Beyond survival?
People management strategies for development and growth of PSM organisations in a fragmented digital media landscape

Initial findings and headline recommendations

Research conducted by
Peter Block of the University of Westminster
in partnership with the Public Media Alliance
Supported by Mark Iliff of Talespinner who designed the on-line tool used in this study
June 2019

CONFIDENTIAL AND PROPRIETARY
Any use of this material without the specific permission of Peter Block or the Public Media Alliance is strictly prohibited
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Overview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>The literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>The methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Outputs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Next steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Annex</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Section 1: Overview
Recap on scope of work
The Public Media Alliance (PMA) is the largest global association of public media organisations and focuses specifically on providing advocacy and support for public media worldwide in the digital age.

PMA has a unique global overview of how public media is being affected by the acceleration of media convergence. We curate and aggregate research and commentary from media academics and practitioners around the world as public broadcasting evolves into public media.

Our vision is a world where the public can continue to access free, independent, engaging and representative national and international media wherever they are.
Context and scope of work
A recap on the pressure on public service media (PSM) and the implications for PMA members

Drivers for change identified in academic literature and reports

- Human Resource Management (HRM) identified as a business priority
- The need to be more creative and develop local talent
- Changes to the industry workforce and job roles with multiplatform delivery
- Pressures to publicly communicate commitment to encourage diversity & inclusion and to support and develop employees
- Notable initiatives by some members can be exemplars for others

Are PSM organisations lacking a coherent, strategic approach to HRM?

Scope of work

- A pilot study review of HRM processes with a cross-section of PMA members
- Benchmark the pilot sample against a comparator set
- Assess the pilot group against HRM benchmarks, and
- Offer some practical steps that organisations can take to improve performance (noting resource constraints)

Enable PMA members to make informed decisions on how to practically and systematically enhance their approach to HRM as a stated business priority.
The application of a **maturity model** to analyse **human resource processes**; the case of **public service media** companies

**Subtitle**

What is a maturity model is and how and why to use it
Section 2: The literature

The landscape and academic sources
HR is a live topic for the creative industries across the globe (1/3) from the Oscars to employment practices

British TV directors from **ethnic minorities** ‘forced to follow black actors to US to further careers‘ Directors UK research Dec 2015 (ongoing) #Oscarssowhite

Idris Elba (2017), one of Britain’s best known actors, called out the **tokenism** that sees him constantly referred to not as the actor who could play James Bond, but as the person who could fulfil the need for the producers of Bond to say they cast someone black. He argues that women and black actors are a commercial risk.

43% of newspaper columnists and 26% of BBC senior management are **privately educated** compared to 7% overall Social mobility report 2014

I’ve had enough of white people who try to deny my experience… …While some white people are enjoying their colour-blindness, people of colour are getting on with having no choice but to live in a racialised reality. Take any random day. In a 24-hour period this week, Nadiya Hussain, who won the Great British Bake Off, wrote: “I’m Muslim, Brown, working class and a woman! I may as well have punching bag written on my torso.” Afua Hirsch (2018) https://www.theguardian.com/profile/afuahirsch #MeToo

‘I used to think the door to **BAME working class** writers had been left ajar by the UK industry… I’m now realising it was more like the keyhole of a firmly bolted door, that I painfully squeezed through. Open the fuckin’ door’ Michaela Coel the writer and actor whose series Chewing Gum won two Baftas, tweeted (2017)
Only 12% of the workforce is from less advantaged socio-economic backgrounds… in response … Barbara Broccoli stated ‘… we live in a diverse society and it is vital both culturally and commercially that our industry reflects this in front of and behind the camera.’

Many media and creative companies may be perceived as LGBT friendly but their informal image and practices can make it harder to network and be out for LGBT people.

According to the office of national statistics, 14% of people in employment aged 16-64 considered themselves disabled. However, the 2012 Creative Skillset employment census shows that only 0.3% of the total film workforce are disabled (2% in production, 0.1% in exhibition and none in distribution).

Companies are reporting their gender pay gap data. And it’s looking pretty bad.

HR is a live topic for the creative industries across the globe (2/3) from the Oscars to employment practices…women are delivering both commercial and critical successes. In 2012, women made up 46% of the film workforce, and yet only 7.8% of the UK films released were directed and only 13.4% were written by women, demonstrating that there is still a lot of work to be done.
HR is a live topic for the creative industries across the globe (3/3) from the Oscars to employment practices.
Growing number of HRM related reports, awards and benchmarks

- EY Report: Top 250 companies (2017)
  - Statista surveyed 30,000 employees (Disney 29th, Google 34th)
  - Eight from media and advertising

- Forbes The Best Employers for Diversity 2018 (in the USA)
  - The top companies gave ‘an unusual level of transparency into its workforce demographics’

  - the business case revisited

- The Peterson Institute for International Economics and EY report
  - Analysed the results from approximately 21,980 global publicly traded companies in 91 countries from a variety of industries and sectors
  - organization with 30 percent female leaders could add up to 6 percentage points to its net margin.

Volume of research overwhelmingly conclude that workforce diversity is good for business
Kim Hoque & Mike Noon (2002) identified ‘the types of workplaces that are more likely to adopt formal gender, ethnicity, disability and age policies. They then assessed whether the policies are ‘substantive’ or merely ‘empty shells’: by evaluating the extent to which workplaces that have adopted EO policies have also adopted supporting EO practices ... workplaces without an HR or personnel specialist are identified as being more likely to have an ‘empty shell’ policy.

From Public Service Broadcasting to Public Service Media (Bardoel & Lowe, 2007): Being the most dynamic, innovative and successful sector in media services development requires PSB to develop convincing arguments and practical instruments that make its public dimension more explicit and transparent on the one hand, and its service dimension more effective and efficient on the other. To be the best in media services for the public, PSM must not lose faith with the core public service ethos that is rooted in PSB, but neither can PSM succeed without developing that ethos to transcend PSB.
Holgate and McKay (2009) go further to say more emphatically that the media (AV in their terms) industry ‘cannot deliver gains for workers in those sectors where employment is fragmented and insecure – the nature of employment is also a factor’.

**The bellwether effect**: Across the world creative industries are a key feature of economic policy to drive GDP (Eikhof & Warhurst 2012); globally PSM companies are the target of government scrutiny on matters of representation and diversity.

Block (2017) makes the case that the lack of quantitative data and targets undermines progress to change. The lack of transparency remains a contentious issue. Others EY, Forbes (USA), The Lammy Report (2017) all agree the lack of transparency and open reporting is a barrier to change.

Green Park Leadership 10,000 and Drive Report (2018) The accidental HR improvement through company listing changes conclude that business leaders need to: tone down meaningless rhetoric.
HRM maturity models
How might we examine and quantify HRM processes?

- To date there has been limited empirical evidence in the use of maturity models in HRM processes (Zare et al, 2018)

- A working definition of HRM Maturity Model: *Assessment tool that helps the HR Professional to identify the weaknesses of internal HRM System, by comparing the maturity map of their company with the standard HRM maturity map* (Chasovichi, 2011)

- The purpose is to take a snap shot of the HRM System in the company, to:-
  - offer an opportunity for HR team to reflect on their work – a self help tool
  - provides a scorecard of additional information for decision makers
  - help HR managers establish priorities
  - improve the performance of HR Function and the performance of the employees
  - Save time and easy to use, therefore money saving
Two maturity models developed from the work of Block and Shapiro (2010)
Tested with over 70 UK Broadcast companies

- The HR landscape can be mapped by two models that cover the employment lifecycle that Block & Shapiro labelled as **include(I)** and **develop(D)** with 22 dimensions / attributes
- Each has three level 1 attributes: Strategy, Action and Evaluation
- Include has 15 level 2 attributes
- Develop has 9 level 2 attributes
- Each level 2 attribute can be allocated a measure of progress to maturity:
  - none, base, low, medium and high
- The level 3 attributes provides the evidence to support the level 2 measure to substantiate the internal audit
Two maturity models developed from the work of Block and Shapiro (2010)
Include has 15 level 2 attributes with descriptors for evaluators to apply

Strategy
- Shared leadership
- Improving business performance
- Policies & resources

Taking action
- Recruitment
- Development
- Work design
- Customers
- Suppliers
- Community

Evaluating outcomes
- Recruitment
- Development
- Work design
- Customers
- Suppliers
- Community
Two maturity models developed from the work of Block and Shapiro (2010)
Develop has 9 level 2 attributes with descriptors for evaluators to apply

Strategy
- Link to organisational objectives
- Communicating with staff

Taking action
- New staff
- On-the-job training
- Off-the-job training

Evaluating outcomes
- Individual evaluation
- Evaluation systems
These two models are combined to an on-line tool that captures scores and evidence to create an index for HRM.

The pilot study selected a cross section of PMA members and asked them to complete the on-line self evaluation form.

The average organisation will score between 45-55, high performing companies score 75+.
The HRM map of the maturity model

Archetypal behaviours can be described as reactive, transactional or strategic leadership.

Differences at the top end are marginal; they turn on evaluation and transparency - **strategic leadership**

There is a wider variation with middle ranking companies where action can predominate - **transactional**

As the low end there is a limited expression of strategy, actions are **reactive**.
Section 3: Methodology
Quantitative and qualitative models
How might we examine and quantify HRM processes?

- **Quantitative (QUAN)**
  - Workforce data
    - Roles by gender, race, disability, age
  - Churn and recruitment
  - Employee surveys
  - KPIs
  - L&D spend

- **Qualitative (QUAL)**
  - HRM annual reports and KPIs
    - Maturity models

---

Creswell, 2014
The review process

Diverse data sources, including secondary and primary research

- Desk review of available internal documentation, policies, and initiatives
- Desk review of published materials and third-party commentary on broadcasters
- Review of industry body standards and guidance
- Literature review
- Desk Review (External)
- Desk Review (tbc internal)
- External interviews
- Internal interviews (tbc)
- Analysis drawing on HR knowledge and data for analysis
- Interviews with leading stakeholders and media-sector HRM leaders, specialists, journalists, and influencers

HR Review

HR, Communications and CSR
External data sources have been reviewed to inform the online self-evaluation.

Seven categories of public documents reviewed in pilot organisations:
1. Published Policy
2. EO / Diversity Statement
3. Targets
4. Schemes
5. Impact Statement
6. Recruitment Policies
7. Induction & Training Policy

Other sources also reviewed:
- Corporate websites
- HRM websites
- Annual Reports
- Journals
- Academic reports
- Newspaper articles
- Consulting firm reports such as EY and Forbes

Do they substantiate the completion of the HRM maturity model applied in this study?
Benchmarking: the pilot study references a comparator set for good practice and exemplar cases based on the maturity model framework. HRM behaviours can be characterised as minimum, good business and leadership.

**Base - reactive**
- Compliance and risk-driven
- Not core to business
- Often reactive
- Often isolated initiatives
- Little or no evidence of clear policies, initiatives, external reporting or acclaim

**Minimum**
- Aligned with business strategy
- Clear KPIs, ROI, data gathering
- Adapted to organisational practice and stakeholder engagement
- Clear governance arrangements
- Drivers shifting from risk mitigation, to business opportunity

**Medium - proactive**
- Integrated into business strategy
- Integrated into business processes and systems, including performance and reward KPIs
- Focused on creating sustainable value via new business opportunities
- Visible external acclaim and collaborations

**High - opportunity**
Section 4: Findings

Benchmark summary
Can PSM companies walk the talk?

The external audit indicates limited publicly available evidence to support the rhetoric.

- The key weakness area for the sector as a whole and the majority of film and TV companies relates to the need to formally evaluate and publish the effectiveness of their efforts.
- Workforce composition (identified by gender, race, disability etc.) delineated by where people might be found in the hierarchy, provide the much needed quantitative measure.
- Across the industry there is limited continuity of effort or tracking of data over the long term.

- Global statements are not supported by documented evidence
- Efforts will likely remain ‘empty shells’
- No published targets
- No transparency
- Limited exemplars / cases
Observations: the current situation
Data from the pilot study was cross referenced with published documents

- The historical context / legacy of the PSM impacts on the governance and public duty of the broadcaster
- HRM is reported in anodyne terms in annual reports and organisational websites
- Independent observers have limited sources to review
- Lack of transparency
- A need to tone down meaningless rhetoric
- A high **include** score will have a high develop score
- A high **develop** score does not lead to a high include score
Overall there are significant gaps in the collective knowledge of HRM in the PSM sector.

In the pilot study the lowest index score 16 and highest 86 with at SD of 25. Based on cross referencing with published documents the ‘16’ is brutally honest and the ‘86’ an overstatement.

- Anodyne statements; no over-arching ambition, commitment and statement of purpose
- Policies are not in place
- There is no coherent, over-arching strategy
- Governance arrangements need to be fully embedded
- Lack of coherence and common narrative across organisations
- Resource constraints limit improved performance
  - Communication could be further enhanced to engage more stakeholders
  - Existing investments could be better leveraged
- Little publicly available evidence of over-arching targets

• PMA organizations that follow the BBC governance model go beyond compliance.
• Those that don’t follow the BBC model produce annual reports with very limited focus on employees.
• There is a focus by Asian PSM organisations to present their leaders not leadership
• Some overstatement of HRM actions
• Limited transparency and evidence by most in pilot study
Section 5: Outputs

(Conclusions and recommendations)
What leadership in HRM could look like...

- Tone from the top – strong commitment and ambition (Viacom).

- Clear and transparent targets to galvanise action and set direction (Channel 4).

  Targets underpinned by data gathering (from questionnaires) of workforce, applicants, etc.

- Compelling strategy to set the course of action (BBC).

Few companies display leadership features across the board.
1. **The drivers for change**
   - *Risk*: non-compliance presents reputational, operational or legal risks
   - *Opportunity*: for talent recruitment and retention, innovation and future proofing
   - *Values*: walking the talk - it is the right thing to do

2. **Data gathering and targets are essential...**
   - What gets measured gets done (quantitative measures and targets)

3. **...Supported by transformation efforts**
   - It is important to commit to changes and commence actions, however small (mindset and behaviour shifts take time and effort)

4. **2019 a time of inflection**
   - The need for projects that will stimulate change

5. **Some PMA companies in the pilot group appear to be under-performing in HRM versus competitive set and comparators**

6. **Recommendations include the need to**
   - Take some immediate practical steps to improve HRM performance
   - Define a strategy and associated processes for execution
   - Create a HRM community
   - Build on exemplars

---

Volume of research overwhelmingly conclude that well managed HRM is good for business
The indications are that PSMs lag the competition; current approaches represent an organisational risk. This review suggests that there are examples of good practice across the sector, they need to be shared.

Put the essentials in place

1. Establish a clear mandate for HRM
2. Secure dedicated resource to drive HRM
3. Audit current practices across PSM – to highlight learning points and gaps
4. Capture baseline data (employee / supplier profiles etc.) via questionnaires / other
5. Review recruitment processes – to ensure transparency and lack of unconscious bias
6. Strengthen support for networks
7. Conduct internal annual review against a standard

Build on the essentials

1. Establish a strategic ambition and common narrative for HRM
2. Establish clear KPIs and data gathering processes etc. building on baselines
3. Create a holistic HRM strategy
4. Strengthen governance arrangements, with a steering Group providing strategic oversight, championship and challenge
5. Build groups / networks to raise consciousness, improve practices, offer mentoring, learning and access to role models
6. Consider external communication of performance

Strategic vision

1. Fully integrate HRM into business strategy
2. Integrate into business processes and systems, including performance and reward KPIs
3. Establish annual HRM Barometer / survey to gauge trajectory of performance
4. Ensure internal and external reporting against performance targets
5. Establish PMA wide HRM awards – to celebrate practice / inspire further improvements

Date: June 2019
Section 6: Next steps?
Beyond survival?
People management strategies for development and growth of PSBs in a fragmented digital media

Next steps

• PMA community to reflect on findings and recommendations
• Undertake detailed planning for full study
• Share examples of good practice
• Establish a community of practice
• As noted elsewhere by the PMA collaboration is key
Section 7: Annex

Industry benchmarks BBC and Channel 4

EY a global benchmark
Industry benchmarks BBC and Channel 4
## Diversity and Inclusion Strategy 2016-20 Summary

The key steps we set out in this strategy are bold and detailed. We judge that by 2020 the BBC will have:

- a workforce at least as diverse, if not more so, than any other in the industry.
- more prominent roles for diverse voices across all genres.
- a stronger support network for diverse talent.
- a more diverse audience.

### Workforce

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2017 Target</th>
<th>2020 Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>3%* 5%**</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black Asian and ethnic minorities</td>
<td>14.2%* 10%**</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*All staff  **Leadership

### Onscreen Portrayal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2017 Target</th>
<th>2020 Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women on screen, on-air and in lead roles</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability on screen and in some lead roles</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black Asian and ethnic minorities on screen, on-air and in lead roles</td>
<td>15%***</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT on screen and in some lead roles</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***Portrayal only
**Approach**
(policies and strategies)

**Evidence of practice**
(initiatives, performance metrics, etc.)

**Additional information & external acclaim**
(awards, external commentary, etc.)

<p>| BBC: Published medium term strategy and with robust policy and delivery frameworks. Clear evidence to support practice but as recent scandals have highlighted this quickly unravels when examined in detail. It is seen as the benchmark organisation in the Creative Industries by DCMS. |
| By 2020 the BBC will have: |
| • a workforce at least as diverse, if not more so, than any other in the industry; |
| • met portrayal targets that cover a much wider range of diversity than any other broadcaster, with a bigger impact for audiences across a wider range of programmes; and |
| • hardwired diversity in what we do, making it something that everyone at the BBC understands and all those who make programmes for us supports. |
| Ten strategic equality and diversity objectives set out in strategy document |
| • <strong>Framework in place</strong> to support departmental actions. |
| • <strong>Diversity Action Plans</strong> (rolling 1 year plans) required of every Division |
| • <strong>Diversity champions</strong> sit on divisional boards and act as senior advocates to promote diversity within Divisions |
| • Each champion supported by a <strong>Divisional Diversity Action Group</strong> |
| • Examples of <strong>success measures</strong> communicated externally:, e.g.: |
| • Training provision |
| • Equality and Diversity as part of procurement process |
| • The BBC is now be under the closer scrutiny of Ofcom |
| • Collaboration with Channel 4 on joint research to understand the views of disabled audiences. |
| • Signatory of the Equalities Charter for Film. |
| • Member of the Creative Diversity Network forum |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Channel 4 – Clear policies and strategies. Evidenced practices and measures. Positioned as ‘hard-wired’ into the company’s remit to be experimental, innovative and distinctive.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Views diversity in its broadest sense, sometimes going beyond the requirements of the statutory equality duty. Areas focused on are:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Diversifying creative supply while building on the success of our innovative approach to on-screen diversity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Increasing the diversity of Channel 4 staff through programmes such as our Internship programme, Production Trainee Scheme, All Inclusive 4 events and our involvement in the Creative Diversity Network (CDN).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Using data captured by our audience research department to continue to inform, and help shape our thinking around diversity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Using our purchasing power to build and challenge our suppliers to share our diversity ambitions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evidence of practice</strong> (initiatives, performance metrics, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Clear information</strong> on company performance regarding the ‘protected characteristics of diversity (age, disability, gender, gender reassignment, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, and sexual orientation. Duty also covers marriage and civil partnerships).**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Provided <strong>significant volume of data as evidence</strong> (esp. workplace) to illustrate practices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Less evidence available for audience related diversity performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Additional information &amp; external acclaim</strong> (awards, external commentary, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Acclaimed for coverage of the 2013 Paralympic Games – positioned as an extension of the company’s commitment to diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Post-Paralympics research undertaken, with results made publicly available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Collaboration with BBC on joint research to understand the views of disabled audiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Signatory of the Equalities Charter for Film.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Member of the Creative Diversity Network forum</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ernst & Young
A global comparator
The EY D&I App available to all - Users can click to see scorecard

**Summary of company findings**

**EY** – a global benchmark Index score: 98% (I95/D100)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approach (policies and strategies)</th>
<th>Evidence of practice (initiatives, performance metrics, etc.)</th>
<th>Additional information &amp; external acclaim (awards, external commentary, etc.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **EY – HRM ‘How diversity and inclusiveness will drive EY’s growth’** | **Targets:**  
1. All promotion rates should be representative of the pool that they are coming from with immediate effect at all levels.  
2. The percentage of female new hires should increase by 5% (from current numbers) for all partners and executive directors.  
3. The percentage of female new hires should increase by 35% (from current numbers) for all senior managers.  
4. The percentage of female new hires should increase to 50% (from current numbers) for all managers, seniors and juniors. | • New Ways of Working (NWOW) and  
• Work Place of the Future (WOTF) |

Our ability to work effectively as a global organization and deliver exceptional service to our clients worldwide is fuelled by, and dependent on, our ability to embed diversity and inclusiveness into the way that we do business.

Clear set of objectives, a common purpose: -

- Establish a baseline and  
- cascade awareness  
- Identify meaningful changes  
- Recognize and reward role models

Source:-

Pilot study company profiles

These are confidential to the PMA report
any requests for access must be made to the PMA at:-
info@publicmediaalliance.org
Section 8: Annex

Reference materials available on request:-
peter@mediaops.net