire to have intercourse with somebody of the other sex or to feel pleasure in the genitals. It was rather identical to Plato's comprehensive and all-inclusive concept of Eros.” (p. 281).

The reference to Plato should be scrutinised more carefully. But even so, his emphasis on sexuality, at the time of sexual repression and secrecy would not make room for any non-sexual theory unless intentionally exhibited and stressed, an action not being fully considered at Freud’s time. Gruengard also adds that:

“The theory of the predominance of sexuality in human motivation, the existence of the infantile personality and its relation to "perverse" sexuality, the alleged discovery of Freud, had been "discovered" already by Saint Augustine in his Confessions, the first published ‘self-analysis’” (Ibid).

Freud, however, “was not interested in ‘perverse’ sexuality as such, but in the effects of suppressed and repressed forbidden sexuality.” (p. 282)

\textbf{Tom & Nicole, Alice & Bill}

Re-calling Chion, it is quite compelling to follow his insightful ‘warning’, claiming that “A film is a system, not of meanings, but of signifiers. We must go in search of these signifiers and we can do this only by means of a non-intentional method; for in

cinema, that art that fixes rhythms, substances, forms, figures and all kinds of other things onto a single support, the signifier can sit anywhere” (Chion, 2006, p. 38).  

Tom Cruise and Nicole Kidman (then married in real life) are playing the role of another particularly attractive couple whose marriage starts shaking when they start delving into a territory that had previously not been explored. They succumb to sexual fantasy, around which jealousy, culpability for one’s dreams and secret fantasies and the fragility of marriage clutter.

Kubrick’s Eyes Wide Shut (EWS) is based on Arthur Schnitzler’s novel Traumnovelle (Dream Story) which was published in 1926 and scripted by Kubrick and Raphael (1999). It has been (as it still is now) quite controversial, with different people reading the film in different ways – interpretations varying from the ‘dangers’ of sexual fantasies to the state of fidelity, through marital psychology to “sexual thriller”. Michel Ciment sees Kubrick in a certain sense as “Schnitzler’s double”:

“Both men were sons of doctors, growing up in Jewish families that integrated into the middle class of the dominant society, but that also witnessed a growing tide of anti-Semitism. These artists shared an interest in psychology and psychoanalytical theory as well. Schnitzler actually attended medical school with Sigmund Freud (although he later dropped out to pursue a career writing for the stage) and incorporated psychoanalytic theories, in particular those concerning dreams and the unconscious, into his works ...Kubrick was also

---

295 This is an intriguing twist on ‘strict’ semiotics, a creative twist that allows multiple meanings within a strict system.

296 For the latter there might have been little problem, as ‘classical’ thrillers allow room for understanding and solving the enigmatic thrill, a feature which is lacking in EWS.
versed in Freudian theory and fascinated by the unconscious, and he likened the experience of watching a film to the process of dreaming."  

Apparently, Kubrick told a French magazine in 1971 of “his plans to adapt Traumnovelle to the screen as a big-budget, big-cast porn film… he also considered adapting it as a comedy starring Steve Martin” (Ibid). Although sounding like an anecdotal gossip, it is thrilling to follow the flow of imagination that Dream Story managed to sweep Kubrick’s psyche along, ‘brewing’ in his fantasy for long years. Comparing Traumnovelle with EWS, Ransom opens with a subtle view of the main feature of the story:

“The film transposes a story about the impact of sexual fantasy and its revelation on the marital harmony of an upwardly mobile couple from fin-de-siècle Vienna to end-of-the-twentieth-century New York. It exchanges the German Austrian Fridolin and his wife Albertina for the WASP-coded characters Dr. Bill (Tom Cruise) and Alice Harford”

Referring to the impact of and the revelation on is a solid and pragmatic way for understanding that the main subject of EWS is indeed the sexual fantasy and not its possible outcome (the relation to marriage, sex, fidelity etc’). As sexuality still remains an enigma to the conscious, curious and investigative human mind, it is only natural that it is looked at from different angles and dissimilar emphases. Whiting & Ingram (2003) point to the eternal ‘battle of the sexes’ by criticising those critics who saw in EWS nothing but a misogynistic attitude toward women:

---

298 People attracted to Jung’s idea of Synchronicity may find meaning in the fact that for both Schnitzler and Kubrick, it was the last work.
299 Ransom, pp. 32-33
“One of the sharpest lines of attack against Eyes Wide Shut was for the supposedly blatant misogyny of its vision. Critics berated Kubrick and Raphael for creating a film that revels in topless Vegas-style show-girls of "Barbie-esque" proportions ill-used for the pleasure of men… This view misreads much of what Kubrick has achieved with Nicole Kidman's Alice… More seriously, it erroneously identifies the film's authors with their male protagonist and thus unfairly attacks the film for what it, like its inspirational source, is criticizing, namely the essentializing misogyny that Schnitzler's novella indicts as a recurring problem.”

Arthur Schnitzler, claims Acevedo-Muñoz (2002),

“…wrote his novella Traumnovelle… in 1926, during the period in his career when he was interested in both psychoanalysis and surrealism. Being a Viennese physician, it is no surprise that Schnitzler was attracted to psychoanalysis around 1900, and that his works owe much to the ‘psychoanalytical method.’” Freud himself is said to have praised Schnitzler’s works, acknowledging the latter’s ‘penetrating insights into the behaviour of the human psyche’ …Dream Story is particularly useful in making this connection because it is structured around the main character’s confusion between real and imaginary experiences depicted in his own internal monologues. This also exemplifies the surrealist quality of the tale because of the surrealist’s interest in dreams as unconscious visual representatives of desire.” (pp. 118-119)

So far that was the Freudian outlook. From an analytical-psychology viewpoint, that very same confusion will prevail, but it will express the difficulty of connecting between the linear (everyday, here and now) reality and the other realities that work quite autonomously in the psyche at the same time and alongside the former. There is

300 Whiting, R. & Ingram, S. (2003). As we’ll see later, Alice’s mental fantasy-reality balance is greater than Bill’s.
no doubt that tackling the unconscious multi-realities and dreams is a task that the conscious mind refers to as ‘surrealist’ as their manifestation in consciousness is irrational, illogical and non-linear. Acevedo-Muñoz refers to the connection between surrealist art and psychoanalysis, saying that:

“The relationship between surrealist art and psychoanalysis is rather direct, since the origins of surrealism lie in the attempt to understand and artistically represent unconscious states of mind and the relationship between dreams, fears, and desires.”

Reinforcing the above statement, Acevedo-Muñoz adds that:

“Desire lies at the heart of both surrealism and psychoanalysis. The latter aims to decipher our true desires and how they are manifested in dreams, slips of the tongue, and other memory and linguistic expressions; the former attempts to understand the structural logic of such manifestations” (Ibid).

Both surrealism and psychoanalysis as discussed above are brave and wise departure points, points for which a solid basis has been laid by Freud. The difference in the departure points between Freud and Jung lies in the different approaches to sex and sexuality, fantasy and dream. Through Jungian eyes, a fantasy (including sexual) is an expression and psychic manifestation of a complex images and ideas clustering around an archetypal core (of which sexuality is one component as well as others); as such it does not necessarily have to be ‘pathological’ in nature. It is only when humans try to implement those fantasies into the linear, day-to-day life that the social and religious blocks may interfere, object and even create mayhem. A sexual fantasy may arise in a person whether he/she is experiencing a large amount of sexual activity

301 Acevedo-Muñoz (2002), p. 119
or none; like other types of consistent fantasy, he/she may not be able to ‘expel’ the fantasy – it will find its way through the dream. The possible psychological imbalance of a person obsessed by a fantasy is not the fantasy itself but rather his/her incapacity to detach the cumulating realities, thus opening a gate for the non-linear, the ‘surrealist’ ones to control the reality of ‘real things’.

“Both Dream Story and Eyes Wide Shut are concerned with a man’s attempt to understand desire. The twist lies in that this protagonist’s search is not for the essence of his own desires, but those of his wife. Thus, the main character (named Fridolin in the book, Bill in the film) is doomed to fail from the start because he is seeking answers to a question he is not equipped even to ask” (Ibid).

Human beings may desire to understand desire, yet (sexual) desire emerges in us as a socially-related phenomenon stemming from the ‘original’ sex instinct. Hence it is possible to wish to understand its meaning, but in this film’s case the wife’s fantasy is not the ground for seeking this meaning. Albertina’s (or Alice’s,) fantasy is just the trigger for Fridolin’s (or Bill’s) feeling of insecurity, which is likely (like in many similar cases) to stem from a complex around power, control, or Ego. The male protagonist is then not ‘doomed’ to fail’ as in fact he is seeking answers to his difficulties in coming to term with the multi-faced and multi-reality nature of his own control-taking fantasies.

“Bill’s complete misunderstanding of Alice’s desire, I argue, renders an analogy of the cinematic representation of female desire as seen by men, and by extension, by the cinema itself. In other words, what Kubrick achieves in Eyes Wide Shut is an analysis and critique of the cinema’s incapacity as a patriarchal institution not only to understand but also to represent female desire” (Ibid).
Bill’s lack of understanding of the sexual storm that forces itself on him, I argue, is greater than his misunderstanding of Alice’s desire and focuses more on his confusion, guilt and fear of his own demons, triggered (possibly) by Alice’s fantasy. The intriguing thing in all this is the fact that Alice – apparently the ‘cause’ – does not act upon her fantasy in reality (even not through temptation), while Bill does upon his. He is motivated to ‘revenge’ his wife’s unfulfilled sexual fantasy. Bill does so “through a series of increasingly bizarre erotic encounters that tempt him to violate his own moral code and to be unfaithful to her in revenge” (Ibid, p. 120). His wife’s unrealised fantasy is strong enough to unleash social, personal and moral inhibitions in him and he lets himself be sucked into the fantasy. The couple’s bizarre encounter with the unleashed fantasies is paved with symbolism; some might be acceptable by both Freud and Jung and some might not.

Chion (2006) takes an intriguing view on EWS when he claims that:

“In this film interpretation becomes an issue not just for the audience, but also for the main character. Due to a number of disturbing coincidences (…). Every meeting, every phone call may be part of a conspiracy hatched - why not? - by Alice. After all it was she who drove Bill to stay out all night by provoking him with tales of her own sexual fantasies” (p. 40)

Does this interpretation ‘make sense’? Or is it just Chion’s own psyche’s projecting upon the film’s character(s), the way he himself already advocated

---

302 From a psychoanalytic view Giovannelli (2010) shows some signs of being positioned between Freud and Jung stating that “The film rather overtly confuses levels of reality, to then suggest through the protagonists’ final dialogue that the distinction between actual and imagined events is unimportant if either can have powerful effects on a person’s life. The representation of a puzzling series of events seems to serve the purpose of conveying some message about the human psyche: delving into one’s psychological reality may bring to the surface some rather surprising and unpalatable truths about oneself—about one’s insecurities, desires, and emotions.” (p. 356)
avoiding? In any case, this can only show how film interpretation, on all its images and layers can easily slide from being ‘objective’ to being ‘subjective’.

**Kubrick and Multiple-Reality Music**

"In 2001: A Space Odyssey director Stanley Kubrick, as strong personality and as the film auteur, wanted to control all components of film making, including the music. When he didn't use already composed music by Alex North, he gave way to the special usage of previously composed classical music in the film. He changed the usual way of functioning of film music. This put him, the director, in the position of the absolute author: among many things he was doing (controlling screenwriting, editing, set design, acting etc.), he also "composed" the music by selecting musical pieces, deciding where to put them in the film, and, especially, by editing them to the picture."³⁰³

‘2001: A Space Odyssey’ is not the first of Kubrick’s films to contain classical and non-original music. To give some examples, he uses ‘borrowed’ music in: *A Clockwork Orange* (1971, Using music by Beethoven, Rossini, Purcell, Elgar and Rimsky-Korsakov); *Barry Lyndon* (1975, containing works by Schubert, Vivaldi, Bach, Paisiello and Mozart) and *The Shining* (1980, with music by Bartók, Ligeti & Penderecki, plus two original composers - Wendy Carlos & Rachel Elkind). “Unlike Fellini” says Gorbman, “whose musical voice developed in symbiosis with Nino Rota, Kubrick's strength as an auteur lay in his inspired handling of pre-existing

music”. 304 Commenting further on the musical pastiche in the same film Gorbman states that:

“What all these set-pieces have in common is not any one function of music, or its narrative status as diegetic or non-diegetic, or its historical provenance or form. Rather, once heard they are all choices that seem ineluctable, at once wittily detached and emotionally appropriate and poignant. Welding themselves to visual rhythms onscreen, they become the music of the specific movie scene rather than the piece one may have known before.” (Ibid)

Indeed, the status as diegetic or non-diegetic or the music’s provenance and form do not contribute much to the understanding of Kubrick’s music usage in Eyes Wide Shut. Yet, Gorbman’s finding no musical functions contradicts the rest of her very statement. From the viewpoint of this thesis all three main functions – Incidental, Transitional and Conditional are present and active in the film music. When Gorbman later states that some classical music pieces may become ‘the music of the specific movie scene rather than the piece one may have known before’, she does not refer to the effect possibly caused by pieces of music the listener does not recognise. Luckily, she opens the door for Royal Brown, for whom – according to Gorbman – “in the post-modern age the hierarchy of the image and music is up for grabs” (Ibid). In compliance with the concept of music-image it is rather intriguing to read Brown’s similar ideas when he refers to classical music in film:

“The excerpts of classical music compositions that replace the original film score no longer function purely as backing for key emotional situations, but rather exist as a kind of parallel emotional/aesthetic universe ... The affect...tends to remain within the music itself, which sheds its traditional invisibility

304 Gorbman, 2006, p. 4
rather than being transferred onto a given diegetic situation to which it is subordinated. Put another way, the music, rather than supporting and/or colouring the visual images and narrative situations, stands as an image in its own right, helping the audience read the film's other images as such rather than as a replacement for or imitation of objective reality.”

The idea of music-as-image applies to any ‘type’ of music in film and as an independent phenomenon. The ‘added value’ of familiarity with any known piece of music does not change or strip it of its image quality; it may only constellate differently in the viewer/listener’s psyche. Brown’s concern about the possible ‘overtaking’ of the visual image by the music-image needs not be alarming. Both music and visual images may shift and swap focus and weight regardless of the type of music. In the case of a known classical (or otherwise) piece of music, its familiarity may or may not add a personal weight to the scene-as-a-whole, pending the viewer’s emotional take of the known image. The ‘objective reality’ is in no danger of replacement or imitation by a dominant music-image. It can only be accentuated by that image and/or invoke a dynamic encounter between the momentarily constellated psychic realities.

As we shall further see, the usage of ‘external’ music (classical or otherwise) can be seen as a part-of or as outside the visual. It is the way the creators use it that creates the feeling of presence, by assigning to it the exact function, using methods like volume (loudness), sync or non-sync placement etc’. In Gorbman’s words,

“After the 1960s, the director's evolution toward meticulously aligned placements of musical material, sometimes re-editing scenes to accommodate

---

the music even more precisely, yielded brilliant new effects. We might say that Kubrick's music does not conventionally fit, but in not fitting like classical glue it forges a bond between story world and soundtrack that is much stronger, like the bond between the two elements that make epoxy.” (Ibid, pp. 5-6)

Although ‘not conventionally fitting’, Shostakovich’s Waltz 2 from Suite for Variety Orchestra\(^{307}\) turns Eyes Wide Shut’s opening into a fairy-tale, or a Merry-Go-Round magic atmosphere that children usually will adore. While starting under the few main credits onscreen, the music lures us to believe that we are about to enter something beautiful.\(^ {308}\) The credits cut into Alice’s beautifully elegant stripping, changing clothes. A glimpse of busy Manhattan is seen through the couple’s window; Bill is dressed to go out, while Alice is still making her mind up about what to wear. The music, still playing, makes the ambiance mind-boggling - a beautiful scene of a wonderful evening out of a very good looking young couple. It is so fascinating that we hardly notice Bill ignoring Alice in a somewhat selfish manner. The music stops abruptly when Bill stops the record-player. This makes the amazing waltz boldly diegetic (or as Gorbman would describe as Meta-Diegetic); in other words – no more fairytale… (EWS_Ex_01)

Gorbman indicates that “Like the much better known 'Blue Danube' in 2001, this Shostakovich waltz does not conventionally fit, but it nonetheless becomes the film's signature.” Shostakovich’ waltz becomes for Eyes Wide Shut what Mozart’s Piano Concerto No. 21 became for Elvira Madigan (1967). As for this signature’s function

\(^{306}\) The epoxy metaphor suggests a new multi-image made of picture and music.

\(^{307}\) Erroneously named Suite for Jazz Orchestra No. 2, due to lose of some of the composer’s scores during WW2. The Suite for variety Orchestra was more likely to have been compiled post 1956 while the Suite for Jazz Orchestra No. 2 was written in 1938.

\(^{308}\) The very fact that the music starts on credits with bold white-on-black letters and before the story begins makes the music ‘the leader’ in the visual/music imaging dance. In addition, the waltz’ melody is magically haunting on both conscious and unconscious levels.
at the very beginning of EWS she attributes to the waltz the quality of foreground, with the belief that “This foregrounding of the full orchestra has the effect of making the action quasi-operatic, in the sense that the characters and action seem to be obeying the dictates of the music.”\(^{309}\) It is this thesis’ opinion that the characters and their actions do not submit to the music; at this very beginning of the film, the viewer has as yet no clues about the characters’ qualities and he/she is in no position to see or listen to the full integration of characters and music. If at all, it would be that the music with its immense uplifting charm is ‘caressing’ the visuals as if it was taking them on the wings of beauty and of an ‘everything’s alright here’ feeling. Shostakovich’ waltz will appear a further two times in the film – “over a ‘day in the life’ montage that crosscuts between Bill at work treating patients, Alice at home” (Ibid), and at the end of the film, over the closing credits.

After Victor Ziegler’s party is over, a party to which both Bill and Alice were invited but were not too enthusiastic to attend, as they hardly know the other guests, and through which, both – yet separately – undergo seduction attempts (Alice by a Hungarian gentleman and Bill by two young models), they are finally home. Both the picture and the soft 1940s and 1950s background dance music change straight into the couple’s bedroom, when they are naked and kissing each other. The harsh cut from the schmaltzy soft band into Chris Isaak’s “Baby Did a Bad Bad Thing” functions here as a psychological transition; it is like saying ’OK, enough with the niceties of the party. Now it’s only the two of us’. Listening to the lyrics and the rock’n’roll tempo of this ‘borrowed’ song may be wishing to prepare the viewer/listener even further, to things to come:

\(^{309}\) Gorbman, 2006, p.8
Baby did a bad bad thing baby did a bad bad thing.
Baby did a bad bad thing baby did a bad bad thing.
You ever love someone so much you thought your little heart was gonna break in two?
I didn't think so.
You ever tried with all your heart and soul to get you lover back to you?
I want to hope so.
You ever pray with all your heart and soul just to watch her walk away?

Baby did a bad bad thing baby did a bad bad thing. (EWS_Ex_02)

During the first twenty minutes of the film there have been three different pieces of music, which have covered the full scope of film-music functioning. The waltz initiates and conditions us to the ‘good life’ to follow, the basic environment of the Harfords. Due to the emotional beauty of the piece, yet through its surprising presence, one can be swept away into an anticipatory conditioning or just the opposite – astonishment for ‘what on earth is this music doing’ here…”? Though a risk, the strategy undoubtedly reflects Kubrick’s deep involvement in multiple realities. The second ‘block’ of music is the soft big-band smooth dance music, played throughout the early Christmas party.

“At Ziegler's Christmas ball, all song titles refer to love. At first the references seem appropriate: the band plays 'I'm In the Mood for Love' when Alice and Bill dance with each other. But the love referred to by subsequent songs ('It Had to Be You', 'Chanson d'Amour', 'When I Fall In Love') turns ever more elusive and ambiguous as Alice and Bill separately flirt with others, and as the married Ziegler summons Bill to help him revive a drugged prostitute with whom he has been having sex.”310

310 Gorbman (2006), p. 16
Yet another time Kubrick ‘tricks’ our ear and eye by making it impossible for us to determine the origin of the music. Is it a live orchestra playing? (thus diegetic) or is it a non-diegetic music coming outside of the ballroom, as a ten minute orchestra break has been officially declared. The music throughout this part is a typical example of incidental and is functioning as such. Chris Isaak’s song, “Baby Did a Bad Bad Thing” (1995) works on the transitional level by a) breaking from the former music without any preparatory bridge, b) by ‘kidnapping’ the viewer/listener’s relaxed mood into a great time distance away, and c) by contrasting the soft lyrical visual and physical love between Bill and Alice.

The following segment uses Shostakovich’ waltz for the second time – this time as an everyday continuation of the ‘beautiful life’ before. It cuts between Bill’s work at his clinic and Alice with daughter Helena at home, doing the girl’s homework. The music is the gluing agent between the locations, and the atmosphere is familiar by now. (EWS_Ex_03). As “Baby Did a Bad Bad Thing” had just interrupted the continuity, it is now starting to sow some seeds of confusion about the ‘perfect life’ we have been witnessing so far.

And indeed, the beautiful life starts showing some cracks popping up. In bed, while Alice is a little too stoned, she tries to push Bill to the wall discussing love and jealousy. As she keeps losing control she builds up to some aggression, through which she tells Bill of her fantasy about a naval officer a year ago. Although high on the pot she apparently knows exactly what she is doing, pushing Bill into insecurity which she had rather have him sharing with, maybe as a punishment for her weaknesses. A piece for strings by Jocelyn Pook titled “Naval Officer” is playing in the background.
of her telling. For some reasons (known probably only to Kubrick himself), the level (volume) of the music is very low and almost inaudible so that even the atmosphere of it is quite hard to detect. It is possible that this is a forced compromise, as Alice’s monologue is quietly whispered. (EWS_Ex_04)

After leaving Marion, the daughter of his patient who had just died, Bill is in a taxi, watching in his imagination a love scene between Alice and the naval officer. He then walks in the street, seeing a couple passionately kissing; the dream-like action of Alice and the officer continues. These two connected short episodes are ‘accompanied’ by Jocelyn Pook’s original music commissioned by Kubrick “to accompany dreams, obsessions, and long stretches of the surrealistic orgy sequence.” The piece entitled “The Dream”, which plays alongside these fragmented scenes, is very ethereal, immediately creating the impression of stretched time and infinite space; we can now see Bill watching a bad fantasy, thus putting the exposition of the enforced fantasy as remotely but persistently hovering with non-verbal threats of things to come. By so doing the music stretches its transition functionality by floating into a no-time zone. From a psychological point of view this no-time, autonomous fantasy has been triggered by Alice’s story which is about to unleash in Bill the rest of the complex feeling-toned images encircling the core archetypal sex drive. From this point onward events that feel like a dream – illogical, incoherent and bizarre – will materialise and be visited on Bill. All these shadowy forces embedded deep in the human psyche will defeat his logical Ego and turn him into a pawn in their claws. (EWS_Ex_05 and EWS_Ex_05a)

311 Gorbman, 2006, p.13
A young prostitute talks to Bill and invites him to her apartment. He agrees; and here starts the first step into the journey of materialising his own fantasy. This fantasy may be triggered by sordid feelings of revenge or alternatively just because the time is right for the building up personal sex fantasy. He is now kissing with Domino (Vinessa Shaw) and stops when his mobile phone rings, Alice is calling… A sexy airy bluesy piano and double-bass slowly accompany the atmosphere. \(^{312}\) \((EWS\_Ex\_06)\)

Here things start encountering the domain of the Shadow. Concisely defined by Jung, the Shadow archetype denotes “the thing a person has no wish to be.”\(^{313}\) Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) elaborate:

“In this simple statement is subsumed the many-sided and repeated references to shadow as the negative side of the personality, the sum of all the unpleasant qualities one wants to hide, the inferior, worthless and primitive side of man's nature, the 'other person' in one, one's own dark side.”\(^{314}\) (p. 138)

Jung accepted the shadow as being a living part of the psyche and striving to be so. Although he first attributed it to the personal unconscious, the shadow stems from the depth of the collective unconscious and the instincts, and inflicts its power on the personal. “[T]he contents of the personal unconscious are inextricably merged with the archetypal contents of the collective unconscious, themselves containing their own dark side.”\(^{315}\)

---

\(^{312}\) Yet again, only when Bill shuts the stereo device is when we learn that the outside (non-diegetic) music was indeed inside (diegetic) music

\(^{313}\) Jung, CW 16 par. 470

\(^{314}\) Jung credited Freud for his contribution to the understanding the light and darkness of humanity and declared that Freud’s method on this subject was the best ever achieved

\(^{315}\) Ibid, p. 139
“Given that the shadow is an archetype, its contents are powerful, marked by affect, obsessional, possessive, autonomous - in short, capable of startling and overwhelming the well-ordered ego. Like all contents capable of entering consciousness, initially they appear in projection and when consciousness is in a threatened or doubtful condition, shadow manifests as a strong, irrational projection, positive or negative, upon one's neighbour.” (Ibid)

Dr Harford has just entered the domain of his own Shadow; or rather say, his own Shadow has just broken into his Ego. This will start a rough journey into the bizarre orgy that will drag him through a living nightmare. Another archetypal power will become strongly involved in it, that of the Persona, as we shall see later. Events start building up for Bill, who has just acquired a costume in the middle of the night; now he is in a yellow cab taking him to the address of the Unknown. A quick flash of Alice having sex with the naval officer runs through his delirious eyes, pushing him into the mysterious party. (EWS_Ex_07)

Jocelyn Pook’s "Masked Ball" (1997) has been constructed together with Kubrick to fit the beginning of the orgy scene. Made of simple harmonies under an eerie low male voice, chanting an ‘ancient’ and unintelligible stretched music line makes the whole scene – from Bill’s entrance through the mystical allocation of nude girls to each of the male participants – a surrealistically Gothic, eerie and spooky event. The music fades out to a masked girl, given to Bill, saying: "I'm not sure what you think you are doing. You don't belong here". This is first and foremost a strong conditioning, mood creating music, and at the same time seeming accidental, sounding eerie enough to fit the place and its pace of activity. It also stretches the

316 A backward recording of a chant by a Romanian Catholic priest
sense of time in the viewer’s psyche and as such touches the brink of the transitional function. As before, Kubrick tries hard to instil a doubt in our mind as to the source of the music; starting as a perfect non-diegetic at the house entrance and running through a long chunk of time we easily feel the ‘outsideness’, until we see Nick Nightingale (Todd Field) the pianist playing blindfolded.\textsuperscript{317} (\textit{EWS_Ex_08})

Bill is now re-approaching the realm of the Shadow. He is surrounded by dark and unknown forces without any idea of where it is all leading, and of whether he will be able to bear the consequences. In such psychological states people have no faces and no personality. It is a state that can function only through the Persona.

The Persona (Latin for a mask worn by actors in classical times) is one of Jung’s archetypes, referring to “the mask or face a person puts on to confront the world.”\textsuperscript{318} It is the inner assistant in facing and coping with the world outside ourselves, the face(s) we use to protect against and to be able to integrate with the outside world. “Persona can refer to gender identity, a stage of development (such as adolescence), a social status, a job or profession. Over a lifetime, many personas will be worn and several may be combined at any one moment.” (Ibid). In a ‘peacefully flowing’ life the Persona is a positive ally of the Ego for growth and development, but when used for hiding and attempting to be seen as what we are not (or do not want to be so), there is a danger of over-identifying with the Persona and pathologically becoming a false person.

\textsuperscript{317} Gorbman (2006, p. 13) believes that “Pook’s chanting priest both evokes ancient ritual and summons the avant-garde, underlining the mix of premodern and postmodern in the goings-on at the mansion.”

\textsuperscript{318} Samuels, Shorter & Plaut (1986) p. 107 As such it is also the archetype of social adaptation.
Referring to the archetypal qualities of the Persona, Samuels, Shorter and Plaut explain that

“…there is an inevitability and ubiquity to persona. In any society, a means of facilitating relationship and exchange is required; this function is partly carried out by the personas of the individuals involved. Different cultures will establish different criteria for persona and there will be alteration and evolution over time since the underlying archetypal pattern is susceptible to infinite variation” (Ibid)

At the orgy-party, Bill, like everybody else, is wearing a mask. He and the others hide behind their masks, as the collective they wish to belong to can not accept them as individuals. The real individual act they are about to perform – sexual encounter – needs also to be masked, thus remaining impersonal. As impersonality is at the heart of sexual fantasies, they embark on materialising their obscurely impersonal fantasies as if they were outside their own selves. Thus they ‘liberate’ themselves from anything mundane, any inhibition and any personal or social relations. Yet Bill does really not belong there. He has to listen to his Anima telling him so. He is a watcher; going hand in hand with a naked woman, watching the explicitly sexual, orgiastic activities around him, yet he really seems ‘not to belong’. Pook’s haunting ‘World music’ piece, “Migration” is stretching time and space underneath Bill’s feet. Even through his mask it seems possible to see that he is getting ‘frozen’. (EWS_Ex_09). To quote Gorbman (2006):

“Pook's two sustained pieces, 'Masked Ball' ('Backwards Priest') and 'Migrations', share the attribute of cultural exoticism, to give the orgy an air of

319 The Anima is another one of Jung’s archetypes, originally described as the feminine side in the male; similarly an equivalently, there is the Animus, being the masculine side in the female. This concept has undergone changes since Jung, mainly referring to the “other” in us.
slow-motion unfamiliarity. Eyes Wide Shut deliberately blurs the lines between dream and reality, between consciousness and imagination, and Pook's music is instrumental in creating the impression of a dream in the long orgy sequence.” (p. 14)

The second piece of Gyorgi Ligeti’s Musica Ricercata (1953) is the music chosen by the director to follow Bill Harford’s tribulations in and around the ‘Orgyland’ affair, where Shadow and Persona take control over his personality. This piece for piano solo uses the instrument’s percussive qualities, at times to the extreme. (EWS_Ex_10). It consists of two notes – E# and F# - being intruded on by a third note – G. The overall tone of the piece is bloodcurdling, detached and not at all friendly. Appearing five times in the film in its inner variations and inner dynamics, the music is so powerful that its statement makes it a chilling conditional motif, belonging only to the immediate events in Bill’s immediate life; being the reflection of his survival instincts it is saying out loud: ‘Beware!’ ‘You are in trouble!’ ‘Danger ahead!’

Fig. a: Main Motif (Ligeti)
Fig. b: Motif’s variation

Fig. c: The invasion of the third note

Fig. d: The interaction
Metaphorically, the two principal notes (E# and F#) seem to be playing ‘cat and mouse’ with each other (Fig. a). The dynamics, the octaves and the gap between the octaves emphasise the unpredictability of this game (Fig. b). They just go along with Bill whenever he feels frightened, confused or devastated by his feelings, now hardly under control. The ‘invader’ G note is an outsider (Fig. c), angrily telling the cat and the mouse to make up their mind. Now! (Fig. d)

The first occurrence of Ligeti’s music in EWS is when Bill is called and led to the tribunal of all the guests. Surrounded by terrifying masked faces standing in a threatening circle, he now stands in front of a masked leader figure who asks him about the password. Realising that he had not known the password for the house, only the one for admittance there is now a deep feeling of terror that only the music can portray, as all the participants are masked. He is now demanded to take off his mask, followed by a demand to remove his clothes. All this horror employs the Ligeti’s motif and all its variations – including the intruding G note – exposing Bill’s feeling of deep fear and horror. This multi-functional music repeats itself (with some or all variations) another four times:

1. When Bill returns to the mansion and receives a written warning. 
   (EWS_Ex_11)

2. When Bill is walking at night in the Village and realizing he’s been followed.
   (EWS_Ex_12)
3. When in a Café, reading a newspaper reporting on a mysterious death of a young woman whom Bill suspects to be the woman in the orgy who had sacrificed herself to rescue him. (EWS_Ex_13)\textsuperscript{320}

4. When he returns home and sees his ‘lost’ mask lying on the bed besides Alice who is asleep. (EWS_Ex_14)

In all the above events the music relates to and is around Bill’s badly materialised fantasy and its possible frightening consequences. This music becomes him now.\textsuperscript{321} It functions as suspense music (incidental) and as an expression of his gloomy and horrified moods (conditional). Only on the fourth occurrence, seeing the news about the death of the girl, then the mask-on-bed scene, does Bill realise the full terror of his fantasy. When he returned from the orgy house at the early hour of the morning he woke Alice; she – quasi reluctantly – told him the dream she had: In that dream both of them were in a deserted city, naked end embarrassed. Bill went to look for their clothes, and only when he had gone she felt relaxed. Then she was making love to the naval officer, but then the place filled with men, and they all were having sex with her. (EWS_Ex_15)\textsuperscript{322}

\textsuperscript{320} For an obscure reason Kubrick inserted Mozart Requiem’s “Rex Tremendae” on Bill’s entering the café until he sees the newspaper about Mandy’s death then connected directly into Ligeti’s music. Gorbman sees it “as if preparing for Bill’s imminent discovery in his newspaper that the ‘ex-beauty queen’ Mandy has died of a heroin overdose.” (2006, p. 17)

\textsuperscript{321} While interpreting Shostakovich’s as ‘represents Life’, Chion (2006, p. 33) strangely enough reads Ligeti’s as ‘this imperious music embodies the Law’.

\textsuperscript{322} Throughout this scene the Dream music enters late into Alice’s emotional telling. Because of that, and as we have been conditioned by now to accept this music as Bill’s own fantasy’s trigger, it seems that the music is trying to help both Bill and the viewer to divert into his emotions about her harsh fantasies.
Bill’s disastrous visit to the orgy house and Alice’s dream are quite parallel in time. This is not just incidental; it rather seems to be synchronous. Dream and fantasy are close. Even though there are elements of conscious content in many fantasies, the unconscious source of these works very similar to a dream. When Bill finally breaks from the burden he has been compelled to carry and tells her everything that has happened it seems that things are collapsing for them. The brave conversation they have at the Christmas shopping with their daughter Helena offers an intriguing mix of hope but of realism at the same time. Can they change things in their lives? Can they defeat fantasy? Is ‘forever’ a hard currency? As expressed in their last dialogue:

A. ...we should be grateful. ...that we've managed to survive through all of our... adventures... whether they were real... or only a dream.
T. Are you sure of that?
A. Am I sure? Only as sure as I am... had the reality of one night... let alone that of a whole lifetime... can ever be the whole truth.
T. And no dream is ever... just a dream.
A. The important thing is... we’re awake now... and hopefully... for a long time to come.
T. Forever.
A. Forever?
T. Forever.

323 Jung developed a complex theory, Synchronicity, concerning ‘meaningful coincidence’, an ‘acausal connecting principle’. He believed that this principle can appear stronger when the individual’s conscious level was low. He also postulated that a synchronistic experience is more likely to occur when two kinds of realities (such as inner and outer) intersect. This is one of Jung’s most fascinating ideas; yet, one may wonder whether it is possible to separate it from the overriding religious tone that Jung found to be a necessity.

324 Jung therapeutic method known as “Active Imagination” is based on triggering out unconscious content by starting with a conscious material then allowing it to develop down into the corresponding unconscious material. It is as if starting from a fantasy, with all its conscious details and allow it to ‘fall asleep’ into deeper, unknown fabric of the psyche. It is a fast transition from fantasy to its very close neighbour – a dream.
A. Lets not use that word. You know? It frightens me. But I do love you... and you know... there is something very important... that we need to do as soon as possible.

T. What's that?

A. Fuck.

It seems that Alice is psychologically stronger than Bill. She has her feet on the ground when it comes to facing a fantasy. And she is realistic enough to know that when it comes to defying sexual fantasies the concept of ‘Defying Forever’ is not necessarily valid, but rather whimsically and capriciously unpredictable. Her reluctance to embrace that ‘forever’ side of the promise and then suggesting a fuck instead is a sign for her coming to terms with the power of fantasy while Bill is still baffled and trying to cling to a masked fantasy named ‘Forever’.

In a quite absurd manner, the end-titles, breaking in directly after the ‘Fuck’ statement take the perceiver back to Shostakovich’ waltz, this time keeping the changes on beat, precisely every four bars. This probably is meant to trick the viewer (yet again) as if saying: “OK, it has been a little frightening fantasy; now we are back to the pleasantly flowing life that is more suited to the fairytale spirit of an exquisite waltz”.

Oddly enough - yet curiously worth mentioning - is Chion’s reading of EWS’s music in a manner suggestively contradicting his own prior advice (p. 37), which leads into a higher sphere of speculation. He says that:

“Listening again to these different pieces of music,\footnote{Shostakovich, Ligeti, Pook} it becomes apparent that they have thematic links, beyond any differences of genre and origin. For
example Ligeti’s *Musica ricercata*, the standard ‘Strangers in the Night’ (in Somerton), Chris Isaak’s song entitled ‘Baby Did a Bad Bad Thing’ (heard when Alice and Bill kiss), the anonymous male voice heard singing backwards in the sequence of the ritual before the orgy and the start of Jocelyn Pook's music for the walk through the various rooms in which couples are fornicating all share a melodic oscillation of two adjacent degrees (that is, which are adjacent in the scale), the interval being either a major or minor second. In concrete terms Ligeti oscillates between F and F sharp, Isaak between E and F sharp, the 'backwards' singer of the ritual between A and B, 'Migrations' in the early part of the fornication sequence between D and E flat and 'Strangers in the Night' between F and G. *Was this an unintended coincidence or was it deliberately calculated?*

326 The reality is there. This observation helps to shed light on a hidden unity between most of the pieces of music that we hear in the film, whose melodies evoke something stiff, fixed or blocked in a narrow space. The melody in the piece by Shostakovich on the other hand unfolds across a much broader space of intervals.”

327

Kubrick’s last film, *Eyes Wide Shut* had a very ambiguous reception, being praised on one hand and furiously criticised on the other.328 But this is a film about fantasy and dream in the everyday life; when these three elements work together or parallel to each other, many features of ‘logic’ and continuity are bound to ‘lose track’. Kubrick’s narrative and images are not Fellini-esque. Even when adapted from an Austrian writer, his rendition of the characters and their narrative in *EWS* is American, quite dissimilar from Fellini’s European style. Yet, when plunging into the domain of the fantastic, unknown and unconscious, both Kubrick’s and Fellini share the same collective qualities. The Jungian/post-Jungian outlook concerns the nature and activity of fantasy and dream (as psychic realities) in the human psyche and their encounter

326 Italics mine
327 Intuitively speaking as a composer of film-scores it is my humble understanding that there is no deliberate calculation of that nature in the film, just the director’s ‘wild card’ choice of music.
328 See Mattessich, S. (2000), equating the film with a caricature.
with the linear reality. From this perspective the music is at times brilliantly
interwoven as a live image of the moment and sometimes as a by-standing image
offering indirect hints – usually emotional – to the spectators. Eyes Wide Shut are
now hopefully open; and so are the ears.

* * *

FINALE (Conclusion)

Vision is not the sole carrier of image. Other senses can share this task among
them, as image first begins as a concept. When we look at an object, we tend to relate
to it as an image, an immediate appearance of an ‘objective’ reflection of a real
existence – a person or any other ‘real’ object. Once we are devoid of external
elements of sight (e.g. light, shadow etc’) we then tend to confabulate surrounding
objects, only this time they are being reflected from our psyche’s ‘database’ of ideas,
knowledge and experience, both personal and collective. Thus we ‘judge’ a person in
the dark by his/her voice and/or even by touch. The interpretation of this judgment
will then be promptly assisted by our psychic capacity to release stored images and
signs acquired and collected throughout our life experience, plumbing deep ancestral
and historic levels of experience. Sound and speech play a major part in this
‘judgment’ process as their intonations (of collective and individual experiences alike)
are vast and contain a plethora of signs and symbols pertaining to ‘realistic’ images.

As an expression of sound, music has a great variety of nuances, some of which
can appear to be as powerful as speech or other immediate expressions. As such,
music can ‘attach’ itself to experience, an attachment that will store itself in the collective ‘database’ of the psyche. In addition to the collective part, and in the same way that the visual image works, there are images that belong uniquely to the individual, images that belong to his/her experience rather than to the all encompassing collective imagery.

Whereas speech developed into language, based on the assignment of specific sounds (or sound-combinations) to an object, idea or any other complex way of communication, music can include all the above, but is never a language. It contains the capacity to work, inspire and intervene in one’s psychological setup, but can not constellate in one’s psyche as a compilation of single-meaning or single-triggering elements. Hence two different people may listen to the same piece of music and be differently ‘signaled’ by it even if their background (geographic, educational and cultural) is similar. At the same time, music can inspire and drive a group into certain feelings and even activities (e.g. dance, mass singing etc).

Carl Gustav Jung’s analytical psychology leans heavily on the phenomenon of image, being a part of a group of ‘atoms’ that construct the psyche. His complex archetypal understanding started with the assumption of what he first called primordial images before distilling the entire concept into his theory of archetypes. As images are the core of the archetype, the images that we can communicate with are not the archetypes themselves but rather archetypal images, the archetype’s imaginal reflection. The archetype per se is more of a concept or an idea, while its reflections direct us through what the conscious mind may depict as ‘real’ images. Both our visual and auditory sensors, eyes and ears, absorb their individual signals and these
will then be reflected through the ‘chief processor’ – the psyche. We can assume then that the senses that carry images are capable – to a greater or lesser extent – of serving as ‘image reflectors’. And in the same way that our conscious mind relates to image-reflections as images in general, so does the process underlying sound and music in particular. For music is psychologically not only an audio signal attached to an event; its complexity, span of time and complex emotional triggering turns it into an excessively processed phenomenon that passes through both conscious and unconscious matrixes and outputs as a Music-image.

As Jung’s original thoughts have evolved and been developed by his direct pupils and by subsequent generations of analytical psychologists, the post-Jungians, so his initial postulates concerning Sign and Symbol and the difference between them have been taken in new directions. Whereas Jung emphasised the symbol’s relation to the unconscious, being the ‘connector’ between unconscious and conscious matrix, he argued that the sign was a use of one object (or idea) to point to another. Thus Jung’s idea of the symbol differed from Freud’s definition, strongly negating the fixed interpretations of what Freud would call symbols and so qualifying them as signs. Yet, some may argue that since the unconscious mind evolves with time, it is possible that some of its components that have undergone a process of becoming conscious might ‘superannuate’ some ‘old’ symbols from being symbols and thus turn them into signs. This symbol-sign dichotomy can powerfully be detected when attempting to interpret that ‘abstract’ music-image, which is made of both archetypal, unconscious affect and an individual’s or group’s signs acquired through conscious knowledge, cultural trends and other cognitive sources. Hence the need for caution when trying to
define music using emotional terms; a dissonant chord will not necessarily 'symbolise' tension and the sound low trombones will not necessarily signify death.

The music-image seems to be an 'abstract', as its reflections are a) difficult to describe and b) convey a plurality of emotions without adhering to one-pattern-of – emotion-only at a time. Due to these qualities we tend to attach a music-image to familiar objects, memories or events which serve as our reference or marker to emotion being as close to it as possible. When music is attached to text (lyrics or narration) we may tend (if and when we are familiar with the language used for that text) to attach these music and text together, thus creating emotional association that 'belongs to a story'. When it runs without text but serves inside (or alongside) another type of artistic expression (ballet, theatre and so on) we may then attempt to match it to that other art. Yet, when music appears ‘plain’ and detached from other types of image we may return to seek an external explanation, using our knowledge or any other form of information. But above all, whether knowingly or otherwise, music has the power to ‘sink’ into the depth of our affect and emotion; this can happen collectively or individually and can then create mood, fear, anxiety or love, to mention only few outcome emotions.

Like any type of image, the music-image is also in need of interpretation, as interpreting is a psychological process of transforming signs and symbols from an unknown, unconscious meaning-potential to fully conscious meaning. Not acting and interacting like a language, the music-image can not be interpreted in a fixed and final way, as if trying to attribute a single meaning to a single music sound. It can only be done in restricted ways that would be based on a collective memory or experience of a
group or an individual engaging with it. Thus, attempting to interpret a piece of music by attaching ‘qualities’ to its elements may make logical sense for one person, yet it may not do so for another. The cross-references that one can gather around a visual-image are more extensive than that of a music-image, which can make the latter feel much more abstract than the former.

The pairing of music-image and visual-image in film started before sound could be physically attached to picture with a soundtrack. Yet, along with technical progress these two elements have become almost inseparable. Whereas in the silent-film era music assumed the roles of the story-teller, the atmosphere-builder, the situation-indicator and the emotion-conductor, with the advent of newer technologies it could finally become a more complex yet subtle image, complementing, contradicting or adding affect, free to express its wider capacity. The more advanced film technology, the more intricate the inter-image relations of audio and visual have become. This, in its turn, requires a more psychologically based understanding of the music-image.

Even though Jung himself and his first-generation followers did not put much emphasis on non-visual images, subsequent generations of followers started considering the application of Image idea onto other image-carrying senses. The latest Post-Jungian ‘trend’ in scrutinising Image in film is indeed growing fast in contemporary post-Jungian thought, yet it has not touched on the music included in the film or music as ‘stand alone’. This thesis takes music, and especially film-music into the realm of images: the Music-Image. This is done by expanding Jung’s general idea of Image juxtaposed with adjacent non-Jungian theories.
As discussed before, there have been various ideas and suggestions concerning the functionality of music in film. Seen (and heard) as an image, this thesis attempts to present functions that are not only overlapping and allowing a natural connection and flow, but are also open to accommodate the individual’s psyche in its personal experience where it interacts with images of ‘two worlds’. Whether specifically commissioned or compiled from existing music, it is – in most of the cases – the director’s intention to put the ‘right’ music-image in the right location in order to create a precise impact of audio-visual interaction, thus resulting in a more complete cinematic result. In the case of commissioned music it is likely that the director will try to convey his emotive feeling regarding a scene in which he/she believes that music should coincide; that is where two individual psyches will be trying to ‘synchronise’ their image-vision and create a music-image. Where there is no composer involved, the director is likely to become the sole authority on creating the music-picture bond, trusting that the pieces of existing music are right and fit for that image-bonding process. Yet, the film is to have another image interpreter, the viewer. As the viewer gets absorbed in the experience of film-as-a-whole, and being in possession of interpretive tools (of which a big part comes from individual and cultural experiences) that a viewer’s understands and interpretation may or may not correspond with the expectations laid by the creators.

This thesis has undertaken the task of applying the Jungian and Post-Jungian theories, both defined and not-yet-fully-developed, into adding and developing more theoretical bases. Its practical application has been using a situation where both visual and audio images are working alongside each other, a classical situation found in film, a medium that can supply understanding grounds for both independent (‘stand alone’,
non film-music) and/or dual-image event, when both images can be analysed in comparison to each other and in corresponding motion. Three ‘behavioural’ attitudes, or functions of music-in-film have been postulated – The incidental, the transitional and conditional – three basic functions of music-and-picture, functions that can stand for and cover the expressions of the music-image, both on its own merit and when against another type of image. Three different films of different eras and genres have been analysed in order to trace the tracks of different types of music and different usage of these in film, covering – either ‘stand alone’ or overlapping – the nuances of the music-image when paired with the visual.

Any music (inside film or independent) can only be analysed with an open mind, leaving room for different interpretations. It has to be remembered that when analysing the contribution of music to a film we also need to delve into the understanding and interpretation of the adjacent visual on all its levels. This understanding will make the connection between the two types of image and may also influence their individual or collective output that communicates with our psyche; sometimes the visual will lead and some other times the music will dictate the tone.

The main objectives of this thesis in contributing to knowledge are:

1. To develop and expand the understanding of Music-Image based on C. G. Jung’s Analytical Psychology, leading to an expansion of existing theories in music psychology.

2. To build a new image-based understanding of music psychological functioning both on its own and when connecting with a visual image.

The first point attempts to extend Jung’s theoretical image notions beyond the visual-only which all his writings explore. It is to develop his core Image ideas into the domain of other image-carrying elements of biological and psychological nature. If images are the building blocks of the archetypes then other senses responding to an archetypal dictate must have their ‘own version’ of Image or else they would act and react outside the archetypal structure of the psyche. [It might be possible that the other senses, that of smell, taste and touch, have their stored ‘memory’ acting within the psyche as images with all or part of the psychological attributes of seeing and hearing; but that should be left for a different kind of research].

The second point has to deal with sound and its connection to archetypal structures, and more so within music, the branch of sound of which ‘organised sound’ is an appropriate definition. As music can be powerfully involved in deep emotions, both of individuals and groups, and as psychoacoustics can supply some answers to ‘how’ but not necessarily to ‘why’, it is a psychological endeavour to go further down the music path in order to gain more new insight of the psyche. When scrutinised independently, and by reaching the conscious and cognitive levels of it, music now reaches the archetypal level, which so far has been seen as ‘abstract’, since there is not enough evidence of history-recorded symbols or even signs leading to an archetypal understanding of music. The encounter of the music-image with a visual-image can at times push existing borders, as the visual imagery can offer some archetypal-image
hints that may replace or add to the sources used by analytical-psychology to trace meaning through psyche’s ‘databases’ such as mythology and religion.

The third point concerns the endeavour of suggesting a wider and more comprehensive perspective of the ways music functions in film; using the three categories – incidental, transitional and conditional allows the understanding of music-in-film as a psychological entity that can deal with smooth integration among its different directions and at the same time with multiple realities. The complementarities and co-existence of these two types of images, the visual and the auditory, are a proof of the existence and co-existence of multiple realities (dual, in our case). Yet, it is to be remembered that a reductive interpretation, or any way of ‘semiotising’ the meaning of music may not be seen, heard or considered to be acceptably equal. As for the debatable point of diegesis or non-diegesis of music in film, the suggested three functions are using these terms as a reference to location in the film’s space, as the music-image in film is an integral part of the film’s diegesis.

Once endorsed, these three points will open way for further research into other image carriers, beyond the visual and auditory; such research may, in turn, expand more the broader scope of the psychological image. The endorsement of the music-image theory may also open gates to other uses of music and psychology, such as music therapy and other art-based therapies.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


http://www.encyclopedia.com/doc/1G2-3435300996.html

Altman, R. (2007). Silent Film Sound, (Film and Culture Series), Columbia University Press


Atkins, I. Kahn. (1983), Source music in motion pictures, London: Associated University Presses


Eerola, T. & Vuoskoski, K. (2011), a comparison of the discrete and dimensional models of emotion in music, Psychology of Music 39(1) 18–49


Ehrenstein, D. and Reed, B. (1982), Rock on Film, New York: Putnam Pub. Group


- Vol. 4, The Interpretation of Dreams I (1900)
- Vol. 5, The Interpretation of Dreams II (1900-19001)
- Vol. 6, The Psychopathology of Everyday Life (1901)
- Vol. 13, Totem and Taboo (1913-1914)
- Vol. 18, Beyond the Pleasure Principle (1920-1922)
- Vol. 19, The Ego and the Id (1923-1925)
- Vol. 21, The Future of an Illusion (1927-1931)


- 223 -


Green, J. (2010). *Understanding the Score: Film Music Communicating to and Influencing the Audience*; the Journal of Aesthetic Education, Volume 44, Number 4, pp. 81-94


**Hockley, L. (2007).** *Frames of Mind: A Post-Jungian Look at Cinema, Television and Technology*, Bristol (UK) and Chicago (USA): Intellect


- Vol. 4, Freud and Psychoanalysis. (1906-1929)
- Vol. 5, Symbols of Transformation. (1911-1952)
- Vol. 6, Psychological Types. (1921)
- Vol. 8, The Structure and Dynamics of the Psyche. (1928-1951)
- Vol. 9 (Part I), The Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious. (1934-1955)
- Vol. 9 (Part II), Aion: Research Into the Phenomenology of the Self (1951)
- Vol. 10, Civilization in Transition. (1918-1958)
- Vol. 11, Psychology and Religion: West and East (1958)
- Vol. 15, The Spirit in Man, Art and Literature. (1929-1950)
- Vol. 18, The Symbolic Life. (Miscellaneous writings).


Michner, C. (1976). *Taxi Driver*. Film Comment; Mar/Apr 1976; 12, 2;


Moses, W. J. (1987). *Vision Denied in Night and Fog and Hiroshima Mon Amour*, Literature/Film Quarterly; 1987; 15, 3; Arts & Humanities Full Text, p. 159


Neumeyer, D. (1997), *Source Music, Background Music, Fantasy and Reality in Early Sound Film*. College Music Symposium, 37, 13-20


Tonks, P. (2001). *Film Music*, Manchester (UK): Pocket Essentials,


- 239 -
FILMOGRAPHY

An American in Paris (1951). Director: Vincente Minnelli, original music by Conrad Salinger + songs by George Gershwin


Butch Cassidy and the Sundance Kid (1969). Director: George Roy Hill, music: Burt Bacharach

Chinatown (1974). Director: Roman Polanski, music: Jerry Goldsmith

Close Encounters of the Third Kind (1977). Director: Steven Spielberg, music: John Williams

Duel (1971). Director: Steven Spielberg, Billy Goldenberg

Farewell, My Lovely (1975). Director: Dick Richards, music: David Shire

High Noon (1952). Director: Fred Zinnemann, music: Dimitri Tiomkin


Laura (1944). Director: Otto Preminger, music: David Raskin
**Match Point** (2005). Director: Woody Allen, Music: Various, non-original arias (by Donizetti, Verdi, Bizet, Carlos Gomes, Rossini and Andrew Lloyd Webber

**Meet Me in St Louis** (1944). Director: Vincente Minnelli, Music: Roger Edens & Conrad Salinger

**Nuit et Brouillard** (1955). Director: Alain Resnais, music: Hanns Eisler

**Play Misty for Me** (1971). Director: Clint Eastwood, Original music: Dee Barton; non-originals by Ewan MacColl, Johnny Otis, Gene Connors, The Gator Creek Organization, Joseph Zawinul, Gordon Mills and Les Reed


**Rosemary’s Baby** (1968). Director: Roman Polanski, Music: Krzysztof Komeda

**Shadows and Fog** (1991). Director: Woody Allen, non-original songs, mainly by Kurt Weill, and also by Robert Katscher & Buddy G. DeSylva and Franz Doelle

**Summer Holiday** (1948). Director: Rouben Mamoulian, Original music: Conrad Salinger, + songs by Harry Warren

**Taxi Driver** (1976). Director: Martin Scorsese, music: Bernard Herrmann

**The Color Purple** (1985). Director: Steven Spielberg, original music by Quincy Jones (+ various pieces by Rod Temperton, Jeremy Lubbock, Porter Grainger, Andrae
& Sandra Crouch, Thomas A. Dorsey, Lil Armstrong, Edward Heyman, Robert Sour and Frank Eyton)


The Third Man (1949). Director: Carol Reed, music: Anton Karas (+ songs by Irving Fields and Henry Love)


The Umbrellas of Cherbourg (1964). Director: Jacques Demy, music: Michel Legrand

The Jazz Singer (1927). Director: Alan Crosland, Original music: Louis Silvers. (+ various non-original songs and classical pieces)

Titanic (1997). Director: James Cameron, Music: James Horner

Yolanda and the Thief (1945). Director: Vincente Minnelli, Music: Lennie Hayton and Harry Warren

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clip Page</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>DVD Folder</th>
<th>Clip Full Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>132</td>
<td>TD_Ex_01</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_01.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>134</td>
<td>TD_Ex_02</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_02.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>134</td>
<td>TD_Ex_03</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_03.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>134</td>
<td>TD_Ex_04</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_04.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>136</td>
<td>TD_Ex_05</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_05.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>139, 140</td>
<td>TD_Ex_06</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_06.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>140</td>
<td>TD_Ex_06_aud</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_06_aud.mp3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>142</td>
<td>TD_Ex_07</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_07.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>143</td>
<td>TD_Ex_08</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_08.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>144</td>
<td>TD_Ex_09</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_09.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>144</td>
<td>TD_Ex_10</td>
<td>1. Taxi Driver</td>
<td>TD_Ex_10.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>162</td>
<td>NF_full_music_only</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard/Film+music (no narration)</td>
<td>NF_full_music_only.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>163</td>
<td>NF_Ex_01</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_01.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>165</td>
<td>NF_Ex_02</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_02.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>165</td>
<td>NF_Ex_03</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_03.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>165</td>
<td>NF_Ex_04</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_04.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>165</td>
<td>NF_Ex_05</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_05.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>166</td>
<td>NF_Ex_06</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_06.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>NF_Ex_07</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_07.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>170</td>
<td>NF_Ex_08</td>
<td>2. Nuit et Brulliard</td>
<td>NF_08.avi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>193</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_01</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>195</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_02</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>196</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_03</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>197</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_04</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>197</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_05</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>197</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_05a</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_05a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>198</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_06</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>199</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_07</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_08</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>201</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_09</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>202</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_10</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_11</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_12</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_13</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_14</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>205</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_15</td>
<td>3. Eyes Wide Shut</td>
<td>EWS_Ex_15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>