A randomised control trial of physical activity in a perceived environment on self-esteem and mood in UK adolescents
Wood C, Angus C, Pretty J, Sandercock G and Barton J

This is an author's accepted manuscript of an article published by Taylor & Francis in the International Journal of Environmental Health Research 23 (4) 311-320, 2013. The final definitive version is available online at:

https://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09603123.2012.733935

The WestminsterResearch online digital archive at the University of Westminster aims to make the research output of the University available to a wider audience. Copyright and Moral Rights remain with the authors and/or copyright owners.

Whilst further distribution of specific materials from within this archive is forbidden, you may freely distribute the URL of WestminsterResearch: (http://westminsterresearch.wmin.ac.uk/).

In case of abuse or copyright appearing without permission e-mail repository@westminster.ac.uk
A randomised control trial of physical activity in a perceived environment on self-esteem and mood in UK adolescents

Wood, C*. Angus, C. Pretty, J. Sandercock, G. and Barton, J.

School of Biological Sciences, University of Essex, Colchester, United Kingdom

*Corresponding Author: School of Biological Sciences, University of Essex, Colchester, CO4 3SQ, United Kingdom. Email: cjwood@essex.ac.uk
A randomised control trial of physical activity in a perceived environment on self-esteem and mood in UK adolescents

This study assessed whether exercising whilst viewing natural or built scenes affected self-esteem (SE) and mood in adolescents. Twenty-five adolescents participated in three exercise tests on consecutive days. A graded exercise test established the work rate equivalent to 50% heart rate reserve for use in subsequent constant load tests (CLTs). Participants undertook two 15-minute CLTs in random order viewing scenes of either natural or built environments. Participants completed Rosenberg’s self-esteem scale and the adolescent profile of mood states questionnaire pre- and post-exercise. There was a significant main effect for SE (F(1)=6.10; P<0.05) and mood (F(6)=5.29; P<0.001) due to exercise, but no effect of viewing different environmental scenes (P>0.05). Short bouts of moderate physical activity can have a positive impact on SE and mood in adolescents. Future research should incorporate field studies to examine the psychological effects of contact with real environments.

Keywords: self-esteem; mood; physical activity; natural environment; adolescents

Word Count:

1. Introduction
The health benefits of engaging in physical activity (PA) during adolescence include reduced risks of developing; high blood cholesterol, hypertension or suffering from low bone mineral density (Biddle et al., 2004; Hallal et al., 2006; Janssen and Leblanc, 2010; Janz et al., 2010). PA has been shown to have a positive impact on psychological well-being (PWB) (Ortega et al., 2008; Kristjansson et al., 2010) and can improve both self-esteem (SE) and mood (Calfas and Taylor, 1994; Ekeland et al., 2005), two commonly-used indicators of PWB. However, the duration and intensity of exercise required for optimal gains in SE and mood is not clear (Parfitt and Eston, 2005). Less healthy individuals have an increased frequency of illness and psychological symptoms
(Paluska and Schwenk, 2000), highlighting the importance of PA in the prevention of poor physical and mental health.

Despite the importance of PA for health, only 57-71% of UK adolescents (11-15 years) achieve the recommended 60 min of daily PA (NHS Information Centre, 2011). PA often declines during adolescence, particularly in girls (NHS Information Centre, 2011), so finding the best approach to increase PA levels is paramount. Natural environments can facilitate activity in youth (Taylor et al., 1998) as individuals with access to nature are three times as likely to be active (Wells et al., 2007). However, parental fear of crime, abduction and increased traffic has resulted in reduced opportunities for outdoor PA (Davis, 1999; Orr, 2000; Biddle et al., 2004). Less than 10% of youth utilise natural environments, compared with 40% of adults, who did so as children (Natural England, 2009). Young people are regularly confined to activities that take place in indoor spaces (Fjortoft, 2001; Pretty et al., 2009), thus contributing to the low levels of PA.

Natural environments are also important for PWB (Kaplan and Kaplan, 1989; Kaplan, 2001; Kahn and Kellert, 2002; Maller et al., 2006). Simply living in a more natural environment and having green views from the home can have a positive effect on cognitive function (Wells, 2000; Wells and Evans, 2003). Access to natural environments can be protective against stressful life events and reduce associated psychological distress (Wells and Evans, 2003), whilst also influencing educational and social development (Natural England, 2009). The well-being of youth is closely linked to their ability to access natural environments (Thomas and Thompson, 2004; Maller et al., 2006).

In adults there is an additive health benefit of performing PA in natural environments, so called ‘green exercise’ (Pretty et al., 2005). Exercising whilst viewing
scenes of natural environments improves SE and mood more, than equivalent exercise whilst viewing built environments lacking nature (Pretty et al., 2005). Engaging in physical activities within real natural environments also significantly improves SE and mood in adults (Pretty et al., 2007; Morita et al., 2007; Barton et al., 2009; Barton et al., 2011). However, whilst young adults often show the largest gains in SE due to green exercise (Barton and Pretty, 2010), there is a paucity of evidence for such effects in adolescents. The aim of this study was to analyse the effects of exercising whilst viewing natural and built environments on adolescent SE and mood.

2. Method

2.1 Participants

Twenty five healthy adolescents were recruited from a suburban local secondary school to participate in the study. Students were selected by the school to attend an annual University science week in July 2009, but inclusion in the research study was voluntary. All students who were invited to participate completed the study and were deemed fit and healthy by school, parental and individual consent. Eleven males and fourteen females volunteered to take part, aged (mean ± SD) 13.1 ± 0.3 years. Written informed consent was obtained from both the participant and a parent/guardian prior to testing. Institutional ethical approval for the study was granted.

2.2 Experimental Procedures

Participants performed three exercise tests on consecutive days. On day one a graded exercise test (GXT) was undertaken and basic anthropometric data were collected, comprising the participant’s stature to the nearest 0.1cm, with the participant barefoot (Seca 220 stadiometer) and mass, to the nearest 0.1kg (Seca 770 digital scale). Body
mass index (BMI) and BMI z-scores relative to the individual’s age and sex were also calculated (Cole et al., 1995). On days two and three participants completed two constant load tests (CLT) whilst viewing a series of scenes consisting of either natural or built environments. Participants completed both conditions and the order of the scenes was randomised and counterbalanced to eliminate any order effects. The randomisation of scenes was performed by the authors on arrival of the participant to the laboratory. The participant selected a piece of paper from a bag, numbered with either a one or a two. Participants who selected a number one were allocated to the natural environment condition first, whilst participants who selected a two were allocated to the built environment condition first. The authors did not allow their knowledge of which pictures were being viewed to affect the experimental procedures. Psychological assessment took place immediately prior to and following the completion of the CLTs. As soon as each participant had finished cycling they were requested to sit down and complete the questionnaires.

2.3 Exercise Tests

Participants completed a GXT on a cycle ergometer (Monark 814 or 824, Monark Exercise AB, Varberg, Sweden) until volitional fatigue. Cycling speed was set at 60 rpm, initial resistance was 0.5 W/kg body weight and increased by 0.5 W/kg body weight at 2 min increments. Heart rate was recorded at 5 s intervals throughout the test (Polar S610i, Polar Electro Oy, Finland). Participants rested for 5 min prior to the GXT and resting heart rate was also measured.

Days two and three required two constant load cycling tests (CLTs) to be completed on the same cycle ergometer, lasting 10 mins each. Participants were instructed to cycle at a constant speed and the exercise intensity adjusted in order that
participants were cycling at 50% heart rate reserve (ACSM, 2006), as determined by the GXT. Subjects viewed scenes of the natural or built environment on a projector screen positioned 4 m in front of the cycle ergometer, whilst performing the CLT. The scenes of the built environment comprised views of buildings containing no green spaces, whilst the scenes of the natural environment consisted of entirely green and natural areas. The series of pictures appeared sequentially and were viewed in a randomised order for 15 s intervals. Heart rate was measured during the test at 5 s intervals.

2.4 Picture Categorisation

Independent assessment for the categorisation of pictures as either natural or built are detailed previously (Pretty et al., 2005). To be included, 95% of 50 panel members had to agree that the picture strongly represented the target description.

2.5 Assessment of self-esteem and mood

Monitoring of SE and mood took place immediately pre- and post- each CLT using standardised questionnaires. SE was assessed using the Rosenberg Self–Esteem Scale (Rosenberg, 1965) and mood was monitored using the Adolescent Profile of Mood States Questionnaire (POMS-A) (Terry et al., 1999).

2.6 Statistical Analysis

Independent t-tests examined for sex differences in participant anthropometric and exercise test parameters. Two paired t-tests examined for differences in baseline SE and total mood disturbance (TMD) between the two environmental conditions. Two mixed factorial ANOVAs determined the effect of PA, environmental scenes and sex on SE and TMD respectively. One way within MANOVA examined for differences in the
baseline sub-scale mood factors between the two environmental conditions. A mixed factorial MANOVA assessed the effects of PA whilst viewing different environmental scenes on sub-scale mood, by sex. Significance was accepted at an alpha level of 0.05. Bonferroni corrected alpha levels were used to indicate statistical differences between the six sub-scale components of mood (α=0.0083).

3. Results

All 25 participants completed the study. A total of 22 participants had complete data sets. Three participants had missing data due to absence or incomplete questionnaires. Missing data was labelled in SPSS, so that all data and participants could be included in the analysis.

There were no significant differences in anthropometric characteristics between males and females (Table I). BMI z-scores indicate above average BMI for age and sex in boys and girls. Compared with girls, boys achieved significantly greater; absolute peak power (t(23)= 3.30; P<0.01), relative peak power (t(23)= 3.44; P<0.01) and higher peak heart rates (t(23)= 2.34; P<0.05). The CLTs were, therefore performed at power outputs of 89.5±21.4 W and 62.6±11.9 W in boys and girls, respectively.

A Paired t-test revealed no significant difference between the baseline SE scores between the two environmental viewing conditions (P>0.05). Mixed ANOVA revealed a significant main effect on SE due to PA (F(1)=6.10, P<0.05) but not due to the environmental viewing condition (urban vs. rural) (P>0.05) (Figure 1), indicating that PA alone improved SE. No sex differences in SE were identified (P>0.05).

One way within MANOVA revealed no significant differences between the baseline sub-scale mood scores between the two conditions (P>0.05). For mood, there was no significant effect of viewing different environmental conditions (P>0.05), or a
sex effect (P>0.05) (Table 2). There was a significant main effect for mood changes due to participating in PA (F(6) =5.29, P<0.001). Mixed MANOVA revealed that PA resulted in a significant increase in fatigue (F(1) =8.11, P<0.0083) together with a concomitant decrease in tension (F(1) =11.56, P< P<0.0083) (Figure 2). All other sub-scale mood factors showed no significant difference between the pre- and post-exercise scores (P> 0.0083).

A paired t-test revealed that there were no differences in baseline TMD scores between the two environmental viewing conditions (P>0.05). Mixed ANOVA revealed no significant main effect for TMD due to participation in PA (P>0.05), viewing different environmental scenes (P>0.05) or sex (P>0.05).

4. Discussion

The findings of this study suggest that engaging in PA improves SE and mood in adolescents. Viewing different environmental scenes did not however, affect SE or mood changes. Previous studies have shown that PA improves PWB (Calfas and Taylor, 1994; Tremblay et al., 2000; Ekeland et al., 2005; Ortega et al., 2008; Kristjansson et al., 2010). In the present study, participation in PA enhanced SE and also improved mood, mostly via decreases in tension. Improvements in PWB may be linked to a concomitant improvement in cardio respiratory fitness achieved through increased levels of PA (Crews et al., 2004). If PA is of a sufficient intensity to incur a change in fitness, it can also influence factors such as SE and mood (Ortega et al., 2008). However, vigorous PA equivalent to or greater than 80% maximum heart rate or 6 metabolic equivalents is required to enhance fitness in adolescents (Ortega et al., 2008). The improvements in SE and tension found in this study occurred after a single bout of exercise at a relatively moderate intensity (50% HRR), equivalent to brisk
walking (ACSM, 2006). This intensity is some 10% lower than required to improve fitness in young people (Stratton, 1996). Thus, an acute bout of moderate PA may improve PWB, even though it does not influence fitness. Observing such an effect may be an important finding as it is more accessible, achievable and can easily be built into every day routines (Fairclough et al., 2012).

Adult PA recommendations can be achieved by performing 10 min bouts of PA throughout the day (Department of Health, 2009). To improve PWB in adolescents, short bouts of moderate PA should therefore be encouraged. The school day provides regular breaks suitable for short bouts of PA (Ridgers et al., 2006) and our findings that moderate intensity exercise of short duration improved PWB are encouraging. Compared with hour-long bouts or high intensity workouts, such a low dose of exercise is likely to be more achievable to habitual non-exercisers (Fairclough et al., 2012).

Despite the low overall exercise dose, participants unexpectedly reported increased feelings of fatigue. This may be due to participants being unaccustomed to the exercise mode, but despite the perception of some fatigue exercise still reduced tension and improved SE.

In adults viewing scenes of natural environments has been shown to improve SE and mood to a greater extent than either PA alone or viewing scenes of the built environment (Pretty et al., 2005). The results of the current study suggest that there is no effect of the environment on SE or mood in adolescents, and therefore contradict the results of Pretty et al (2005). Whilst, no mechanisms to explain the effect of green exercise on PWB have been identified, the psychological changes experienced through contact with nature are proposed to occur due to the stimulation of the endocrine stress system and associated reductions in blood pressure and cortisol concentrations and the enhanced activity of the parasympathetic nervous system (Park et al., 2010). However,
in adolescents it may be that these changes do not occur during exposure to nature or that they do not affect adolescents in the same way that they do adults. The next section will outline some tentative hypotheses to explain the lack of environmental effect in youth.

The current generation of youth spend less time interacting with natural environments than previous generations (Bird, 2007). Parental fears over stranger-danger and increases in traffic mean that PA is restricted to indoor spaces (Biddle et al., 2004; Department for Children Schools and Families and Department for Culture Media and Sport, 2008). Furthermore, the availability of green spaces continues to decline as natural areas are often built upon to provide housing and amenities (Maller et al., 2006; Maas et al., 2006). A lack of contact with the natural environment during youth may have resulted in a disconnection from and a poor understanding of the natural world in adulthood (Bird, 2007). An individual's level of connection to the natural environment may be an important factor in determining the degree of health benefits received from having contact (Bratman et al., 2012), thus a lack of connection may result in a lack of benefits for PWB.

There were no sex differences in SE or mood. Whilst evidence regarding sex differences in PWB is sparse, research examining the relationship between PA and PWB is indicative of a greater PWB in males (Feingold, 1994; Kling et al., 1999). Higher levels of PA are associated with increased levels of fitness (Ortega et al., 2008) and thus greater SE and mood (Calfas and Taylor, 1994; Tremblay et al., 2000; Ekeland et al., 2005; Kristjansson et al., 2010). Males engage in more PA than females (Department of Health, 2009) and performed better on the GXT in the current study; demonstrating higher cardio respiratory fitness. PA and fitness are both correlated to PWB. As such, it might be expected that SE and mood would be higher in males.
(Ortega et al., 2008) however, in our study females benefited as much from the exercise irrespective of their inferior fitness.

There are a number of limitations that should be noted within this study. Firstly, the questionnaires are open to a ‘ceiling and floor effect’. A participant may rate themselves as having the best possible level of SE pre-exercise. Therefore, any improvement in SE due to the intervention cannot be quantified since a maximum questionnaire score has already been achieved. The study also lacks ecological validity. The environmental scenes were artificial and viewed from within a laboratory to enable potential confounding variables such as the exercise intensity, temperature, terrain and social interactions to be controlled for. However exposure to the real environment would provide a multi-sensory experience of nature. The variety of sights and sounds experienced within natural environments cannot be reflected by simply viewing scenes indoors. The small sample size could also be considered as a study limitation, particularly when analyzing sub-groups of participants. A greater sample size would have allowed for greater statistical power when analysing for changes in SE and mood.

5. Conclusion

While there was no environmental effect for PWB, adolescents’ SE and mood were significantly improved by a short bout of moderate-intensity PA. The ability to positively alter SE and mood after an acute bout of activity has important implications for adolescent health and behaviour, curriculum design and school activities. The findings also inform the methodology of future studies, as it may be possible to encourage people to take part in green exercise if they feel that the bout of PA is achievable. This approach might be effective at targeting and engaging sedentary adolescents, who would benefit the most from engaging in PA. Thus, strategies to
improve PWB in adolescents should target PA levels and provide regular opportunities for short bouts of non-intensive PA.

Acknowledgements: The authors would like to thank the school and participants for their participation in the research. None of the authors have conflict of interest with regards to the publication of this research paper.

6. References


Table 1. Mean ± SD participant demographics and fitness test results (*P<0.05 and **P<0.01 indicates significant gender differences).

Table 2. Mean ± SD sub-scale mood factors in males and females pre- and post-viewing environmental scenes.

Figure 1. Self-esteem scores in adolescents’ pre- and post-exercise, following viewing of rural or urban scenes. The lower the score, the better the self-esteem (*indicates a significant difference between pre- and post-self-esteem, irrespective of viewing condition, P<0.05).

Figure 2. Change in the six sub-scale components of mood as a result of exercise participation (*indicates a significant difference between pre- and post-exercise condition, P<0.0083).